

# **Disciplining Interdisciplinarity**

Integration and Implementation Sciences for  
Researching Complex Real-World Problems



# **Disciplining Interdisciplinarity**

Integration and Implementation Sciences for  
Researching Complex Real-World Problems

**Gabriele Bammer**

*With 24 Commentaries by*

Simon Bronitt; L. David Brown; Marcel Bursztyn and Maria Beatriz Maury;  
Lawrence Cram; Ian Elsum; Holly J. Falk-Krzesinski; Fasihuddin; Howard Gadlin and  
L. Michelle Bennett; Budi Haryanto; Julie Thompson Klein; Ted Lefroy; Catherine Lyall;  
M. Duane Nellis; Linda Neuhauser; Deborah O'Connell with Damien Farine,  
Michael O'Connor and Michael Dunlop; Michael O'Rourke; Christian Pohl; Merritt Polk;  
Alison Ritter; Alice Roughley; Michael Smithson; Daniel Walker; Michael Wesley;  
Glenn Withers



Australian  
National  
University

---

**E PRESS**



Published by ANU E Press  
The Australian National University  
Canberra ACT 0200, Australia  
Email: [anuepress@anu.edu.au](mailto:anuepress@anu.edu.au)  
This title is also available online at <http://epress.anu.edu.au>

---

National Library of Australia Cataloguing-in-Publication entry

Author: Bammer, Gabriele

Title: Disciplining interdisciplinarity : integration and implementation sciences for researching complex real-world problems / Gabriele Bammer.

ISBN: 9781922144270 (pbk.) 9781922144287 (ebook)

Notes: Includes bibliographical references.

Subjects: Social sciences--Methodology.  
Science--Methodology.  
Applied sociology.  
Social problems.

Dewey Number: 300.72

---

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Cover design and layout by ANU E Press

Printed by Griffin Press

This edition © 2013 ANU E Press

# Contents

Guide to Commentaries by Author (alphabetical) . . . . .	xi
Preface . . . . .	xv

---

## Setting the Scene

1. The Challenge and a New Approach . . . . .	3
<i>Taking a Specific Focus: Looking at one type of interdisciplinarity; Defining a New Research Style: Integrative applied research; Developing a Disciplinary Underpinning: Integration and Implementation Sciences (I2S); Responding to the Scale and Urgency of the Task: The I2S Development Drive; The Aims of this Book</i>	
2. Getting Specific: Three domains, a five-question framework and the overall approach . . . . .	15
<i>Three Domains; Definitions; Fleshing Out the Three Domains: The five-question framework; I2S as a Storehouse; The Structure of the Book; Commentaries and Audiences</i>	

---

## Domain 1. Synthesising Disciplinary and Stakeholder Knowledge

3. Introduction . . . . .	29
4. For What and for Whom? . . . . .	33
5. Which Knowledge? . . . . .	35
<i>Taking a Systems View; Scoping; Boundary Setting; Framing; Dealing with Values; Harnessing and Managing Differences; Dealing with the Six Categories</i>	
6. How? . . . . .	45
<i>Dialogue-Based Synthesis; Model-, Product- and Vision-Based Synthesis; Common Metric-Based Synthesis; Who Undertakes the Synthesis?; When is the Synthesis Undertaken?</i>	
7. Context? . . . . .	51
<i>Overall Context; Authorisation; Organisational Facilitators and Barriers</i>	
8. Outcome? . . . . .	55

9. Specialising in I2S . . . . .	57
<i>I2S for Team Leaders; I2S Disciplinary Specialists; I2S Appreciation for Other Integrative Applied Research Team Members</i>	

---

**Domain 2. Understanding and Managing Diverse Unknowns**

10. Introduction . . . . .	63
<i>The Inevitability and Challenges of Imperfection; Appreciating Different Kinds of Unknowns; Understanding Where Disciplines and Stakeholders Sit in Relation to Unknowns; Differentiating the First and Second Domains</i>	
11. For What and for Whom? . . . . .	77
12. Which Unknowns? . . . . .	79
<i>Taking a Systems View; Scoping; Boundary Setting; Framing; Dealing with Values; Harnessing and Managing Differences; Dealing with the Six Categories</i>	
13. How? . . . . .	85
<i>Reduction; Banishment; Acceptance; Surrender, Exploitation; Denial; Complexities in Managing Unknowns; Who Undertakes the Consideration of Unknowns?; When is the Consideration of Unknowns Undertaken?</i>	
14. Context? . . . . .	95
<i>Overall Context; Authorisation; Organisational Facilitators and Barriers</i>	
15. Outcome? . . . . .	99
16. Specialising in I2S . . . . .	101
<i>I2S for Team Leaders; I2S Disciplinary Specialists; I2S Appreciation for Other Integrative Applied Research Team Members</i>	

---

**Domain 3. Providing Integrated Research Support for Policy and Practice Change**

17. Introduction . . . . .	107
18. For What and for Whom? . . . . .	111
19. Which Aspects of Policy and Practice? . . . . .	113
<i>Taking a Systems View; Scoping; Boundary Setting; Framing; Dealing with Values; Harnessing and Managing Differences; Dealing with the Six Categories</i>	

20. How? . . . . .	125
<i>Communication; Advocacy; Engagement; Fresh Thinking on Complex Real-World Problems; Who is Involved in the Provision of Integrated Research Support?; When Does Provision of Integrated Research Support Occur?</i>	
21. Context? . . . . .	137
<i>Overall Context; Authorisation; Organisational Facilitators and Barriers</i>	
22. Outcome? . . . . .	141
23. Specialising in I2S . . . . .	145
<i>I2S for Team Leaders; I2S Disciplinary Specialists; I2S Appreciation for Other Integrative Applied Research Team Members; I2S Appreciation for Policy Makers and Practitioners</i>	

---

**I2S As A Whole**

24. Introduction . . . . .	153
25. For What and for Whom? . . . . .	157
26. Which Knowledge, Unknowns and Aspects of Policy and Practice? . . . . .	159
<i>Taking a Systems View; Scoping; Boundary Setting; Framing; Taking Values into Account; Harnessing and Managing Differences; Dealing with the Six Categories</i>	
27. How? . . . . .	169
<i>Value of Some Methods for More Than One Domain; Achieving Congruence between the Methods Used Across the Three Domains; Classification Using Reciprocity and Action-Oriented; By Whom and When?</i>	
28. Context? . . . . .	173
<i>Overall Context; Authorisation; Organisational Facilitators and Barriers</i>	
29. Outcome? . . . . .	181
<i>Peer Review; Necessary Conditions for Integrative Applied Research; Challenge of Imperfection; Summary of Questions to Guide Evaluation</i>	
30. Specialising in I2S . . . . .	189
<i>I2S for Team Leaders; I2S Disciplinary Specialists; I2S Appreciation for Other Integrative Applied Research Team Members; I2S Appreciation for Policy Makers and Practitioners</i>	

---

## Moving Forward

31. A View of the Future . . . . . 199  
*A Virtuous Cycle between Capacity, Demonstrated Success and Funding*
32. How I2S Functions as a Discipline . . . . . 207  
*Enhancing the Discipline by Working on Problems; Transmitting Findings; Fostering Widespread Awareness and Appreciating Different Levels of Expertise; Building Capacity*
33. The Relationship of Integrative Applied Research and I2S to Multidisciplinarity and Transdisciplinarity . . . . . 213  
*Multidisciplinary and Transdisciplinary Research; Enhancements that I2S Can Provide; Hybrid Approaches*
34. The Scope and Feasibility of the I2S Development Drive. . . . . 221  
*Scope; Establishing Proof-of-Concept; Countervailing Forces; Implications of Imperfection for I2S and the I2S Development Drive*
- 
- References . . . . . 243

## Commentaries

35. Rationale and Key Themes . . . . . 259  
*Keeping I2S Grounded in Research Practice; The Challenges of Providing Integrated Research Support for Policy and Practice Change; I2S as a Discipline and the Need for a Stronger Theoretical Base; Institutional Factors; Moving the I2S Development Drive Forward*
36. An I2S Discipline: Legitimate, viable, useful? . . . . . 279  
*Daniel Walker*
37. Integration and Implementation Research: Would CSIRO contribute to, and benefit from, a more formalised I2S approach? . . . . 285  
*Deborah O’Connell, with Damien Farine, Michael O’Connor and Michael Dunlop*
38. I2S: Prescriptive, descriptive or both? . . . . . 303  
*Michael Smithson*
39. I2S Needs Theory as Well as a Toolkit . . . . . 313  
*Alison Ritter*
40. Implementing Integration in Research and Practice. . . . . 319  
*Alice Roughley*



41. Building I2S into an Academic Program . . . . .	325
<i>Lawrence Cram</i>	
42. The Institutional Challenges of Changing the Academic Landscape. . . . .	333
<i>Catherine Lyall</i>	
43. The Brazilian Experience with Institutional Arrangements for Interdisciplinary Graduate Programs: I2S may provide a way forward . . . . .	343
<i>Marcel Bursztyrn and Maria Beatriz Maury</i>	
44. Building Integration and Implementation Sciences: Five areas for development . . . . .	349
<i>L. David Brown</i>	
45. From the Classroom to the Field: Reflections from a Pakistani law-enforcement perspective. . . . .	355
<i>Fasihuddin</i>	
46. Moving Competitive Integrated Science Forward: A US land grant research university perspective . . . . .	359
<i>M. Duane Nellis</i>	
47. Interdisciplinary Research is about People as well as Concepts and Methods. . . . .	365
<i>Ted Lefroy</i>	
48. Creating the New University . . . . .	375
<i>Glenn Withers</i>	
49. Beyond ‘Dialogues of the Deaf’: Re-imagining policing and security research for policy and practice. . . . .	381
<i>Simon Bronitt</i>	
50. Applying the I2S Framework to Air Pollution and Health in Indonesia . . . . .	389
<i>Budi Haryanto</i>	
51. Integration and Implementation in Action at Mistra-Urban Futures: A transdisciplinary centre for sustainable urban development. . . . .	397
<i>Merritt Polk</i>	
52. Philosophy as a Theoretical Foundation for I2S . . . . .	407
<i>Michael O’Rourke</i>	
53. Interdisciplinarity without Borders . . . . .	417
<i>Howard Gadlin and L. Michelle Bennett</i>	

54. When the Network Becomes the Platform. . . . .	427
<i>Julie Thompson Klein</i>	
55. Tackling Integrative Applied Research: Lessons from the management of innovation . . . . .	431
<i>Ian Elsum</i>	
56. The Fourth Frontier . . . . .	441
<i>Michael Wesley</i>	
57. How Theory Can Help Set Priorities for the I2S Development Drive . . .	447
<i>Christian Pohl</i>	
58. I2S and Research Development Professionals: Time to develop a mutually advantageous relationship . . . . .	455
<i>Holly J. Falk-Krzesinski</i>	
59. Integration and Implementation Sciences: How it relates to scientific thinking and public health strategies . . . . .	461
<i>Linda Neuhauser</i>	