

LESSON 13

Reported Statements with ὅτι or ὡς

13.1. Introduction

This Lesson deals with reported statements in the form of a Simple sentence and of the Main clause of a Complex sentence. The negative for these reported statements is regularly οὐ. (Subordinate clauses in reported discourse will be treated in Lesson 21.)

A statement may be reported indirectly after a verb of saying by means of a Subordinate clause introduced by ὅτι or ὡς. ὅτι is generally used after a positive leading verb. ὡς is likely to be used when the reported statement is open to doubt. ὅτι and ὡς are regularly used with λέγειν and εἶπεῖν, but rarely with φάναι (which normally takes an Infin. phrase; see Lesson 14).

13.2. Reported Statements in Primary Sequence

In Primary sequence, that is, after a verb of saying in Present or Future Time, the original Mood and Tense of direct speech are retained in the reported clause after ὅτι or ὡς. There may, however, be a change of person as in English idiom.

Directly reported statement: He says, '*I am* the king'.

Indirectly reported statement: He says that *he is* the king.

καὶ λέγουσιν ὅτι ἐπὶ τοῦτο ἔρχονται ... (X.Cyr. 1.2.6.)

And they say that they come for this purpose ...

Direct form: ἔρχονται, 'They come'; Present Indicative retained in reported form.

λέγει δ' ὡς ὑβριστής εἰμι καὶ βίαιος καὶ λίαν ἀσελγῶς διακείμενος ... (Lys. 24.15.)

And he says that I am insolent and violent and have a very outrageous attitude ...

Direct form: ὑβριστής ἐστὶ, ‘He is insolent’; change of person in reported form. Here, the speechwriter uses ὡς rather than ὅτι, since he does not want his client to appear to admit the allegations against him.

ἴσως δ’ Εὐθύνους ἐρεῖ..., ὅτι οὐκ ἂν ποτ’ ἀδικεῖν ἐπιχειρῶν τὰ μὲν δύο μέρη τῆς παρακαταθήκης ἀπέδωκε ... (Isoc. 21.16.)

But perhaps Euthynus will say ..., that, if attempting to do wrong, he would not ever have paid back two-thirds of the deposit ...

Direct form: οὐκ ἂν ποτ’ ... ἀπέδωκα, ‘I would not ever ... have paid back’; Past Aorist Indicative with ἂν retained; change of person.

ἴσως οὖν εἴποιεν ἂν πολλοὶ τῶν φασκόντων φιλοσοφεῖν, ὅτι οὐκ ἂν ποτε ὁ δίκαιος ἄδικος γένοιτο ... (X.Mem. 1.2.19.)

Perhaps, therefore, many of those who claim to be philosophers would say, that the just <man> would not ever become unjust ...

Direct form: οὐκ ἂν ποτε ὁ δίκαιος ἄδικος γένοιτο, ‘the just man would not ever become unjust’; Optative retained.

13.3. Reported Statements in Past Sequence

In Past sequence, that is, after a verb of saying in Past Time:

- Primary and Past Aorist Tenses of the Indicative are changed to the same Aspect of the Optative
- Past Aorist Indicative with ἂν denoting potentiality is retained
- Past Imperfect and Past Perfect Indicatives are usually retained
- all Optatives are retained.

εἶπον αὐτοῖς ὅτι νομίζοιμι μὲν διὰ τὸ πρᾶγμα Εὐφίλητον πονηρὸν εἶναι ... (And. 1.64.)

I told them that I thought that Euphiletus was wicked because of the action ...

Direct form: νομίζω, ‘I think’; Imperfect Aspect is retained in reported form.

ἔλεξαν γὰρ ὡς ἐγὼ μηνύσαιμι περὶ τῶν μυστηρίων ... (And. 1.19.)
For they said that I had lodged information concerning the mysteries ...

Direct form: ἐμήνυσε, 'He lodged information'; Aorist Aspect is retained in reported form, with change of person. Here, Andocides uses ὥς, since he does not admit the allegation.

ἐπιλέγων δὲ τὸν λόγον τόνδε ταῦτα ἐνετέλλετο, ὥς, εἰ μὲν ἀπώλοντο οἱ κατάσκοποι, οὔτ' ἂν τὰ ἑωυτοῦ πρήγματα προεπίθοντο οἱ Ἕλληνες ἔοντα λόγου μέζω, οὔτ' ἂν τι τοὺς πολεμίους μέγα ἐσίαντο ἄνδρας τρεῖς ἀπολέσαντες· (Hdt. 7.147.1.)

And he was giving this command while explaining that, if the scouts had perished, neither would the Greeks have learnt in advance that his own importance was greater than common report, nor would they [= Persians] have done any great harm to their enemy by destroying three men.

Past Aorist Indicative with ἄν retained in reported form. The use of ὥς may be influenced by the potential nature of the expression.

ἐλθὼν δὲ ... ἐς τὴν Λακεδαίμονα, ἣν κατηγορήσωσιν οἱ περὶ τὸν Ἴσχαγόραν ὅτι οὐκ ἐπίθετο, ... ἐπειδὴ εὖρε κατειλημμένους, ... κατὰ τάχος ἐπορεύετο. (Th. 5.21.3.)

And coming ... to Sparta, in case the followers of Ischagoras made an accusation that he had not been obedient, ... when he found that they [= Spartans] had been bound <by the agreement>, ... he moved on with haste.

Direct form: οὐκ ἐπίθετο, 'He was not obedient'; Past Imperfect Indicative is retained in reported form.

Although the Past Imperfect Indicative of direct speech is usually retained in reported speech after ὅτι or ὥς, the Imperfect Optative does sometimes occur where the context is clear.

ἐπεὶ δὲ ἐψηφίσαντο αὐτῷ τὴν ἄδειαν, ἔλεγεν ὅτι ἐν τῇ οἰκίᾳ Πουλυτίωνος γίγνοιτο μυστήρια· (And. 1.12.)

And when they had voted immunity to him, he said that mysteries had been celebrated in the house of Poulytion.

In the context, it is clear that the speaker (in court) did not mean that mysteries were *currently* being celebrated, but that they had *previously* been (being) celebrated. Thus, the Imperfect Optative can be used without ambiguity.

κατέκλησαν δὲ τοῦ αὐτοῦ χειμῶνος καὶ Μακεδόνας Ἀθηναῖοι, Περδίκκα ἐπικαλοῦντες ... ὅτι ... ἔψευστο τὴν ξυμμαχίαν ... (Th. 5.83.4.)

And within the same winter the Athenians also blockaded the Macedonians, bringing an accusation against Perdikkas ..., that ... he had cheated the alliance ...

Original Past Perfect Indicative is retained in the reported form.

Εὐρυβιάδης δὲ τὴν ἐναντίην ταύτη γνώμην ἐτίθετο, λέγων ὡς, εἰ λύσουσι τὰς σχεδίας, τοῦτ' ἂν μέγιστον πάντων σφείς κακὸν τὴν Ἑλλάδα ἐργασαίετο. (Hdt. 8.108.2.)

But Eurybiades put forward the opinion opposite to this one, saying that, if they disconnected the pontoons, they would thereby wreak the greatest trouble of all upon Greece.

Direct form: εἰ λύσομεν τὰς σχεδίας, τοῦτ' ἂν μέγιστον πάντων ἡμεῖς κακὸν Ἑλλάδα ἐργασαίμεθα, 'If we [shall] disconnect the pontoons, we would thereby wreak ...' (Mixed Fut. Open, Fut. Unfulfilled Condition). Original potential Optative with ἂν is retained. τοῦτ(ο) is strictly direct Object, and μέγιστον ... κακὸν Predict Accusative ἐργασαίετο = ἐργάσαιντο (3rd pers. pl.).

13.4. Vivid Construction

The Optative Mood in Past sequence in reported statements is just beginning to be used in Aeschylus (earlier fifth century BCE). By the time of the late fifth to early fourth century BCE, usage still depends on the preference of the writer. Thus, Thucydides more often than not uses the Vivid construction, retaining the Mood and Tense of the direct form of speech. But the orators and Plato and Xenophon prefer the Optative. Both constructions may even occur within the same sentence written by the same author.

οὗτοι ἔλεγον ὅτι Κῦρος μὲν τέθνηκεν, Ἀριαῖος δὲ πεφευγὼς ἐν τῷ σταθμῷ εἶη μετὰ τῶν ἄλλων βαρβάρων ὅθεν τῇ προτεραίᾳ ὄρμητο ... (X.An. 2.1.3.)

These <men> said that Cyrus had died, but that Ariaeus having fled was with the rest of the natives at the stopping-point from where they had set out on the previous day ...

Direct form: Κῦρος μὲν τέθνηκεν, Ἀριαίος δὲ ... ἐν τῷ σταθμῷ ἐστὶ ... ὅθεν ὠρμήμεθα. ‘Cyrus has died, but Ariaeus ... is at the stopping-point ... from where we had set out ...’. In Xenophon’s actual form, the original Mood and Tense has been retained in τέθνηκεν (Vivid); Optative has been used in εἴη (normal Past sequence); and Past Perfect Indicative has been retained in ὠρμήμεθα (the usual Vivid construction for this Mood and Tense).

References

Goodwin (1889), *Syntax of the moods and tenses of the Greek verb*, §§662–676, 681.

Smyth (1956), *Greek grammar*, §§2574–2600, 2613–2615, 2623.

EXERCISE 13

Translate the following passages.

- ὡσπερ δὲ καὶ προεῖπον ὑμῖν, ὧ ἄνδρες, ἐξ ἀρχῆς περὶ πάντων ποιήσομαι τὴν ἀπολογίαν, ... περὶ τῶν μυστηρίων ὡς οὐτ’ ἐμοὶ ἠσέβηται οὐδὲν οὔτε μεμήνυται οὔθ’ ὠμολόγηται ...

προειπεῖν (Aor.)	<i>to mention previously</i> (here 1st pers. sg.)
ἀσεβεῖν	<i>to commit impiety</i>
μηνύειν	<i>to lay information</i>
ὁμολογεῖν	<i>to make a confession</i>

The last three verbs are used impersonally in the Passive here.

- διὰ ταῦτα εἶπον τῇ βουλῇ ὅτι εἰδείην τοὺς ποιήσαντας, καὶ ἐξέδειξα τὰ γενόμενα, ὅτι εἰσηγήσατο μὲν ... ταύτην τὴν βουλήν Εὐφίλητος, ἀντείπον δὲ ἐγώ ...

βουλή, -ῆς, ἡ	<i>council</i> (1st instance); <i>plan</i> (2nd instance)
ἐκδεικνύναι	<i>to reveal</i>
εἰσηγεῖσθαι	<i>to introduce</i>

3. ἐπειδὴ δὲ ταῦτα ἐγένετο, Πείσανδρος καὶ Χαρικλῆς ... ἔλεγον ὡς εἶη τὰ ἔργα τὰ γεγενημένα οὐκ ὀλίγων ἀνδρῶν ἀλλ' ἐπὶ τῇ τοῦ δήμου καταλύσει ...

δῆμος, -ου, ὁ	<i>democracy</i>
κατάλυσις, -εως, ἡ	<i>dissolution, overthrow</i>

4. ... ὁ Κῦρος εἰσκομίσας τὰ θηρία ... ἔλεγεν ὅτι αὐτὸς ταῦτα θηράσειεν ...

εἰσκομίζειν	<i>to carry in</i>
θηρίον, -ου, τό	<i>(wild) animal</i>
θηρᾶν	<i>to hunt</i>

5. ἐν ᾧ δὲ ὠπλίζοντο, ἦκον λέγοντες οἱ προπεμφθέντες σκοποὶ ὅτι οὐχ ἵππεῖς εἶεν, ἀλλ' ὑποζύγια νέμοιτο.

ἐν ᾧ (χρόνῳ)	<i>in which (time) (i.e. while)</i>
ὑποζύγιον, -ου, τό	<i>pack-animal</i>
νέμειν	<i>(Mid., of animals) to feed, to graze (Intr.)</i>

6. And he went there and said, that he was a freeman and a Milesian by birth, and [that] Pasion had sent him there to explain about the money.

<i>And he</i>	ὅς (coordinating relative pronoun)
<i>free(man)</i>	ἐλεύθερος, -ου (masc. adj.)
<i>Milesian</i>	Μιλήσιος, -α, -ον
<i>birth</i>	γένος, -ους, τό (Use Acc. of Respect)
<i>Pasion</i>	Πασίων, -ωνος, ὁ
<i>to send there</i>	εἰσπέμπειν
<i>to explain</i>	διδάσκειν (Use Intensive/'Fut.' Partc.)
<i>money</i>	χρήματα, -ων, τὰ

This text is taken from *Intermediate Ancient Greek Language*,
by Darryl Palmer, published 2021 by ANU Press, The Australian
National University, Canberra, Australia.