Disciplining Interdisciplinarity
Integration and Implementation Sciences for Researching Complex Real-World Problems
Disciplining Interdisciplinarity
Integration and Implementation Sciences for Researching Complex Real-World Problems

Gabriele Bammer

With 24 Commentaries by

Simon Bronitt; L. David Brown; Marcel Bursztyn and Maria Beatriz Maury; Lawrence Cram; Ian Elsum; Holly J. Falk-Krzesinski; Fasihuddin; Howard Gadlin and L. Michelle Bennett; Budi Haryanto; Julie Thompson Klein; Ted Lefroy; Catherine Lyall; M. Duane Nellis; Linda Neuhauser; Deborah O’Connell with Damien Farine, Michael O’Connor and Michael Dunlop; Michael O’Rourke; Christian Pohl; Merritt Polk; Alison Ritter; Alice Roughley; Michael Smithson; Daniel Walker; Michael Wesley; Glenn Withers
Contents

Guide to Commentaries by Author (alphabetical) ............... xi
Preface ................................................................. xv

Setting the Scene
1. The Challenge and a New Approach .......................... 3
   Taking a Specific Focus: Looking at one type of interdisciplinarity;
   Defining a New Research Style: Integrative applied research;
   Developing a Disciplinary Underpinning: Integration and
   Implementation Sciences (I2S); Responding to the Scale and Urgency
   of the Task: The I2S Development Drive; The Aims of this Book
2. Getting Specific: Three domains, a five-question framework and
   the overall approach ......................................... 15
   Three Domains; Definitions; Fleshing Out the Three Domains:
   The five-question framework; I2S as a Storehouse; The Structure
   of the Book; Commentaries and Audiences

Domain 1. Synthesising Disciplinary and Stakeholder Knowledge
3. Introduction ....................................................... 29
4. For What and for Whom? ....................................... 33
5. Which Knowledge? ............................................... 35
   Taking a Systems View; Scoping; Boundary Setting; Framing;
   Dealing with Values; Harnessing and Managing Differences;
   Dealing with the Six Categories
6. How? .................................................................. 45
   Dialogue-Based Synthesis; Model-, Product- and Vision-Based
   Synthesis; Common Metric-Based Synthesis; Who Undertakes the
   Synthesis?; When is the Synthesis Undertaken?
7. Context? ............................................................. 51
   Overall Context; Authorisation; Organisational Facilitators and
   Barriers
8. Outcome? .......................................................... 55
Domain 2. Understanding and Managing Diverse Unknowns

10. Introduction .................................................. 63
   *The Inevitability and Challenges of Imperfection; Appreciating Different Kinds of Unknowns; Understanding Where Disciplines and Stakeholders Sit in Relation to Unknowns; Differentiating the First and Second Domains*

11. For What and for Whom? .................................. 77
12. Which Unknowns? ............................................ 79
   *Taking a Systems View; Scoping; Boundary Setting; Framing; Dealing with Values; Harnessing and Managing Differences; Dealing with the Six Categories*

13. How? .............................................................. 85
   *Reduction; Banishment; Acceptance; Surrender, Exploitation; Denial; Complexities in Managing Unknowns; Who Undertakes the Consideration of Unknowns?; When is the Consideration of Unknowns Undertaken?*

14. Context? ....................................................... 95
   *Overall Context; Authorisation; Organisational Facilitators and Barriers*

15. Outcome? ....................................................... 99
16. Specialising in I2S ......................................... 101
   *I2S for Team Leaders; I2S Disciplinary Specialists; I2S Appreciation for Other Integrative Applied Research Team Members*

Domain 3. Providing Integrated Research Support for Policy and Practice Change

17. Introduction .................................................. 107
18. For What and for Whom? .................................. 111
19. Which Aspects of Policy and Practice? ................... 113
   *Taking a Systems View; Scoping; Boundary Setting; Framing; Dealing with Values; Harnessing and Managing Differences; Dealing with the Six Categories*
20. How? ................................................................. 125
   Communication; Advocacy; Engagement; Fresh Thinking on
   Complex Real-World Problems; Who is Involved in the Provision of
   Integrated Research Support?; When Does Provision of Integrated
   Research Support Occur?

21. Context? .............................................................. 137
   Overall Context; Authorisation; Organisational Facilitators and
   Barriers

22. Outcome? .............................................................. 141

23. Specialising in I2S ...................................................... 145
   I2S for Team Leaders; I2S Disciplinary Specialists; I2S Appreciation
   for Other Integrative Applied Research Team Members; I2S
   Appreciation for Policy Makers and Practitioners

I2S As A Whole

24. Introduction .......................................................... 153

25. For What and for Whom? .............................................. 157

26. Which Knowledge, Unknowns and Aspects of Policy and Practice? 159
   Taking a Systems View; Scoping; Boundary Setting; Framing;
   Taking Values into Account; Harnessing and Managing Differences;
   Dealing with the Six Categories

27. How? ................................................................. 169
   Value of Some Methods for More Than One Domain; Achieving
   Congruence between the Methods Used Across the Three Domains;
   Classification Using Reciprocity and Action-Orientation; By Whom
   and When?

28. Context? .............................................................. 173
   Overall Context; Authorisation; Organisational Facilitators and
   Barriers

29. Outcome? .............................................................. 181
   Peer Review; Necessary Conditions for Integrative Applied
   Research; Challenge of Imperfection; Summary of Questions to
   Guide Evaluation

30. Specialising in I2S ...................................................... 189
   I2S for Team Leaders; I2S Disciplinary Specialists; I2S Appreciation
   for Other Integrative Applied Research Team Members; I2S
   Appreciation for Policy Makers and Practitioners
Moving Forward

31. A View of the Future .............................................. 199
   A Virtuous Cycle between Capacity, Demonstrated Success and Funding

32. How I2S Functions as a Discipline .............................. 207
   Enhancing the Discipline by Working on Problems; Transmitting Findings; Fostering Widespread Awareness and Appreciating Different Levels of Expertise; Building Capacity

33. The Relationship of Integrative Applied Research and I2S to Multidisciplinarity and Transdisciplinarity .......................... 213
   Multidisciplinary and Transdisciplinary Research; Enhancements that I2S Can Provide; Hybrid Approaches

34. The Scope and Feasibility of the I2S Development Drive .......... 221
   Scope; Establishing Proof-of-Concept; Countervailing Forces; Implications of Imperfection for I2S and the I2S Development Drive

References ................................................................. 243

Commentaries

35. Rationale and Key Themes ........................................... 259
   Keeping I2S Grounded in Research Practice; The Challenges of Providing Integrated Research Support for Policy and Practice Change; I2S as a Discipline and the Need for a Stronger Theoretical Base; Institutional Factors; Moving the I2S Development Drive Forward

36. An I2S Discipline: Legitimate, viable, useful? .................... 279
   Daniel Walker

37. Integration and Implementation Research: Would CSIRO contribute to, and benefit from, a more formalised I2S approach? ........ 285
   Deborah O’Connell, with Damien Farine, Michael O’Connor and Michael Dunlop

38. I2S: Prescriptive, descriptive or both? ............................. 303
   Michael Smithson

39. I2S Needs Theory as Well as a Toolkit ............................. 313
   Alison Ritter

40. Implementing Integration in Research and Practice ................ 319
   Alice Roughley
41. Building I2S into an Academic Program .......................... 325
   Lawrence Cram

42. The Institutional Challenges of Changing the Academic Landscape... 333
   Catherine Lyall

43. The Brazilian Experience with Institutional Arrangements for
   Interdisciplinary Graduate Programs: I2S may provide a way
   forward ................................................................. 343
   Marcel Bursztyn and Maria Beatriz Maury

44. Building Integration and Implementation Sciences: Five areas
   for development .................................................... 349
   L. David Brown

45. From the Classroom to the Field: Reflections from a Pakistani
   law-enforcement perspective ........................................ 355
   Fasihuddin

46. Moving Competitive Integrated Science Forward: A US land
   grant research university perspective ............................. 359
   M. Duane Nellis

47. Interdisciplinary Research is about People as well as Concepts
   and Methods ........................................................... 365
   Ted Lefroy

48. Creating the New University ........................................ 375
   Glenn Withers

49. Beyond ‘Dialogues of the Deaf’: Re-imagining policing and
   security research for policy and practice .......................... 381
   Simon Bronitt

50. Applying the I2S Framework to Air Pollution and Health in
   Indonesia ............................................................... 389
   Budi Haryanto

51. Integration and Implementation in Action at Mistra-Urban Futures:
   A transdisciplinary centre for sustainable urban development... 397
   Merritt Polk

52. Philosophy as a Theoretical Foundation for I2S .................... 407
   Michael O’Rourke

53. Interdisciplinarity without Borders ............................... 417
   Howard Gadlin and L. Michelle Bennett
54. When the Network Becomes the Platform. . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 427
   Julie Thompson Klein

55. Tackling Integrative Applied Research: Lessons from the
   management of innovation . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 431
   Ian Elsum

56. The Fourth Frontier . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 441
   Michael Wesley

57. How Theory Can Help Set Priorities for the I2S Development Drive . . . . . 447
   Christian Pohl

58. I2S and Research Development Professionals: Time to develop
   a mutually advantageous relationship . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 455
   Holly J. Falk-Krzesinski

59. Integration and Implementation Sciences: How it relates to
   scientific thinking and public health strategies . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 461
   Linda Neuhauser