

## Chapter 3. 'Properties' as a guide to salvation

The subject of this and the following chapter is a suggested way of reconstructing early perceptions of Bartholomew's work during the first phase of its life story. They can only be suggestions as we have no hard evidence for earliest readers' responses to the text, but our understanding of the medieval use of allegory can alert us to the need to look beneath the surface at both things and their properties as Bartholomew presents them.

Bartholomew summarises the contents of each Book in his preface.<sup>1</sup> The categories seem, on the face of it, clear and well-defined, leading modern readers to expect the kind of ordered and objective descriptions of things consistent with modern expository texts. These are not forthcoming, however, and commentators have expressed bafflement at Bartholomew's failure to keep to his stated categories in a rational manner. Léopold Delisle, for one, had referred in the 1880s to 'le désordre qui règne dans le *Proprietatibus rerum*'.<sup>2</sup> The following passage expresses a twentieth-century English researcher's frustration at the apparent incompatibility of chapter arrangements with the 'system' Bartholomew predicts in the *Praefatio*:

This excellent system, which should be compared with those of contemporary encyclopedias, keeps Bartholomew from gross lapses into incoherence; but within its framework some faults of arrangement are apparent. Repetition is a common failure ... a more careful revision would have decreased the length of the book by eliminating duplications [such as the two chapters on bees] ... In Book XVIII the animals are not classed under species, but alphabetically, with their young distinguished separately; so that 'De bove' ... occurs at chapter xiii, 'De tauro' at chapter c ... Even more oddly, 'De cornu', of the horn, 'De ficario', of the seller of figs, and 'De bubulco', of the oxherd, occur among the animals. Birds and insects are classed together in Book XII, and reptiles with animals in Book XVIII; but their eggs receive consideration in Book XIX, among the assortment of objects which could not be fitted in elsewhere.<sup>3</sup>

Elizabeth Brockhurst was a pioneer of 'Properties' studies in England, and her thesis was seminal in that it drew the attention of post-war English historians to Bartholomew and his compilation within an English manuscript tradition. I quote the above in order to emphasise the contrast with the approach taken in this chapter, which seeks to explain the work's organisation and content as appropriate for its own time and purpose. Although the work's allegorical

nature has been acknowledged and discussed in recent years in several languages it still remains to describe Bartholomew's 'excellent system' in terms of his own day and readership, in English, and to incorporate Book 19 into the explanatory framework.

I propose that in Bartholomew's work moral and religious themes serve to link and underpin apparent confusion on the surface. These themes are appropriate to religious instruction: the positive aspects of spreading the Word; the passage of our lives and the need for submission to authority, and other virtues; the rewards of serving God; ways towards salvation. While making use of conventional models of piety and service, Bartholomew also expresses Franciscan philosophy and aims: in his attitude to the natural world and the role of the senses, and his evocation of an apostolic, non-enclosed form of religious work.

## Foragers and gleaners

Brockhurst's concern over the duplication of chapters on bees provides a starting point from which to examine this apparent anomaly from a thirteenth-century clerical point of view. The image of the bee has an important unifying role in the work as a whole, and Bartholomew's attention to it is significant for our understanding of the work. In the first place, they were ubiquitous domestic creatures with an important economic role in lay community and monastery.<sup>4</sup> Debra Hassig notes in her study of twelfth-century English bestiary manuscripts that in medieval England 'every monastery and abbey had its own apiary, and many of the peasants who worked or rented Church lands also kept bees in order to pay part of their yearly rent in wax'.<sup>5</sup>

Buzzing about the meadows and vineyards, communally producing honey and wax for the careful apiarist, the bee is palpably an orderly, useful creature within a disciplined community of its own. Hassig finds that the communal bee could serve in the Middle Ages as an ideal type of civic order and usefulness, capable of extension into a range of associated ideas. The bestiary texts and illustrations emphasise the bee's associations of orderliness, organisation and a fair division of labour, while the communal ideal represented by the beehive describes a monastic situation of freedom in Christ under the lordship of the abbot, collecting the honey from flowers identified as the love of God. Bees as tractable producers of real honey and church candle-wax readily connoted an ideal of moral and civic order and *utilitas*, while their apparent sexlessness also signified chastity and the Virgin Mary.<sup>6</sup> Ivan Illich, in his study of Hugh of St Victor's treatise on monastic reading, *Didascalicon* (c.1128), states that 'since Christian antiquity, metaphors for spiritual experiences taken from the language of bee-keeping appear whenever new communities of monks grow out of old hermitages'.<sup>7</sup> Michael Twomey lists among the major encyclopaedias of the Middle Ages *Bonum*

*universale de apibus*, 'the definitive medieval study of bees, which develops an extended allegory of spiritual authority'.<sup>8</sup>

According to Neil Hathaway, these major encyclopaedias are themselves justified in the very etymology of the term *compilatio*, which derives from *pilare*, 'to pillage'. Hathaway points out that Macrobius had expressed the idea of the moral usefulness of abstracting from others' works through an analogy with bees, nectar-gathering from others' fields: 'We should in a way imitate the bees which ... pluck the flowers, and then whatever they are wont to bring back they divide up into the honeycomb, changing the varied liquor into one flavor by a certain mixture.' Here then are bees serving an allegorical and didactic purpose early in the medieval period. Hathaway argues that the analogy shed its pejorative associations with stealing as Christian writers, notably St Jerome, made use of it.<sup>9</sup> Hathaway's study indicates that by Bartholomew's time compilation was acknowledged as a useful didactic method that brought together, and made available, nourishing and palatable teachings already in existence.

## Fertility and growth

The metaphor of nectar-gathering implies fertility and florescence, and opens pathways for medieval writers and readers into a broader moralised landscape of fields, ploughlands and vineyards and associated activities expressing the aims and nature of clerical endeavour: 'the Lord is to be praised', writes Gregory IX in 1233, 'for in this the eleventh hour He has led the Friars Preachers and Minors into His vineyard' to root out heresy. It is an extended metaphor that embraces realities of medieval economy in northern Europe, as well as scriptural parables such as that of the workers in the Lord's vineyard, and the parable of the sower.<sup>10</sup> As Elizabeth Freeman has demonstrated, it was possible for the Cistercian writer Hugh of Kirkstall, a daughter house of Fountains Abbey in England, to celebrate the success of Fountains Abbey using this complex metaphor drawn from writings of Bernard of Clairvaux, founder of his Order. Hugh, a near-contemporary of Bartholomew, wrote the following passage sometime between 1205 and 1226. The image is of vines, bees, seeds, harvest and procreation to signal the Cistercian Order's growth, industry, and success:

Thus Newminster took its origin. This was the first shoot which our vine put forth; this was the first swarm which went out from our hive. The holy seed sprouted in the soil and, being cast as it were in the lap of fertile earth, grew to a great plant, and from a few grains there sprang a plentiful harvest. This newly founded monastery rivalled her mother in fertility. She conceived and brought forth three daughters, Pipewell, Sawley and Roche.<sup>11</sup>

The above quotation shows a writer combining well-understood metaphors of fertility to express the evangelising aims of the Cistercians in Bartholomew's

time, but it also demonstrates an understood precedent that existed for scholars, whether mendicant or monastic, to use imagery of the vine, the beehive, the seed, the gleaner, the cultivation of fertile ground and of female fertility to denote the active work of spreading God's word, nurturing Christian souls and obtaining the rewards of salvation. Francis of Assisi had in some senses been a follower of Bernard, and Bartholomew testifies early on to the latter's importance as an authority.<sup>12</sup>

## The properties of bees

In 'Properties' Bartholomew cites *Physiologus* and other sources in his two main chapters on the bee, but numerous brief mentions of it in other chapters serve to carry forward and remind us of Bartholomew's main teaching themes: those of authority, discipline and obedience to one's superiors; of useful, cooperative labour through one's lifespan; of the sweetness and nourishment of God's word flourishing in fertile soil; and of the Franciscan ideal of worship through sensory awareness of *natura*. These themes are intertwined with threads of imagery, including that of bees and other creatures in action; of the seasons and waxing and waning growth; of rest and refreshment; of rebelliousness and submission.

In the *Praefatio* Bartholomew situates himself and his work firmly within the established genre of *compilatio* as a 'gathering' or 'harvesting' of useful fruits of others' labours, by describing himself as a gleaner, the humble and impoverished one who gathers up the harvesters' leavings.<sup>13</sup> Like Hugh of Kirkstall, Bartholomew stresses the idea of genealogical descent and the passing-on of virtue when he refers, in Book 17's chapter on the vine, to the growing vine-shoot as the daughter of a fertile mother. Although, unlike Hugh, he repeats the mother-daughter comparison in several other Books and chapters on diverse topics, he was evidently familiar with the conventional metaphor and expected his readers to be.<sup>14</sup> We may reasonably infer an allusion within the text to the task of the compiler in the several chapters where Bartholomew describes bees gathering nutritious matter from flowers near and far.<sup>15</sup> Their wide range of associations mean that bees flit throughout the work, sometimes briefly referred to and at other times inviting meditation upon their significance to the reader. Bartholomew's own gathered wisdom on bees comes from Pliny, Virgil, Avicenna, Isidore, Ambrose and Aristotle, but his accounts vary in their emphasis and in the kind of analogy they create with human activity, and have a naturalistic quality that suggests they are also drawn from observation.

In the last chapter of Book 1 the allegory of the bee is put in place. Bartholomew introduces the idea of God as honey and sweetness: '[God] has many other names ... "dew and rain" because he makes the soul fruitful with virtues; "honey" for the sweetness that he puts into the soul of mankind.'<sup>16</sup> Then in Book 3, on the soul (including the *anima sensibilis* of the senses), Bartholomew cites the medical

authority Constantine on diet: 'for sweetness is very nourishing, and easily assimilated by all the limbs'.<sup>17</sup> In Book 6 the bee serves as a simile that exemplifies the natural preferment of, and submission to, worthy lords among people: 'Ambrose says that among beasts *natura* sets the most noble and strong at their head, and makes kings and leaders among them, as happens among animals and birds and also among bees, which are controlled and led by [these leaders]'.<sup>18</sup> In Book 9 on the properties of time, 'Summer feeds and satisfies bees that gather honey from flowers'. Whitsun, seven weeks after Easter, at the start of good, dry weather, is a time of seven-fold grace for Christians from the coming of the Holy Ghost. Military expeditions prepare for action and the bee is part of the general activity:

And then is the time of all kinds of gladness, joy and mirth, for then all animals and birds are in greatest amity; it is a time of greenness, for then plants and woods come into leaf and growth. It is also a time of fragrance and sweetness from flowers in gardens, groves and meadows, when heaven dries up moisture in flowers and turns it into sweetness. Therefore as Aristotle says it is a good time to make honey, because bees frequent plants and trees on account of their flowers; honey collected in springtime is much sweeter than honey collected at harvest time.<sup>19</sup>

In Book 12, on flying creatures, Bartholomew describes the bee community as obedient to its king, each bee having its allotted task and returning to the hive at night. Some bees gather honey, some nurse the young, and some keep watch against predators.<sup>20</sup> In Book 17 bees and their work are a property of the summer vineyard and of the light-filled tree tops: 'Leaves clothe plants, fields, gardens and woods with beauty and make them delightful with the sweetness that they conceive from the dew of heaven. Therefore bees gather honey when flowers appear; it is a sign of the changing season, and gives hope of fruit.'<sup>21</sup> In Book 18 we are told that the bee deserves to be included among crawling creatures because it uses its legs, as well as its wings, to get along.<sup>22</sup> In this long chapter Bartholomew presents the bee as exemplary in its useful activity, purity and brotherly love. In a complementary chapter he tells how the drones, false bees that do not make honey, steal that of others, kill young bees and are cast out to die.<sup>23</sup> In Book 19, discussed more fully below, we find the products of the bees' industry listed as 'things' with properties we can taste and smell. Liquors, for example, are the natural or man-made products of animals and plants. Honey, he says, is made by the skill of bees from the dew of heaven that falls on flowers.<sup>24</sup> Following chapters are on the properties of honey, honeycomb, *mulsus* or Greek honeyed wine, mead, *claretus* or honeyed wine with spices, *oxymel* or medicated honey, beeswax, and the wax taper or candle.<sup>25</sup>

Much of this may be a matter of observation but, in the context of an allegorical trope where fertility, harvest and honey-gathering express pastoral values, can

also be read as religious instruction or *exempla* for sermons. The manuscript glosses in the chapter *De Apibus* indicate that readers could and did associate the image of the bee with an ideal of clerical obedience, care and kindness, humility, contemplation and study. By contrast, glosses in the chapter on the drone bee, *De fuco*, warn against failure in clerical virtue: 'Be mindful of sloth'; 'Take note of humility; of contemplation; of him who comes to be a preacher through study'.<sup>26</sup>

## The unstable world

The bee, then, is one of the joyful and salutary aspects of the physical world. Bartholomew does not deny the pleasures of the summer landscape; nevertheless, seasons and weather can cloud the real and the metaphorical landscape. He also has to address the world's wintery and fleeting aspects and to emphasise that the Christian's goal lies beyond this world and in eternity. In the lengthy first chapter of Book 8, Bartholomew sets out definitions of the physical world according to classical writers, in particular Aristotle and Plato, but concludes with Christian teaching derived from St Augustine:

Although the universe is clothed with so many noble and diverse things by the might and virtue of God, yet as far as this lower world goes, it is totally subject to many faults and much wretchedness. Although this world seems to be father and begetter of bodies, yet it is the prison of spirits, and a most cruel exile for souls, and a place of very great suffering. For the world is a place of sin and guilt, of exile and pilgrimage, of sorrow and woe ... of moving and of changing, of flow and ebb, of decay and corruption, of disease and turmoil, of violence and destruction, of deceit and guile.<sup>27</sup>

According to Aristotle, however, heaven is simple; its movement is even, it is sober, steadfast and abiding, incorruptible and unchanging.<sup>28</sup> In Book 9, on time, Bartholomew tells us that changeableness on earth is caused by, but is different from, the movement of the spheres and takes six forms — generation, corruption, alteration, growth, diminution, and movement from place to place.<sup>29</sup> Nevertheless, in a spirit of Franciscan acceptance of *natura*, Bartholomew presents the change and decay we witness in the changing seasons as a cause for reassurance and joy. *Natura*, he tells us in Book 18, has reasons and remedies for all our discomforts.<sup>30</sup>

In 'Properties', representations of decay and destructiveness accompany and counterbalance those of growth and sweetness, and vice versa. We have seen that the ideas of movement, growth and activity inform the religious metaphors of the vine, the bee, and the mother and daughter, used in the Cistercian chronicle of Hugh of Kirkstall. The same sense of movement pervades 'Properties' in passages describing the actions and effects of people, animals, birds and fishes,

plants and trees. These things become sources for positive-spirited meditation on life and death, fertility and salvation.<sup>31</sup> In Book 17 the well-filled panorama of rural labour in vineyard, woods, fields and ploughland can be joyously productive but its guardians have to be vigilant against foxes, caterpillars, nettles and briars. There are also weeds, bad soil, snakes and toads that hide in the foliage, and invading pigs and dogs.<sup>32</sup> The glosses show that destructive animals and weeds could denote moral hazards such as worldly, proud and secular people, as in the chapter on the bramble that snatches at the legs of the unwary walker: 'Take note of the worldly and proud; of the secular; of the sons and disciples of wicked men and heretics; of the works of the wicked; of greedy prelates.'<sup>33</sup> Nature, then, is a salutary reminder of our own vices as well as of God's providence. Brambles and pests are reminders of the way nature balances opposite properties, humours and elements in human life as in the cosmos. In Book 9, on the chapter on the Hebrew festival of the tabernacles, Bartholomew shows how the rewards of autumn balance those of spring: at this harvest festival, fruits are brought and houses decorated, but it is also a time of expiation and repentance. The harvest is gathered and the trees are dry and cold.<sup>34</sup> In Book 17, in the chapter 'On the tree-tops', Bartholomew delivers a sermon, with reference only to the authority of Isidore, on the consolations and hopes we can draw from the seasonal cycle of growth and decay. The leaves that shelter the bees 'are green and growing in spring and summer, fade in autumn, fall one by one as winter comes, and in the end rot into the ground. Leaves are, however, useful as medicine and fodder.' The growth of leaves, flowers and fruit provides protection, remedies, food and enjoyment. Isidore says they are like light: while they last they activate all our senses.<sup>35</sup>

Bartholomew stresses in the last chapters of Book 6 that, as the times of year balance each other, we must balance our diet and complement exercise with rest. As the year turns, so peace and quietness come at the end to crown the turbulence and laboriousness of life. Bartholomew describes the properties of complementary conditions, both general and specific: life and death; childhood and adulthood; male and female; lordship and servitude; waking and sleeping; exercise and rest; food and drink; and, in particular, things that accord with nature and things that are contrary to nature.<sup>36</sup>

## ***Natura* and remedies**

Bartholomew's Franciscan presentation of *natura* has been the subject of scholarly discussion. In the 1980s, David Greetham commented upon the mix of observation and allegory in 'Properties', and the way Bartholomew emphasises the natural world as a source of both wonder and praise. He finds a pleasing tension in the work between its 'earthbound' appearance and its moralising function.<sup>37</sup> Peter Dronke's important study of *natura* as a Christian concept traces its development over almost 1000 years, from late antiquity to the time of Bernard Silvestris and

the school of Chartres.<sup>38</sup> Roger French and Andrew Cunningham clarify the difference between the Franciscan and Dominican uses of the term *natura* and stress the fundamental importance to the Franciscans of particular biblical texts; above all, of Paul's epistle to the Romans: 'For the invisible things of him from the creation of the world are clearly seen, being understood by the things that are made, even his eternal power and Godhead.' The properties of 'the things that are made' need to be understood as a window into the eternal world. For example, as French and Cunningham explain, light is of extreme importance to the Franciscans as the seraphic illumination which had descended upon Francis on Monte Verna. Light was therefore the clearest expression of nature and the primary Franciscan symbol of the unity and power of God.<sup>39</sup>

In Book 2, Bartholomew devotes the second chapter to the properties of angels according to Pseudo-Dionysius, with some reference also to John Damascene, St Gregory and the Bible. He tells us that, according to Damascene, angels receive their light from God and reflect it upon those below. In this way they share with us the hidden sweetness of the goodness of God, received through contemplation and 'tasting' (*contemplando et gustando*).<sup>40</sup> In Book 3, he describes the soul first of all as receptive to divine illumination.<sup>41</sup> In Book 8, the subject of light receives specific and thoroughgoing treatment in a different context of knowledge, that of the earth and heavenly bodies. In the chapters on light in general, glowing light, light reflected and refracted, radiance, shadows and darkness, Bartholomew refers to a host of authorities, including Aristotle, Albumazar, Algazel, Augustine, Basil and Ambrose, to Calcidius' commentary on Plato's *Timaeus*, and to Pseudo-Dionysius *On the divine names*.<sup>42</sup> This is a broad gathering of medieval statements concerning a key phenomenon of the physical and theological universe, in which Bartholomew does not adjudicate but simply makes available the spread of opinion. He does, however, balance the authority of Aristotle with that of Pseudo-Dionysius and other Neoplatonic writers, drawing the reader's attention to the mystical and contemplative as well as physical properties of light. This would be appropriate for students familiar with the already-growing legend of Francis's encounter with the seraph on Monte Verna.<sup>43</sup>

This philosophy of nature, as that which our senses can apprehend as a first step towards God, is one which the Franciscan Bonaventure would later formulate in his *Itinerarium mentis ad Deum*. Bonaventure describes how the invisible things of God can be grasped intellectually through the senses, in contemplation of seven things: the origin, magnitude, multitude, beauty, plenitude, operation and order of the created world.<sup>44</sup> According to Seymour, there is evidence of personal communication between Bonaventure and Bartholomew in a letter of 1266 addressing the older man as *carissimo fratri Bartholomeo ministro Saxonie*. 'Properties' may well have been available to Bonaventure in Paris by this time.<sup>45</sup>

Bartholomew establishes early in the work the reassuring idea that life's dangers and difficulties are counterbalanced by providential supports and remedies. He develops the theme of instability, change, growth and decay with much emphasis on the fecund as well as the degenerate nature of the unstable physical world, but teaches that amid this fecundity it is essential to be discriminating. Some 'things' are harmful, others remedial, and there are those that give us a feeling of closeness to God. Some of them require that we do our bit to make them useful. Book 17 contains chapters on the products of plants that can be processed, such as strong planed timbers for building ships and houses; paper and straw; a medicinal kind of pesto made of burdock leaves, nourishing porridge, raisins; bread-grains, yeast, ointment, olives and their oil.<sup>46</sup> A long section of the Book is devoted to the distinctions that must be made between types of grapes and wine, some being beneficial but others spurious or harmful.<sup>47</sup> The glosses indicate that these chapters were particularly resonant with associations with the Eucharist. They include references to the passion and blood of Christ, to the elevation of the Host, and to the nourishment and growth of charity and virtue: 'Take note concerning the passion of Christ; the raising of the Host; the blood of Christ and its purity.'<sup>48</sup> Glosses on the grape include pointers to fullness and fatness belonging both to the grape itself and to the idea of Christian love.<sup>49</sup> Those on new wine point to novices, argument, and the danger of drunkenness and sensuality.<sup>50</sup> In Book 17 there are also chapters on places where plants grow: within hedges, in prepared fields, and densely in groves, according to the fertility of the place.<sup>51</sup> Bartholomew makes the chapter on the vineyard a focus for meditation on the plants, workers, good and destructive animals and sensory delights of the scene of earthly labour, while the chapter on the cellar tells us that the wine will be all the better for being kept in the cold and dark.<sup>52</sup>

## Learning to submit

Plants, as well as bees and other animals, can remind us that we have to grow up, learn discipline from our elders and betters and face the ending of life's day. In Book 17, Bartholomew describes the properties of the root as the part of the plant that draws in nourishment to send to the leaves: roots vary in form; they accord with the nature of the ground in which they are hidden; a root is stronger the deeper it lies; it passes its quality on to the leaves and fruit of the plant, and thence to the seed; it can be edible, medicinal or otherwise useful. Bartholomew overtly likens the root of a plant to a nurse who nourishes the growing child.<sup>53</sup> The glossator points to another level of meaning available within this descriptive account: 'Take note concerning faith and humility; nurture and kindness; the study of the divine Word through reading and listening; the strength of charity; the remission of sin, the choice between good and bad.'<sup>54</sup> The glosses tell us, then, that for a thirteenth-century reader aware of the clerical connotations, the physical reality of a plant's root could serve to exemplify the professional virtue

of providing good pastoral care. The glosses also show us that the underlying significance of the small boy resisting his mother's attempts to wash and comb him, described in Book 6, is similar to that of the colt resisting the bridle, described in Book 18.<sup>55</sup> Against Bartholomew's lively and evocative sketch of the mother and child the glossator strikes a sombre and warning note: '[T]ake note concerning those who will not be told about eternal life; those who chatter; those who will not submit to discipline.'<sup>56</sup> Against Bartholomew's lyrical description of the colt allowed to run freely with its mother until the time for training comes, the glossator warns: '[T]ake note concerning subordinates and novices; the wish of subordinates to be prelates; concerning preachers; why the world should be spurned.'<sup>57</sup> Both the small boy and the colt have properties that can point to an underlying lesson — that there are those who have not yet learned to submit to discipline, who are spiritually immature or recalcitrant, noisy or in a hurry, and who do not want to give up worldly things. Examples of wilfulness and discipline, teaching and learning, service and reward, authority and subordination, infancy, growth and maturity crop up again and again in the rest of the work, among the properties of creatures on earth and in the commentary alongside the text. The glosses help us to see how the text creates a web of connected spiritual meanings through the properties of diverse physical things: roots supply nourishment to the growing plant; mothers and nurses give nourishment and guidance to the growing child; the preacher supplies nourishment and guidance to the growing Christian soul. Humans, plants, animals, stones, birds and bees can all point to the same truth.

## Lightening the burden

The reader can infer that there is both humour and reassurance to be found in *natura*, who, as Bartholomew mentions in Book 18, citing Pliny, makes marvellous beasts to entertain and astonish us.<sup>58</sup> In Book 17, playing on the word *virga* (rod or twig), Bartholomew links the ideas of florescence and of the Incarnation, a rhetorical device favoured by the Benedictine abbess and poetess Hildegard of Bingen a century earlier.<sup>59</sup> This wordplay reveals Bartholomew's use of literary concepts available in his time and place, but he concludes the chapter with a touch of punning humour and bathos: 'At the same time the rod is hateful to dogs and little boys, because it restrains their bad behaviour.'<sup>60</sup> Another example of his populist touch occurs in his references to the fox in Book 18 and elsewhere. Hassig discusses the array of significations that the image of the bestial fox could carry, derived from scripture, folklore and daily life: sly hypocrisy, the guile of the devil seeking souls to devour; heresy.<sup>61</sup> Bartholomew's fox in Book 18 is derived from several sources, including scripture, the bestiary and folklore. In *De Vulpe*, Bartholomew reiterates the bestiary descriptions of the fox's crooked gait and untrustworthy ways, but also alludes to popular comic stories about the fox current at his time, recalling that the fox

is helped by his friend the stag in his quarrel with the badger. In his chapter on the badger, Bartholomew evokes in a few words a vignette of the animal as a careful householder mindful of his stores, bothered by his greedy wife on one hand and by his impudent neighbour the fox on the other. Fox and badger are nevertheless allied in that they both live in dens and use their hairy coats to protect them against hounds.<sup>62</sup> In these two chapters Bartholomew is apparently alluding to the characters of fox, badger and stag from the *Roman de Renard*, making use of an existing bit of the popular tradition as it existed in his time and place that could engage both readers and sermon audiences.<sup>63</sup> In these examples Bartholomew seems to acknowledge that study, like other forms of labour, can be arduous and that the reader, like the music-loving ox, works better with a bit of cheerful encouragement. The glossator, however, sternly reminds the reader of the fox's connotations of hypocrisy, heresy, greed and guile: 'Take note of the cunning and hypocritical; of entrapments; against the gluttonous.'<sup>64</sup>

## Rest and reward

As mentioned above, our to-ing and fro-ing from place to place is one of the six kinds of movement listed by Bartholomew as symptomatic of this world's instability. In the work as a whole, the reader's attention is constantly drawn to images of rest and refreshment after labour or travel. Secular workers and travellers — the labourer, overseer, household servant, builder, land surveyor, foot-traveller, seaman and so on — populate the text, as well as animal workers such as the bee, ox, ass and dog. Among flying creatures, the dove carries letters for long distances at great personal risk; the crane flies far, calls loudly, watches sleeplessly and is ready for battle; the hen looks after her chicks and the bee works all day at a range of tasks. Work can be painful but rewarding: Bartholomew describes the ox as a good animal but one that suffers a lot from outward and inward causes; it has to look at the ground because of the yoke but it loves its fellow, and is loved and cared for by its master. The companion chapter on the ox-herd fills out the picture of obedient labour. Here, Bartholomew gives the reader a glimpse of the ploughman at work, yoking and driving his oxen to and fro, but coaxing them with whistling and songs and giving them refreshment at the end of the day.<sup>65</sup> There is a strong narrative feel to these chapters on the patient ox and the whistling ploughman going about their work, inviting the reader to recall experience of pain and weariness, solace and friendship, as well as of actual labour in the fields.<sup>66</sup> The glosses confirm that clerical readers could understand the imagery of the plough to be about their own work, trials and rewards; glosses on the ox include: 'Take note concerning the prelate's piety and compassion; of the work of prelates and scholars; against those who disparage prelates; of the martyrs; of confessors and their office; of preachers; of preaching.'<sup>67</sup> Glosses on the ox-herd emphasise the disciplinary

role of the prelate over subordinates: 'Take note concerning the office of the prelate; of the correcting guidance of prelates; of the correction of subordinates.'<sup>68</sup> We can see why Bartholomew could place *bubulcus* next to *bos* in Book 18; from the preacher's point of view, as well as the ploughman's, they form a team.

In Book 9, evening is described as the time when watchmen take their place on walls and turrets, and when working men and animals are rewarded, paid and allowed to rest. The whole chapter on evening is a naturalistic description of the day's end — shadows lengthening, nocturnal creatures emerging, plants closing, moisture rising, the chilling of the air on the skin, flocks being gathered in and watches set. The homely phrase 'In the evening dogs can hardly be told from wolves' implies both physical and spiritual danger.<sup>69</sup> Here are opportunities for the reader to meditate on the close of life. In the work as a whole the repeated references to evening, with its properties of obscurity, imminent danger and need for refuge, keep readers aware of the ending of life and of the uncertainty of what comes after: will they have earned salvation and reward in the Lord's mansions, or a painful and ignominious casting-out?<sup>70</sup>

## The lord's familia

The setting of the parable of the workers in the vineyard was especially meaningful since the narrative had some real-life parallels in thirteenth-century rural life.<sup>71</sup> In Book 6 of 'Properties', Bartholomew takes us indoors, into the manorial household, where we find lord and lady, children, guests and servants. These include not only male workers such as the manservant and steward but also the nurse, the maidservant and the midwife. Here, he presents a sequence of chapters dealing with the most universal and commonplace experiences — those of childhood, of work, domestic relations, mealtimes and bedtimes, sports and pastimes, sleep and dreams — beginning with the first chapter on death, *De morte*, and ending with rest, *De quiete*.<sup>72</sup> The midwife swaddles the newborn infant, the child wilfully struggles under his mother's hand as she tries to wash him, the daughter is cherished by the father, the negligent servant is punished and the good steward rewarded. The image of the maidservant beaten for misbehaviour contrasts with that of the servant or guest in the house of a good lord; rewarded, feasted and secure.<sup>73</sup> The domestic household depicted is strongly hierarchical, with lord and lady presiding over ranks of servants. The range of *dramatis personae* in Book 6 could have allowed readers of all social backgrounds to identify with Bartholomew's normative portrayals of servanthood in the lord's *familia*.

Book 6's chapters on meal-times make palpable the physical and spiritual rewards of belonging to, and serving in, the well-run abode of lord and lady. In *De prandio*, 'On the mid-day meal', Bartholomew tells us that food is prepared;

fellow diners (*conviviae*) are called; forms and stools are set in the hall; trestles, cloths, towels are organised. Guests sit down with the lord at the top of the table, and no-one sits down until the guests have washed their hands. Mothers and daughters take their place, and retainers take theirs. Spoons, knives and salt-cellars are set on the table, then bread, drink and various dishes. Menials and servants cheerfully bring dishes and drinks and joke amongst themselves. There is music. Fruit and *épiceries* conclude the meal, then tables are cleared and moved from the centre of the room; hands are washed and dried. The lord and the guests say grace, and drinks go round again. Finally, everyone goes to rest or back to their own homes. Bartholomew does not need to cite any external authorities, but could be drawing on experience of secular occasions to describe lunchtime in a prosperous household.<sup>74</sup>

Throughout 'Properties', Bartholomew implies the goal of arrival, rest and reward. Whether they be workers in the household or travellers emerging from the thickets and arriving at the walls before the gates close, all can have a share in the lord's feast at the end of the day. Bartholomew puts this reassuring idea clearly in place in Book 6, where he describes the evening meal at the lord's house.<sup>75</sup> Here, all is decorous conviviality, sensory enjoyment, relaxation and rest. There are people, colours, music, candles, lights, delicious food and wine, and darkness and moths are shut out. All ranks are present, and again it is, in a sense, a scene which the reader can concretise from actual experience, whether sitting at the head or the foot of the table (above or below the salt, as the saying goes) or serving up in the kitchen, and be fully involved in mind, body and spirit. At the same time, early in the chapter Bartholomew makes explicit reference to the Old Testament story of the feast of Ahasuerus, foreshadowing the New Testament promise of the 'many mansions' prepared for the faithful.<sup>76</sup> Such descriptions allow the reader to reflect on actual life and service within the manorial household, but also on an ideal of life spent in the service of God.

Bartholomew keeps familiar images of service and lordship before the reader from first to last. In Book 1, on the properties and names of God, he puts in place an ideal of lordship drawn from the most authoritative sources: for Damascene, God is perfect unity, light itself, a mystical circle; St Bernard describes God in terms of fruitfulness, benevolence and loving rule; the blessed Dionysius (St Denis) describes God as the father of fathers, shepherd of his flock, only describable by figures of speech.<sup>77</sup> Book 2 then presents the orders of good angels as ideal servants of God, and Lucifer as the archetype of the disobedient servant.<sup>78</sup> The idea of good and bad governance recurs in Book 5, where the soul is described as ruler of the body, and the limbs and organs have separate tasks; if the head is well disposed or distempered, all the limbs follow suit.<sup>79</sup> In Book 6, chapters on good lordship and good service spell out the ideal

relationship, while chapters on bad lordship and bad servants present the reverse.<sup>80</sup>

In Book 6 the notion of lordship and service is extended to the mutual relations of man and wife in a colourful and courtly passage. The man woos a bride, gives gifts in exchange for her, takes her into his house and bed, looks after and corrects her, and makes her mistress over his money and *familia*; he takes care of her interests just as much as his own.<sup>81</sup> The economic concerns of the *dominus* and *domina* are referred to in the chapter on the good servant, who, among other virtues, is meek but eager to procure the profit of his lord; he takes more heed to multiply and grow his lord's goods and cattle than his own, for in multiplying his lord's cattle he procures his own profit. A good servant is careful to give an account of what he has taken and delivered of his lord's goods and cattle, for he hopes to have payment and reward for good stewardship.<sup>82</sup> This normative but lively picture of the *familia*, complete with marriage, money and orderly housekeeping, not only recalls scriptural parables of good service but also seems appropriately evocative for the Franciscan committed to a life without fixed abode or domestic comfort. Bartholomew's description of the man wooing, wedding and bedding the bride might have suggested a compensatory vision for the celibate Christian cleric, one that we know was promoted by Bernard of Clairvaux in his imagery of the mystical espousal to the church celebrated in the *Song of Songs*.<sup>83</sup>

## The celibate servant

For the compiler and his contemporaries, the *familia* could be a religious as well as a secular institution, manifest in the religious orders and houses. It was also a visionary one, where Father, Son and Holy Spirit were joined by the Virgin as Christ's mother and the church as his bride. In the womb of the Church lay souls waiting to be nurtured by priests and preachers. The emphasis on feminine forms of service in Book 6 and elsewhere in 'Properties' can be seen as appropriate for male religious in the light of this medieval trope, and of recent studies of female and male fertility as a complex metaphor for the pastoral role of the clergy.<sup>84</sup> Taking this further, the glosses confirm that readers could draw from certain chapters the idea that physical procreation could be joyfully embraced as a metaphor for clerical office. Some indicate, for example, that clerical readers could see their own relationship with Christ, their own spiritual nurture and their own office reflected in the figure of the nurse: 'Take note concerning Christ; of the teaching of the masters; of the office of prelate and of subordinates.'<sup>85</sup> In the following chapter on the midwife, the glossator infers the ideal compassion of preachers as they help to bring forth Christian souls from the womb of the church: 'Take note of preachers and their office; of compassion; of the prelate and the preacher.'<sup>86</sup> The inclusion in Book 18 of chapters on the feminine or female, on gestation and on the foetus are thus by no means anomalous in the

context of this metaphorical understanding, as the glossator makes clear in relation to the foetus: 'Take note concerning sons in the womb of the church.'<sup>87</sup>

In such positive representations of clerical and pastoral office we can discern what, in effect, appears as an idealised third gender — the celibate creature who performs both masculine and feminine roles. In the chapters cited above and elsewhere, Bartholomew subtly reinforces the idea that preaching can be both nurturing and fertilising. In Book 13's long last chapter on the properties of fishes, he cites Aristotle on the ways fishes reproduce: 'For certain [fishes] are engendered through coitus and emission of sperm, as Aristotle says.'<sup>88</sup> The gloss alongside makes clear the implied analogy with spreading the word: 'Take note concerning the preacher.'<sup>89</sup> In Book 12, on flying creatures, Bartholomew emphasises the cock's masculine properties of vigour, aggressive display and male ardour but also feminine compassion; and in the case of the hen, feminine properties of submissiveness to the male, modesty and maternal love. The glosses indicate that these properties could pertain to preachers. Those against the chapter on the cock include: 'Take note concerning the labour of the good and of works of piety; of the compassion of women.'<sup>90</sup> Glosses against the chapter on the hen include: 'Be on your guard against vain glory; take note of compassion; of pastoral care.'<sup>91</sup> In the chapter on the castrated capon, Bartholomew portrays a creature in which both masculine and feminine properties are absent or subverted; the capon is fleshy but sexless, and neither defends nor nurtures. In the end it is good only for taking to the oven and eating.<sup>92</sup> The glosses confirm that mere inactive neutrality could be associated (as in the case of the drone bee) with ineffective, carnal and useless clerics and hypocrites, and warn of their ending. On the other hand, the properties of familiar creatures such as the ox or bee could imply an active role for the celibate, and the clerical life could be envisaged as a productive, rewarding, procreative state embracing the best of men's and women's sexual roles. To be merely neuter was to be useless, but the preacher, like the un-mated nurse, could be a privileged surrogate mother.<sup>93</sup>

## Travelling through the world and the book

I have argued that Bartholomew's early readers could interpret the properties of things in the everyday world — fishes, farmyard poultry, the ploughman and his team, bees and other creatures — as reminders of the preacher's role, vows and hopes of heaven. However, while the image of the bee was ideal for the monastic worker, enclosed in a hierarchical community and separated from the world, Franciscans entering into apostolic missionary work had no such assurance of subsistence or protection. They were committed to a life of homelessness as well as celibacy. Bartholomew's recurring mentions of *peregrines*, *viatores*, *transeuntes*, *ambulantes*, *navigantes* and *remiges* (pilgrims, wayfarers, travellers, walkers, mariners and rowers) seem appropriate to the needs of

students who expected to be literally exposed to perilous contact with the world in a way that enclosed monastic *laborantes* were not.

Bartholomew's description of the migratory crane in Book 12 tends to support the view that while the moralised image of the bee matched beautifully the ideals of *opus Dei*, *castitas* and *stabilitas* of the enclosed Orders, the mendicants needed a more adventurous metaphor to express their aims. The crane's bestiary character suited the Franciscans in some of its features: according to the bestiary the crane looks after its brothers, obeys and follows its leader on long journeys, is grey in colour, has a loud voice, fights pigmies armed with arrows and keeps watch holding a stone in one claw.<sup>94</sup> Bartholomew in *De grue*, 'On the crane', refers to bestiary authorities but he restricts his account to the strength of the crane's voice and the wings, the urge to seek far places, the orderliness of the brotherhood and especially the office of the leader, who is replaced if he grows hoarse, and the bird's vigilance and defensive strategies.<sup>95</sup> In an early manuscript of 'Properties', against the first line of the column text the glossator has put: 'Take note concerning the lord's ascension.'<sup>96</sup> From this we might reasonably infer an analogy between this bird's strong upward flight and Christ's Ascension from Mt Olivet.<sup>97</sup> But if we consult the early-fourteenth-century *Liber rerum moralizatae*, the collection of preaching *exempla* based on parts of 'Properties', on the moral properties of the crane, we find that the Franciscan compiler of this later work expands on the gloss to convey a wider meaning relevant to his Order. The redactor first repeats Bartholomew's account and then enlarges upon the significance of the crane's large wings, strong voice and lofty flight in search of distant places:

The crane, briefly, is found among the authors to have these conditions or properties. First, as Ambrose says in the *Hexameron*, it is a bird of large wings and strong flight, seeking the high air like a pilgrim seeking those regions. It signifies powerful prelates or [ ] great and famous contemplatives, as was Paul, who was snatched up suddenly towards a beam of light and into Paradise, where he heard the words of the archangel which it is not lawful to hear in this place. It was written of the blessed Francis who, on such strong and powerful wings, [ ] was many times suspended in rare and sweet contemplation, and indeed the Seraphim irradiated him with glory so that he might become altogether one with God, with whom he is now become like a bird of the angels.<sup>98</sup>

This passage in the later work tends to confirm that, for Franciscan readers especially, the strong upward flight of the crane could connote an ideal of ecstatic contemplation and the light-filled apotheoses of the Order's spiritual great ones, recounted in scripture and legend: that of St Paul ('caught up to the third heaven' in a vision) and of St Francis (lifted up in ecstatic contemplation on Monte Verna).<sup>99</sup> It strongly suggests that the later work might provide important

complementary data for the study of 'Properties'; it also reminds us that the full freight of meaning of the glosses may now be lost, along with stories they could once evoke.

We need not assume that medieval readers read 'Properties' from Book 1 to Book 19; the sequence of Books and chapters may reflect a thinking and organising process rather than a set plan for the reader. Nevertheless, the reader, too, can be considered as a kind of traveller through the book. As Roger Chartier observes, reading can be seen as a kind of work and a kind of travel.<sup>100</sup> In the thirteenth-century context, 'Properties' as a 'world book' also implies a journey for the reader through the properties of created things, just as the world itself is a place of *peregrinatio* or pilgrimage.<sup>101</sup>

A respected precedent existed in the words of St Augustine for seeing, within every actual or contemplated journey, a pilgrimage towards our true home that is not of this world:

Suppose, then, we were wanderers in a strange country, and could not live happily away from our fatherland, and that we felt wretched in our wandering, and wishing to put an end to our misery determined to return home. We find, however, that we must make use of some mode of conveyance, either by land or water, in order to reach that fatherland where our enjoyment is to commence ... Such is a picture of our condition in this life of mortality. We have wandered far from God; and if we wish to return to our Father's home, this world must be used, not enjoyed, so that the invisible things of God may be clearly seen, being understood by the things that are made — that is, that by means of what is material and temporary we may lay hold upon that which is spiritual and eternal.<sup>102</sup>

Bartholomew reminds the reader from time to time that we are all pilgrims through life and, like travellers by land and sea, are at risk of getting lost in the dark or in bad weather, of arriving late, being distracted, encumbered or poorly prepared. In Book 1, Bartholomew tells us that God is announced by many names, including way, life and truth.<sup>103</sup> The notion of the travelling and endangered soul is introduced at the beginning of Book 3, on the soul and reason. Here, Bartholomew describes a difficult concept in concrete terms: 'For [the soul] is one with the body as a driving force is one with a moving object, and as the sailor is one with his boat.'<sup>104</sup> Thereafter the reader is given glimpses, scattered in several Books, of the fallible wayfarer and the frail mariner on dangerous routes, threatened by many hazards but aided by stars, islands, winds, floating spars or stabilising barnacles on the hull. In Book 9 we are reminded that although daylight turns to darkness the movement of the heavens can give light and guidance to travellers: '[I]n the darkness of night wayfarers and mariners easily miss the right way, unless they are guided by the movement and position

of the stars.<sup>105</sup> In Book 13's chapter on the sea, discussed more fully in the next chapter, Bartholomew warns that the inadequately captained ship may come late to the harbour.<sup>106</sup> In Book 17, brambles are troublesome to passers-by, they spread everywhere, blunt the knife, catch at the feet and clothing, scratch the hands.<sup>107</sup> The short phrases, plentiful verbs, graphic details, recognisable brambles and memories of the sensations of such an everyday experience, all invite the reader to identify with this walker. In Book 17 we also see the walker in a dark wood, where the light is dim and robbers lurk waiting to rob or strangle the passer-by. The properties of dense woods include both dangers and delights for the traveller: on the one hand pagan rites are enacted in their darkness, snakes lurk, there are many paths, and it is easy to be led astray by false signs and pointers made by robbers. On the other hand, birds find shelter there from predators, and bees find hollow trees in which to hide their honey.<sup>108</sup> These are all things that we know and experience as part of active daily life and work. As on any cross-country excursion, the traveller through the world — or vicariously through the world book — needs to have faith and rely on guiding signs, but may find sources of enjoyment along the way. The reader can pick up references to them throughout the compilation — but all paths lead to Book 19.

## **Book 19: Coming full circle**

The unassuming rubric of Book 19 has given the impression of a casual ragbag of leftover topics.<sup>109</sup> While the topics have an undeniably bric-a-brac appearance at first sight, I would argue that they combine to create a single overarching idea: that earthly things can lead us to an understanding of heavenly things and to reconciliation with God. The final Book deals with the ways in which we perceive through our senses 'the accidents of matter' in terms of colour, flavour, shape, weight, number and sound. The chapters on colours, tastes and smells, sounds, quantities and vessels implicitly refer back to experiences of vineyard and manorial hall. We have seen that Books 6, 9 and 13 reinforce the idea of homecoming, rest and reward at evening. Books 12 to 18 itemise the raw materials of the lord's feast: foods and drink, timber, flax, dyes, clays, metals, shells, leather, candle wax and more. Book 17 refers to a wide range of plant foods, cooking and processing, growers and harvesters, and the properties of grapes and wines. Book 19 then anatomises the lord's feast in its chapters on colour, taste and smell; milk and milk products; honey and beeswax; vessels and money; order, measure and music, and the senses through which we perceive and evaluate all these. As we have seen, the bee is an idealised worker in constant motion, and in Book 19 the products of the bees' activity are itemised as those which can be tasted, eaten and drunk, and above all used to make light.<sup>110</sup> Bartholomew recounts how beeswax candles illumine those things which are hidden in darkness. They have three properties: material, use and shape. The

material is three-fold: wick, wax and flame; they are pyramidal in shape. Carried before lords, they are used to light the way.<sup>111</sup> The final Book of 'Properties' offers the reader a sense of purpose to the bees' industry in this description of the end-product, the light-giving candle, with its three-fold qualities emphasising the religious and platonic associations of the number three and the triangle.<sup>112</sup>

## Good doctrine and good works

Book 19 brings together in its chapters the diversity of 'things' and the many distinct tasks and processes they impose on us. At the start of its chapters on numbers, weights, measures and unity, Bartholomew cites *The Book of Wisdom* on God's ordering of creation: 'For it is not said in vain, "You have made all things in number, weight and measure."' <sup>113</sup> We see how material 'things' involve work in their production, processing and use; their properties have to be taken into account in a practical way. Clothes have to be dyed, pigments ground, food cooked, wax made into candles. Oil has to be put into lamps, milk made into junket, butter, cheese. The chapters on milk inform the reader that it can come from mammals in general and, in particular, from camels, cows, goats, sheep, asses, mares and pigs.<sup>114</sup> It can be turned into buttermilk, butter, fresh cheese, matured cheese and curds.<sup>115</sup> This is matter of fact, but the glossator points to the teaching of doctrine (*doctrina*) as the real subject of the chapters. Like milk, Christian teaching can be sound and nourishing, warm, pure and refreshing, flavoursome, unwholesome and bad, or just right. It can be flavoured or suspect; and like the flow from the teat, the ideas and words of preachers who at first have a lot to say can gradually dry up.<sup>116</sup> Bartholomew devotes considerable space to eggs and their properties — not only the eggs of birds, but also of ants and spiders, turtles, dragons, toads, locusts, snakes, gryphons, crabs and crocodiles. Eggs can be cooked but may be digestible or indigestible, according to the creatures from which they come.<sup>117</sup> The glossator shows us that Bartholomew's odd-seeming lists of eggs, far from being anomalous, can be understood as signifiers of salvation through good works, though not all works are necessarily good. The glosses on eggs include: 'Take note what the works of just men ought to be like; concerning the fertile soil of grace and devotion; how vainglory destroys works.'<sup>118</sup> Doves' eggs can signify the works of the simple and good; eagles' eggs those of the powerful, and also Christ in the heart; dragons' eggs, however, are a warning of those with power and hidden malice; spiders' eggs signify the lazy works of hypocrites and heretics, and the eggs of ants are like those of the poor.<sup>119</sup> While it seems safe to conclude from the annotations that the chapters on milk, eggs, honey and wax could hold spiritual and liturgical associations, it is not possible here to fully unravel the symbolic causes, conditions and effects of the other material items mentioned in Book 19.

The chapters on tastes, aromas and foods should remind us that this was a literary culture in which Hugh of St Victor and Bernard of Clairvaux had portrayed reading as chewing, tasting and swallowing for the replenishment of the soul.<sup>120</sup> Bartholomew makes palatable doctrines that were complex, controversial and highly scholastic. The term 'accident', for example, had a far-from-casual philosophical meaning which, in the context of contemporary debate about the transformation of matter, Thomas Aquinas (1225–74) expounded in the articles of his *Summa Theologica*. Chapters in Book 19 treat materials which, like the Eucharist, involve changes: butter, cheese, curds and whey are all essentially milk; honey, mead, candle-wax are all essentially that which bees make. There is also a chapter on change itself: 'On coagulation'. Spiced and sweetened wines are still essentially wine. It is surely no accident that Bartholomew reiterates examples of the transformation of matter at a time when the relationship between a thing's inner substance, or *substantia*, and its outer appearance, or *species*, was a highly important issue for the church.<sup>121</sup> For Bartholomew, writing when Aristotelian philosophy appeared to be at odds with the church's teaching and when the nature of transubstantiation was the subject of much debate, the 'appearance of those things which are of frequent use' and their physical properties were important and controversial.<sup>122</sup> Beneath appearances and properties lay the possibility of a conversion to something useful and even divine. In Book 19's accounts of the conversion of milk into butter, junket and cheese; of beeswax into candles; of honey and wines into medicines, we may justifiably infer an allusion to the spiritual transformation believed to be effected at the Mass.

## Choosing the right path

The work as a whole, then, presents a conflation of joyful rewarding feasts: the actual, the scriptural, the liturgical and the eschatological. But first it is necessary to arrive and to be judged. In Book 19 Bartholomew describes different kinds of road, footpath and track, with their uses and hazards, making clear that before arriving at the desired refuge the traveller has a choice of paths and the chance of further danger from robbers at the crossroads.<sup>123</sup> Glosses against this chapter indicate choices of career available to medieval readers — religious or military, for instance — and the need to follow example and advice: 'Take note concerning the multiplicity of ways; of precepts and advice; of the path of religion; of the path of the warrior.'<sup>124</sup> It is as if the compiler, having brought the reader to this final stage, leaves it to him or her to decide what happens next. The reader's identification with the traveller comes to a logical endpoint.

## Harmony and reconciliation

In Book 19, the themes of work and of travel culminate in images of movement towards God, of judgement, but also of communion, light and harmony. As we

have seen, the reader can become an imaginary participant in the lord's feast, drawing on memory to savour the light of candles, the taste of honey, milk, butter, cheese, eggs, amid the clutter and clatter of vessels and the harmonising effect of music. One effect on the reader of Book 19 is of a climax to the diversity of properties and things in creation, a confusing cacophony of artefacts, substances and conflicting sense impressions. Out of this diverse clutter, Bartholomew draws an elegant effect of closure by returning to his original theme of heavenly unity and perfection, in his praise of the divine properties of the numbers one and three and of the circle, as they represent the Trinity and the perfection of God. In the last Book, Bartholomew returns to a paradoxical analogy with which he begins, bringing the work itself full circle. In Book 1 he had described God in philosophical terms as universal and infinite creator: 'God is the sphere of intellect whose centre is everywhere, and indeed its circumference is nowhere ... thus God brings forth his creations and also confines them.'<sup>125</sup> He repeats this near the end of Book 19: 'God [says the philosopher Secundus] is the intellectual circle, whose centre is everywhere, and circumference nowhere. From which it is clear that the meaning of that circle glimmers in all creation.'<sup>126</sup> In his description of the properties of the circle and the number one, Bartholomew also unites the practical with the theological functions of the work and brings together as compatible and complementary his Christian and pagan sources, citing both Aristotle and Hermes Trismegistos in support of Christian teaching. He concludes, through the technicalities of musical harmony, on the note of cosmic unity with which he began: music reconciles the oppositions and calms the strife caused by the six kinds of movement on earth. It comforts rowers, makes all kinds of labour bearable and encourages warriors.<sup>127</sup> The word *remiges*, rowers, conveys a sense of physical labour and also recalls the above-mentioned description of the soul which, starting out early in Book 3, is at one with the body as a mariner is at one with his boat. In this focus upon arrival, reconciliation and harmony, Book 19 seems to remind the reader of his or her spiritual goal — what Sylvain Louis refers to as 'ce qu'il faut atteindre'.<sup>128</sup> This effect of wholeness endorses Christel Meier's conclusion, noted in the previous chapter, that a characteristic of the world-book genre is the demonstration of underlying order and logic beneath the apparent chaos of the world.

To sum up and conclude this chapter: Bartholomew's image of the world, far from being a static account of the properties of things, is dynamic in that it contains many descriptions of people and things in action and rest, growth and decay, transit and flux. The six kinds of movement afflict the earth and living things, but *natura* providentially mitigates their effects and balances decay with growth; harm with remedy; discord with harmony, the unstable with the stable. What is more, our senses allow us to enjoy and praise God's creation and thus to begin an ascent towards Him, reminded by the properties of natural things that rest and reward await the penitent. Overall, Bartholomew makes strong

contrasting statements about the coldness, instability and trouble of the physical world, set far from the sun, as in the preamble to Book 8; and about the joy and solace to be gained from things put into the world at Creation: light, stars, air, water, land, and the plants and creatures that 'adorn' these elements.

The medieval *compilatio* implied a long-established pastoral metaphor of gathering, as bees gather honey or gleaners gather corn. Bartholomew builds upon these familiar analogies to engage the reader imaginatively in the idea of earthly labour as preparation for heavenly salvation. Fragments from an implied larger narrative — in particular, those of the worker and the traveller, and of the ranks of the *familia* at their occupations, indoors and out — invite meditation upon narratives from the Christian Scriptures. Recalling the parable of the workers in the vineyard, the ox and oxherd, the bee, the vine, and the good servant all serve as models for material and spiritual labour, reward, fertility and fruition, and thus their recurring presence in the work can be seen as logical and necessary for its didactic purpose. Although this underlying logic in the work is not immediately apparent to us today, we can work towards it with the help of the glosses, and through an awareness of the parables of salvation available to Bartholomew and a segment of his readers. While the thirteenth-century marginal glosses confirm that busy clerics could find in 'Properties' a handy guide to exegesis, the narratives suggest that they could also ruminate upon the fundamental Christian themes of repentance and salvation as they dipped into the work in a spirit of contemplation. Approaching 'Properties' as a thematic and multivalent work places Book 19 in a fresh light. In the last Book, Bartholomew focuses the reader's attention on the significance of our senses and how the myriad distinctions we make in everyday experience can teach us about salvation. He brings home the message of St Paul to the Romans: 'For the invisible things of him from the creation of the world are clearly seen, being understood by the things that are made, even his eternal power and Godhead.'<sup>129</sup> Earthly products and processes remind us of spiritual ones, and lead us back into the narratives of working, feasting at the Lord's table, and travelling through life. Numbers, shapes and music remind us of heavenly order and spiritual harmony with God. It may be scarcely possible for a modern reader to elucidate Book 19 as a whole, but it calls for a more satisfactory modern interpretation as a fitting culmination, rather than a tailing-off, of 'Properties'.

While the trope of the vineyard and the beehive represented an ideal of pastoral labour appropriate for cloistered religious, those who sought to follow the apostolic example of St Francis and St Paul might, as the evidence of the *Liber de moralitatibus* suggests, identify their role-models as strong-winged cranes with loud voices, and prepare themselves likewise to make long journeys into the unknown. The explicit moralisations of the selected topics in this later adaptation of 'Properties' tend to confirm the view that the glosses in 'Properties' were made as a scholarly aid or index rather than as a full explanation of the

significance of the column text. In the next chapter we will consider 'Properties' as a map and guide to survival in the world and to salvation beyond it.

## NOTES

- <sup>1</sup> DrP, *Bartholomaei Anglici, in suos De Proprietatibus Rerum Libros, Praefatio*, pp.1–3.
- <sup>2</sup> Delisle, p.362.
- <sup>3</sup> Brockhurst, 1952, pp.33–4.
- <sup>4</sup> Duby, Georges and Cynthia Postan (trans), *Rural Economy and Society in the Medieval West*: University of South Carolina Press, 1968, pp.116 foll.
- <sup>5</sup> Hassig, 1995, p.51.
- <sup>6</sup> Hassig, 1995, pp.49–52, p.215, n.10. Klingender (pp.354 foll) illustrates the association between bees and the Virgin with twelfth-century rolls of the *Exultet*, the hymn of thanksgiving sung during the blessing of the Easter candles attributed to St Augustine, which includes a long passage in praise of the bees.
- <sup>7</sup> Illich, Ivan, *In the Vineyard of the Text: A Commentary to Hugh's Didascalicon*: University of Chicago Press, 1993, p.55 n.19.
- <sup>8</sup> Twomey, 1988, p.198.
- <sup>9</sup> Hathaway, p.25 and n.30.
- <sup>10</sup> Pope Gregory IX in the Bull *Benedicimus Deum coeli*, 1233: Landini, p.64. Duby, pp.137–41, describes the spread of viticulture in France during the eleventh–twelfth centuries and the involvement of all ranks of workers, clerical and lay, in this economy.
- <sup>11</sup> Freeman, Elizabeth, "Meaning and multi-centeredness in (postmodern) medieval historiography: the foundation history of Fountains Abbey", *Parergon* n.s.16, no.2 (1999): 43–84, pp.66–8; see also Barney, Stephen A., "'The plowshare of the tongue': the progress of a symbol from the Bible to Piers Plowman", *Medieval Studies* 35, no.263 (1973): 261–93; and Dolan, T. P., "The plowman as hero" in *Heroes and Heroines in Medieval English Literature*, edited by Leo Carruthers, 97–103, Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 1994, on agricultural imagery in medieval religious texts.
- <sup>12</sup> DrP, Bk 1, cap xvii, p.13: *Quomodo Bernardus describit Deum, (Deus est foecundans ad fructum)*.
- <sup>13</sup> DrP, *Praefatio*, p.3: *picae quae effugerunt manus metentium*.
- <sup>14</sup> DrP, Bk 17, *De proprietatibus plantarum*, cap cxviii *De Propagine*, p.900. See also Bk 15, cap xxviii *De Britannia*, p.638; Bk 14, cap xxxvii *De Monte Sion*, p.613; Bk 6, cap vii *De Matre*, p.241 and cap viii *De Filia*, p.242; Bk 19, cap viii *De Opinione eorum, qui ponunt lucem esse de substancia coloris*, p.1146.
- <sup>15</sup> DrP, Bk 18, cap xi *De ape*, pp.1013–9; Bk 12 cap iv *De Apibus*, pp.520–4; Bk 9 cap v *De aestate*, p.442; cap xxxi *De Pentecoste*, p.466.
- <sup>16</sup> DrP, Bk 1, cap xxi *De diversis Christi nominibus*, p.17. Author's paraphrases here and below.
- <sup>17</sup> DrP, Bk 3, cap xx *De Gustu*, p.71. See Illich, p.55, on the metaphors of tasting and cud-chewing (*ruminans*) used by Hugh of St Victor and others to express the experience of monastic reading as a 'carnal activity' in which God's power is felt as sweetness.
- <sup>18</sup> DrP, Bk 6, cap xviii *De bono Domino*, p.254.
- <sup>19</sup> DrP, Bk 9, cap v *De Aestate*, p.442; cap xxxi *De Pentecoste*, pp.465–6.
- <sup>20</sup> DrP, Bk, 12 cap iv *De Apibus*, pp. 510–24.
- <sup>21</sup> DrP, Bk 17, cap lxxiii *De Flagellis*, pp.849–50.
- <sup>22</sup> DrP, Bk, 18 cap xi *De Ape*, p.1013.
- <sup>23</sup> DrP, Bk 18, cap liii *De Fuco*, pp.1073–74.
- <sup>24</sup> DrP, Bk 19, cap li *De liquore*, p.2182.
- <sup>25</sup> DrP, Bk 19, caps lii–lx *De liquore in speciali et primo de melle; De Favio; De Mulso; De Medone; De Clareto; De Oxymelle; De Cera; De Cereo*, pp.1183–9.
- <sup>26</sup> Wellcome Inst. ms 115, f.79r: *Nota contra ociosos; Nota de humilitate; Nota de [ ] contemplationes; Nota que per studium reditus est ad predicationem*.
- <sup>27</sup> DrP, Bk 8, cap i *Quid sit mundus*, pp.371–2. Author's paraphrase.
- <sup>28</sup> DrP, Bk 8, cap ii *De coelorum distinctione*, pp.374–5.

<sup>29</sup> Preamble to Bk 9 *De proprietatibus Temporis*, p.434: *Et sunt sex species motus, scilicet/ generatio, corruptio, alteratio, augmentatio, diminutio, secundum locum mutatio, ut dicit idem.*

<sup>30</sup> DrP, Bk 18, *Prooemium*, p.974.

<sup>31</sup> See, for example, DrP, Bk 17, cap lxxiv *De Fructu*, p.851; cap lxxv *De Germine*, p.853; cap lxxxii *De Grana*, p.859; cap cxviii *De Propagine*, p.900; cap xxxvii *De Radice*, p.915; cap cxlix *De Spina*, p.928; cap clvi *De Semine*, p.932; cap clxxv *De Virga*, p.946; cap clxxvi *De Virgulto*, p.947.

<sup>32</sup> Chapters on specific pests occur in Books 17 and 18, and troublesome birds in Book 12; see, for example, Bk 17, cap clxxx *De Vinea*, pp. 952–3; cap cxcii *De Urtica*, pp.965–6; cap clxx *De Tribulo*, pp.942–3.

<sup>33</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098 f.198r: *Nota de mundanis et superbis; Nota de secularibus; Nota de filiis et discipulis malorum et hereticorum; Nota de operibus malorum; Nota contra hereticos; Nota de cupidis prelatiis.*

<sup>34</sup> DrP, Bk 9, cap xxxii *De Scenopegia*, pp.466–7; see also cap vii *De Autumno*, p.443–4; cap xxxiii *De Encania*, pp.467; Bk 6, cap xxix *De quiete*, pp.275–6; Bk 8, cap xlv *De Tenebra*, p.433.

<sup>35</sup> DrP, Bk 17, cap lxxiii *De Flagellis*, pp.849–50.

<sup>36</sup> DrP, Bk 6, preamble, p.231; cap xxix *De quiete*, p.275.

<sup>37</sup> Greetham, D. C., “The concept of nature in Bartholomeus Anglicus (floruit 1230)”, *Journal of the History of Ideas*, XLI (1980), pp.663–77.

<sup>38</sup> Dronke, Peter, “Bernard Silvestris, Natura, and personification” in Dronke, ed, *Intellectuals and Poets in Medieval Europe*, 41–61. Rome: Edizione de storia e letteratura, 1992.

<sup>39</sup> AV, *St Paul’s Epistle to the Romans* 1:20 (although BA would have known the Vulgate version of the Scriptures the AV is cited here for the convenience of readers). French and Cunningham, pp.210–11, 221: after BA’s time the Franciscan writers Bonaventura, Grosseteste (not a member of, but sympathetic to, the Order) and Roger Bacon relied especially on the work of Pseudo-Dionysius in their studies of the spiritual and mystical properties of light; see also Illich, p.20, on the scholastic notion of *lumen oculorum* and reading as a recovery of light lost at the Fall.

<sup>40</sup> DrP, Bk 2, cap ii *Quid sit Angelus secundum Damascenum*, p.21. See n.17 above.

<sup>41</sup> DrP Bk 3, cap iii *De Anima*, p.46: *Anima est substantia insubstantia incorporea, intellectualis, illuminationis a primo ultima relatione perceptiva. Ex qua diffinitione primam & praecipuam cognoscimus rationalis animae proprietatem, spiritus enim humanus mediante prius angelos, est divine illuminationis receptivus.*

<sup>42</sup> DrP, Bk 8, cap xl *De Luce & eius proprietatibus*, pp.425–30; cap xli *De Splendore*, p.430; cap xlii *De Lumine*, pp.430–2; cap xliii *De Radio*, pp.431–2; cap xliv *De Umbra*, pp.432–3; cap xlv *De Tenebra*, p.435.

<sup>43</sup> Brooke, Rosalind B., ed, *The Writings of Leo, Rufino and Angelo Companions of St. Francis*, Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1970, pp.6, 8, 340–1 and passim.

<sup>44</sup> Boas, George, *St. Bonaventure’s Itinerarium Mentis in Deum: The Mind’s Road to God*, Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill Educational Publishing, 1953, p.12.

<sup>45</sup> Seymour, 1992, p.4.

<sup>46</sup> See, for example, DrP, Bk 17, cap clxii *De Tabula*, p.937; cap clxiii *De Trabe*, p.938; cap clxvii *De Tigno*, p.939; cap cxxvi *De Papyro*, p.906; cap clvii *De Stipula*, p.935; cap ciii *De Myrrho*, p.880; cap xciii *De Lappate*, p.870; cap lxxv *De Frumento*, p.842; cap clxxxiii *De Uva passa*, p.955; cap cxi *De Olea*, p.887; cap cxii *De Oleo*, p.890; cap cxiii *De Oleastro*, cap cxiv *De Olere*, p.892.

<sup>47</sup> DrP, Bk 17, caps clxxvii–cxc *De Vite*, *De Vite agresti*, *De Vitulamine*, *De Vinea*, *De Uva*, *De Uva immatura*, *De Uva passa*, *De Vino*, *De Vino rubeo*, *De Vino novo*, *De Vino condito*, *De Vino acetoso*, *De Vinacio*, *De Vinaria*, pp.948–64. In cap clxxix *De Vitulamine*, p.952, BA cites the *Book of Wisdom*, Hrabanus Maurus and St Augustine on the spurious or bastard vine, and the need to be able to distinguish it from the true vine; Hugh of St Victor had used the idea of the vineyard, grapes, vine supports, sticks and building materials as a complex analogy for the reading and learning process as gathering and building, in his treatise on reading and preaching, the *Didascalicon* (cited in Hassig, 1995, p.59, n.47).

<sup>48</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.201r; see DrP, Bk 17, cap clxxxiv *De Vino*, pp.956–8.

<sup>49</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.200v; see DrP, Bk 17, cap clxxxv *De Uva*, pp.953–5.

<sup>50</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.202r; see DrP, Bk 17, cap clxxxvi *De Vino novo*, pp.960–1.

<sup>51</sup> See, for example, DrP, Bk 17, cap clii *De Sepe*, p.930; cap cliii *De Sude*, p.931; cap cxlii *De Saltu & eius proprietatibus*, p.922; cap clxxx *De Vinea*, p.952; cap cxc *De Vinaria*, p.964.

<sup>52</sup> DrP, cap clxxx *De Vinea*, p.952; cap cxc *De Vinaria*, p.964.

- <sup>53</sup> DrP, Bk 17, cap cxxxvii *De radice*, pp.915–8.
- <sup>54</sup> BNF ms 67098, f.191v: *Nota de fide et humilitate; Nota de benignitate; Nota de studio et auditu verbi divinis; Nota de fortitudine caritatis; Nota de remissione peccatoris; Nota de societate bona et mala.*
- <sup>55</sup> DrP, Bk 6, cap v *De Puero*, pp.238–40; Bk 18, cap xi *De Poledro*, pp.1058–60: *Sed in fine labori exponitur & loris, & capistris coarctatur, a matre subtrahitur, ubera fugere non permittitur, suaves cursus facere multipliciter informatur, & ut dicit Isido. lib. 14. aurigis exponitur, quadrigis & curribus subiicitur, equestri militiae deputatur, variis fortunae fortibus pauper equi filius propagatur.*
- <sup>56</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.52r: *Nota de illis qui non auratur de eternis; Nota contra amatores mundi; Nota contra ingratos; Nota contra stultos consiliarios; Nota contra garrulos; Nota contra non recipientes disciplinam.*
- <sup>57</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.223r: *Nota de subditis et noviciis; Nota de affectu subditorum esse prelati; Nota de predicatoribus; Nota quare mundus est contempnendus*
- <sup>58</sup> For example, DrP, Bk 18, cap lxxvii *De onocentaur*, p.1097.
- <sup>59</sup> For example, in "Antiphon for the Virgin II", Bowie, Fiona and Oliver Davies (eds), *Hildegard of Bingen: An Anthology*, London: Society for the Propagation of Christian Knowledge, 1992, p.7.
- <sup>60</sup> DrP, Bk 17, cap clxxv *De Virga*, p.946: *Item virga canibus est odiosa & parvulis, quia virga eorum insolentia coercetur.*
- <sup>61</sup> Hassig, 1995, pp.62–71.
- <sup>62</sup> DrP, Bk 18, cap cxii *De Vulpe*, pp.1127–8; cap ci *De Taxo*, pp.1118–9.
- <sup>63</sup> This story was popular in France and England from about 1150 and gathered additions and retellings throughout the thirteenth century. In the various versions of the story, the fox is a murderous and lecherous deceiver, perversely admirable in his cunning and bravado. He comes into regular conflict with his partner-in-crime, Grimbert the badger, with his lord, Noble the lion, and other retainers such as Brichemer the stag and Chantecler the cock: Varty, Kenneth, *Reynard the Fox; a Study of the Fox in Medieval English Art*: Leicester University Press, 1967. In Books 18 and 12, BA includes properties of the badger, fox, stag, lion and cock that together evoke these popular characterisations.
- <sup>64</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.238r: *Nota de dolosis et ypocratis; Nota de insidiis; Nota de hereticis; Nota contra gulosas.*
- <sup>65</sup> DrP, Bk 18, cap xii *De Bove*, pp.1019–21; cap xiii *De Bubulco*, p.1021.
- <sup>66</sup> Duby, pp.103–16, 201–2, discusses the evidence for the varied status of the ploughman relative to other labourers in eleventh–fourteenth-century England and France, the nature of his task, and the use of both oxen and horses as draught animals.
- <sup>67</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.214v: *Nota de pietate et compassione prelati; Nota de labore prelatorum et doctorum; Nota contra illos qui detrahunt prelati; Nota de utilitate prelatorum; Nota de martyribus; Nota de confessoribus et eorum officii; Nota de predicatoribus; Nota de predicatione.*
- <sup>68</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.215r: *Nota de officio prelati; Nota de correctione prelatorum; Nota de correctione subditorum.*
- <sup>69</sup> DrP, Bk 9, cap xxiii *De Vespera*, p.457: *Lupi a canibus in vespera vix discernuntur, vigiles & custodes propter latronum insidias & hostium insultus in muris & turribus flatuuntur, in vespera autem laborantes remunerantur & quieti exponuntur.* 'Entre chien et loup' ('between dog and wolf'), a French colloquialism for twilight, suggests that BA is using a homely idiom here.
- <sup>70</sup> See, for example, DrP, Bk 18, cap xxvi *De aliis proprietatibus Canum*, p.1041; cap vii *De Asino*, p.998.
- <sup>71</sup> Duby, pp.28–39, analyses data concerning the manorial economy and *familia* in thirteenth-century France and England.
- <sup>72</sup> DrP, Bk 6, *De proprietatibus Aetatum*, pp.231–76.
- <sup>73</sup> See Goodich, Michael, "Ancilla Dei: the servant as saint in the late middle ages" in *Women of the Medieval World*, edited by Julius Kirshner and Suzanne F. Wemple, Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1985, on the ambivalent associations of *ancilla*, the maidservant.
- <sup>74</sup> DrP, Bk 6, cap xxii *De prandio & convivio*, pp.264–5; see Woolgar, C. M., *The Great Household in Late Medieval England*: Yale University Press, 1999, Chapter 5, "The rhythms of the household". Woolgar's reconstruction of later-medieval mealtimes, *prandium* and *cena*, drawn from English household accounts, corresponds closely with the material details in *De prandio* and in cap xxiii *De cena*, pp.265–6. Reynolds, Susan, *Kingdoms and Communities in Western Europe, 900–1300*. Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1984, pp.122–54, discusses corporate life in the medieval villa, castella, manor or nucleated settlement, that functioned 'like a miniature kingdom'; Freed, pp.65–9, suggests that Magdeburg *studium*, located

inside the town walls, functioned also as a defensive and social centre for the local laity, including militia.

<sup>75</sup> DrP, Bk 6, cap xxiii *De cena*, pp.265–6.

<sup>76</sup> AV, *Esther* 1:5–8; *Gospel of St John* 14:2.

<sup>77</sup> DrP, Bk 1, cap xvi *De proprietatibus divinae essentiae*, p.12; cap xvii *Quomodo Bernardus describit Deum*, p.13; cap xx *De nominibus transsumptis*, p.15.

<sup>78</sup> DrP, Bk 2, cap xix *De malis Angelis*; cap xx *De angelis perversis*, pp.40–5.

<sup>79</sup> DrP, Bk 5, *De dispositione membrorum*: cap i *De membrorum proprietatibus in generale*, pp.114–9; cap ii *De proprietatibus capitibus*, p.122.

<sup>80</sup> DrP, Bk 6, cap xviii *De bono Domino sive dominio*, pp.253–5; see Reynolds, pp.321–3, on the collective nature of the ideal medieval manorial community and its designation by John of Salisbury (c.1115–1180) as *respublica*, a term used by BA at the start of this chapter on good lordship: *Sine enim dominio non posset stare salva respublica, nec esset humana societas pacifica vel quieta* ('For without lordship a *respublica* may not stand in safety, nor can human society be peaceful or quiet').

<sup>81</sup> DrP, Bk 6, cap xix *De Viro*, p.246: *eam dominam pecuniae suae et familiae facit, deinde non minus uxoris suae quam suiipsius causam vel etiam curam gerit*.

<sup>82</sup> Bk 6, cap xvii *De conditionibus boni servi*, pp.251–3.

<sup>83</sup> Riehle, Wolfgang, *The Middle English Mystics*, London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1981.

<sup>84</sup> Wessley, Stephen, "Female imagery: a clue to the role of Joachim's Order of Fiore" in *Women of the Medieval World*, edited by J. Kirchner and S. Wemple, 161–78. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1985; Bynum, Caroline Walker, *Jesus as mother: Studies in the spirituality of the High Middle Ages*: University of California Press, 1982. Moses, David, *Notes and Queries* 50:1 (2003), 11–13, discussing BA's apparently anomalous inclusion of *De femina* in Bk 18 on animals, takes a different approach; he finds it logical that BA closely follows Aristotle and 'defines the animal by reproductivity at its most instinctive and functional, rather than at its most reasonable level'.

<sup>85</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.52v: *Nota de Christo et prelato; Nota de doctrina magistrorum; Nota de officio prelati et subordinates*; see DrP, Bk 6, cap ix *De Nutrice*, p.242.

<sup>86</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098 f.54r: *Nota de predicatoribus et eorum officio; Nota de compassione; Nota de prelato et predatore*. See DrP, Bk 6, cap x *De Obstetrice*, pp. 242–3.

<sup>87</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.226r: *Nota de filiis in utero ecclesiae*; see DrP, Bk 18, cap xlix *De Foetu*, p.1070.

<sup>88</sup> DrP, Bk 13, cap xxvi *De piscibus*, p.580: *Quidam enim generantur ... per coitum et spermatis emissionem. Unde dic. Arist. li. 5.*

<sup>89</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.127r: *Nota de predatore..*

<sup>90</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.117r: *Nota de labore bonorum et operibus pietatis; Nota de compassione mulierum*; see DrP, Bk 12, cap xvi *De Gallo*, pp.535–6.

<sup>91</sup> BNF Lat. ms 67098, f.117v; see DrP, Bk 12, cap xviii *De Gallina*, pp.537–8.

<sup>92</sup> DrP, Bk 12, cap. xvii *De Gallo gallinaceo*, p.537.

<sup>93</sup> Goodich, 1985, p.122, notes that the nurse's position in the medieval household was that of a privileged surrogate mother in charge of other domestics.

<sup>94</sup> Readers familiar with the bestiary and teaching aviary would know the Christian iconography of the crane 'in its vigilance' against attack, especially by pigmies with arrows: see McCulloch, pp.33, 37–8, 105–6. Flocks of migratory cranes, which are large and make a strident sound, were formerly plentiful in northern Europe and illustrations suggest that people of south-east England were familiar with them: Klingender, pp.414, 491; Yapp, 1985, pp.12–13; Yapp, W. B., "Medieval knowledge of birds as shown in bestiaries", *Archives of Natural History* 14, no.2 (1987): 175–210, pp.179–81.

<sup>95</sup> DrP, Bk 12, cap xv *De Grue*, p.534. See DrP, Bk 18, cap lxxxiv *De Pygmeis*, p.1102.

<sup>96</sup> Wellcome ms 115, f.81v: *Nota de assencione domini*. St.Bonaventure writes of his own vision of the winged seraph on Monte Verna: 'I immediately saw that it signified the suspension of our father himself in contemplation': Boas, p.4.

<sup>97</sup> AV, *Acts of the Apostles* 1:9–12.

<sup>98</sup> BNF lat. 3332, ff.62v–63r. *Grus has conditiones sive proprietates invenitur breve in auctores. Primo enim ut dicit ambrose in exameron est avis magnarum alarum et fortis volatus aeris alta petens ut ideat ad quos velit peregrine per regiones. Significat prelatos potentes vel [ ] contemplationes magnos et eminentes qualiter fuit paulus qui raptus fuit ad telum celere et in paradysum ubi audivit archangeli verba quae non licet hic loqui. Scriberetur de benedicto francisco qui tam fortes et potentes alas [ ] suspendebatur multotienes*

*rara contemplationis dulcedine et etenim lucifir radiabatur fulgoribus ut indentur totus in deum abfortus et iam quiscum avis angelorum effectus.* Author's paraphrase. Square brackets indicate undeciphered text.

<sup>99</sup> AV, II Corinthians 12:1–4; R. Brooke, 1970, pp.340–1.

<sup>100</sup> Chartier, Roger, "Labourers and voyagers: from the text to the reader" in *Readers and Reading*, edited by Andrew Bennett, 132–49, London: Longman, 1995, pp.132–3.

<sup>101</sup> DrP, Bk 8, cap i *Quid sit mundus*, p.371.

<sup>102</sup> Green, R. P. H., ed, *Augustine: De Doctrina Christiana*, Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1995, pp.15–6; Zacher, Christian K., *Curiosity and Pilgrimage: the Literature of Discovery in Fourteenth Century England*, Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976, pp.42–4, 169 nn.16–26, quotes this passage (trans. Shaw 1883) and refers to other biblical texts from which medieval writers drew the symbolism of the *viator in peregrinatione*; he concludes that 'Christianity defined the unstable, mobile quality of human existence as a choice of alternative directions and goals. Impelled by curiosity, man could make the world his destination; impelled by an awareness of his true homelessness, he would make the other world his destination.'

<sup>103</sup> DrP, Bk 1, cap xxi *De diversis Christi nominibus, quibus nuncupatur*, pp.16–7.

<sup>104</sup> DrP, Bk 3, *de proprietatibus animae rationalis*, pp.45–81; cap iii *De Anima*, pp.46–8: *Quia unitur corpori, scilicet, ut motor mobili & nauta navi.*

<sup>105</sup> DrP, Bk 9 cap xxiv *De Nocte*, p.456: *in nocturnis tenebris ambulantes vel navigantes, de facili deviant, nisi eorum via per motum & siderum situm dirigatur.*

<sup>106</sup> DrP, Bk 13, cap xxi *De Mari*, p.575.

<sup>107</sup> DrP, Bk 17, cap clxx *De Tribulo*, p.942.

<sup>108</sup> DrP Bk 17 cxlii *De Salto & eius proprietatibus*, pp.922–3.

<sup>109</sup> For example, Brockhurst, 1952, p.34; also Lidaka, 1996, p. 403 on Bk 19 as 'a hodgepodge of many topics'; Twomey, 1988, p.173, describes Bk 19's contents as 'a variety of minor subjects'.

<sup>110</sup> DrP, Bk 19, caps lii–lx, *De Liquore in speciali & primo de melle; De Favo; De Muso; De Medone; De Clareto; De Oxymelle; De Cera; De Cereo*, pp.1183–9.

<sup>111</sup> DrP, Bk 19, cap lx *De Cereo*, p.1189: *Nam agens in lychnum mediante cera convertit utrunque in suam similitudinem: unde & in dispari natura mirabilem inter se habent aptissimam unionem.*

<sup>112</sup> BA sets out these at length in Bk 19, cap cxvi *De Ternario*, p.1223; cap cxxvi *De Tertia divisione totium numeri*, pp.1229–33; cap cxxviii *De Figura Trianguli*, pp.1236–8. Hassig (1995, p.57, pp.217–8) notes the absence in the bestiaries of the identification of the Virgin Mary with the chaste bee and Paschal candles, following Ambrose in *De virginibus*; BA alludes to these candles in DrP, Bk 9, cap xxx *De Paschate*, p.465: *In hac die ignis novus acquiritur, benedicitur, & ad accendendum Paschalem cereum custoditur, deinde Paschalis cereus erigitur, & a Diacono benedicitur & accenditur.* For eleventh-century ms examples of the association between bees and BVM, see Klingender, p.248 and Figs. 154, 155.

<sup>113</sup> DrP, Bk 19, cap cxiv, p.1219: *Omnia fecisti in numero, pondere & mensura, sicut dic. Sapient.cap.11.*

<sup>114</sup> DrP, Bk 19, *De rerum accidentibus, in quo coloribus, odoribus, saporibus & liquoribus agitur*, caps lxi–lxix, pp.1189–96.

<sup>115</sup> DrP, Bk 19, caps lxx–lxxiii, pp.1197–1201.

<sup>116</sup> BNF lat. ms 67098, ff.251r–252v: *Nota de dulcetudine et puritate doctrinae apostolicae; Nota de sana doctrina; Nota quod in cordibus sociorum apostolicorum est decoctum lac doctrinae; Nota quod dulci doctrina et pura anima reficitur; Nota de illis qui predicant; Nota contra malos doctrines [sic]; Nota de doctrina poetarum et philosophorum; Nota de illis qui in primo multum et sepe predicant et postea paulatim cessant.*

<sup>117</sup> DrP, Bk 19, caps lxxvii–cxiii, pp.1205–19.

<sup>118</sup> BNF ms lat. 67098, f.254v: *Nota qualia debent esse opera iustorum; Nota de humore gratie et devotionis; Nota qua vana gloria corrumpit opera.*

<sup>119</sup> *Ibid.*, ff.256r, 256v: *Nota de operibus simplicium et bonorum; Nota de potentibus mundi; Nota de Christo in corde; Nota de magnis et potentibus et eorum occultata malicia; Nota de operibus otiosis yprocratarum et hereticorum; Nota de operibus pauperibus.*

<sup>120</sup> Illich, pp.54–7.

<sup>121</sup> The first canon of the Fourth Lateran Council of 1215 declared that Christ's body and blood 'are truly contained in the sacrament of the altar under the *species* of bread and wine, the bread being transubstantiated into the body and the wine into the blood by the divine power': Rothwell, Harry, ed. *English Historical Documents 1189–1327*, Vol III. London: Eyre & Spottiswood, 1975, pp.643–4.

<sup>122</sup> DrP, Bk 19, *Prooemium*, p.1133.

The Journey of a Book

<sup>123</sup> DrP, Bk 19, cap cxxx *De mensura spacii localis*, pp.1247–8.

<sup>124</sup> Wellcome ms 115, f.192v: *Nota de multiplice via; Nota de preceptis et consiliis; Nota de via preceptorum; Nota de via religionis; Nota de via militari.*

<sup>125</sup> DrP, Bk 1, cap xvi *De prop. divina essentia*, p.12: *Deus est sphaera intellectualis, cuius centrum ubique est, circumferentia vero nusquam ... ita Deus deducit creaturas & limitat & finit eas.* Author's paraphrase.

<sup>126</sup> DrP, Bk 19, cap cxxvii *De mensura et pondere*, p.1235: *Deus, inquit [secundus philosophus] est intellectualis circulus, cuius centrum ubique est, circumferentia vero nusquam. Ex quo patet, quod ratio circuli relucet in qualibet creatura.* Seymour (1974–88 iii, p.323) identifies *philosophus* here as Hermes Trismegistos, a supposed sage and writer of antiquity.

<sup>127</sup> DrP, Bk 19, cap cxlvi *De tintinnabulo*, pp.1258–60; cap cxxxi *De musica*, p.1251.

<sup>128</sup> Louis, p.149.

<sup>129</sup> AV, *St Paul's Epistle to the Romans* 1:20.