

# Looking for Love in the Legal Discourse of Marriage



# Looking for Love in the Legal Discourse of Marriage

Renata Grossi



Australian  
National  
University

---

PRESS



Published by ANU Press  
The Australian National University  
Canberra ACT 0200, Australia  
Email: [anupress@anu.edu.au](mailto:anupress@anu.edu.au)  
This title is also available online at <http://press.anu.edu.au>

---

National Library of Australia Cataloguing-in-Publication entry

Author: Grossi, Renata, author.

Title: Looking for love in the legal discourse of marriage / Renata Grossi.

ISBN: 9781925021790 (paperback) 9781925021820 (ebook)

Subjects: Marriage.  
Love.  
Marriage law.  
Husband and wife.  
Same-sex marriage.

Dewey Number: 306.872

---

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Cover design by Nic Welbourn and layout by ANU Press

Cover image: *Ali and David asleep 12.01am-12.31* from the *Journey to Morning* Series by Blaide Lallemand and Hilary Cuerden-Clifford.

Printed by Griffin Press

This edition © 2014 ANU Press

# Contents

<b>Acknowledgements</b> . . . . .	vii
<b>Introduction</b> . . . . .	1
Framing the Questions of the Book . . . . .	3
The Importance of Law and Emotion Scholarship . . . . .	3
The Meaning of Love . . . . .	9
Outline of the Book . . . . .	15
<b>1. Love and Marriage</b> . . . . .	17
Introduction . . . . .	17
The Common Law of Marriage . . . . .	17
Nineteenth-Century Reform . . . . .	21
Twentieth-Century Reform . . . . .	23
The Meanings of Marriage: Holy Estate, Oppressive Patriarchy, Equal Love . . . . .	26
Consequences of the Love Marriage (The Feminist Critique of Love) . . . . .	31
Conclusion . . . . .	37
<b>2. The Diminishing Significance of Sexual Intercourse</b> . . . . .	39
Introduction . . . . .	39
The Old Discourse of Sex and Marriage . . . . .	40
<i>Consortium vitae</i> . . . . .	40
Conjugal Rights . . . . .	43
Matrimonial Causes Act (1959) . . . . .	45
Rape in Marriage . . . . .	46
<i>R v Clarence</i> . . . . .	47
The Changing Discourse of Sex and Marriage . . . . .	49
<i>R v L</i> and the Removal of the Marital Immunity for Rape . . . . .	49
In the Shadow of <i>R v L</i> . . . . .	52
The Case of <i>Re Kevin</i> . . . . .	54
The Legal Arguments and the Decision . . . . .	55
Sex and Marriage and Love . . . . .	59
Conclusion . . . . .	61
<b>3. The Continuing Importance of Economic Factors</b> . . . . .	63
Introduction . . . . .	63
The Economic Discourse of Marriage and the Law . . . . .	64

The Case of <i>Garcia</i> . . . . .	68
Economic Relationship . . . . .	68
Emotional Relationship . . . . .	69
The Legal Argument . . . . .	70
Impact of the Decision . . . . .	75
What is Marriage According to <i>Garcia</i> ? . . . . .	76
Conclusion . . . . .	80
<b>4. The Foregrounding of Love in the Same-Sex Marriage Debate .</b>	<b>83</b>
Introduction . . . . .	83
The Same-Sex Marriage Debate. . . . .	84
Legal Episodes in the Debate . . . . .	86
Amending the Marriage Act (1961) . . . . .	86
Civil Union Bill ACT (2006) . . . . .	88
The Struggle for the Meaning of Marriage. . . . .	91
Procreation v Love. . . . .	91
Christianity and Marriage . . . . .	95
The Struggle for the Meaning of Love . . . . .	97
The Heteronormativity of Law and Love (The Queer Critique of Love) . . . . .	99
Conclusion . . . . .	104
<b>5. Conclusion: Law, Love and Marriage . . . . .</b>	<b>107</b>
Law . . . . .	107
Love . . . . .	108
Marriage. . . . .	109
Love Again . . . . .	113
Love and Marriage. . . . .	116
Law Again . . . . .	117
<b>Bibliography . . . . .</b>	<b>119</b>
Cases . . . . .	119
Statutes . . . . .	122
Media Reports. . . . .	123
Parliamentary Debates . . . . .	129
Books and Articles. . . . .	134
<b>Index . . . . .</b>	<b>173</b>