

Through a Glass Darkly

The Social Sciences Look at the Neoliberal University

Through a Glass Darkly

The Social Sciences Look at the Neoliberal University

Edited by Margaret Thornton



Australian
National
University

P R E S S

In memory of Scott



Published by ANU Press
The Australian National University
Acton ACT 2601, Australia
Email: anupress@anu.edu.au
This title is also available online at press.anu.edu.au

National Library of Australia Cataloguing-in-Publication entry

Creator: Thornton, Margaret, author.

Title: Through a glass darkly : The social sciences look at the neoliberal university / Margaret Thornton.

ISBN: 9781925022131 (paperback) 9781925022148 (ebook)

Subjects: Education, Higher--Australia--Evaluation.
Higher education and state--Australia.
Education, Higher--Economic aspects--Australia.
Social sciences--Study and teaching (Higher)--Australia.
Educational change--Australia.

Dewey Number: 378.94

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Cover image: *Three Figures*, 1971. Carlos Merida (1891-1984)/SOMAAP. Licensed by Viscopy, 2014. Credit: Private CollectionPhoto @ Christie's Images/Bridgeman Images

Cover design and layout by ANU Press

Printed by Griffin Press

This edition © 2015 ANU Press
First edition © 2014 ANU Press



ACADEMY OF
THE SOCIAL SCIENCES
IN AUSTRALIA

Contents

Acknowledgements	xiii
Contributorsxv
Acronyms and Abbreviations	xxi
Introduction: The Retreat from the Critical.	1
Margaret Thornton	
The neoliberal embrace	2
Universities upside down	4
Wrestling with the social	7
The collection	10
Part I: Theorising the modern university	10
Part II: Markets, managers and mandarins	11
Part III: Education for the ‘real world’	13
Part IV: Conditions of knowledge production	14
Part V: Telling it how it is	14
Part VI: University futures?	15

Part I: Theorising the Modern University

1. Disinterested Scholars or Interested Parties? The Public's Investment in Self-interested Universities	19
Hannah Forsyth	
Introduction	19
Academic freedom and the idea of the university	21
The public interest and the idea of the university	27
The evolution of self-interested universities	30
Conclusions	35

2.	Critical Theory and the New University: Reflections on Time and Technology	37
	Peter Beilharz	
3.	Gendered Hierarchies of Knowledge and the Prestige Factor: How Philosophy Survives Market Rationality	49
	Fiona Jenkins	
	Philosophy and the market	50
	Market mechanisms and global values	55
	Gender equality in the orbit of 'excellence'.	58

Part II: Markets, Managers and Mandarins

4.	What's to be Explained? And is it so Bad?.	65
	Geoffrey Brennan	
	Getting the diagnosis right.	65
	What's the market got to do with it?	66
	What is to be explained?	68
	A modified institutional analysis	69
	Questions of motivation	69
	Extending the institutional array.	72
	The modern Australian university? The issue of scale.	74
5.	Higher Education 'Markets' and University Governance.	79
	Tony Aspromourgos	
	Academic markets and competition	80
	Research key performance indicators	84
	Managerialism and academic ethics	86
	Some concluding thoughts	87
6.	Transforming the Public University: Market Citizenship and Higher Education Regulatory Projects.	89
	Kanishka Jayasuriya	
	Introduction	89
	The changing mission of the public university, state projects, and citizenship	91
	Higher education regulatory state and the making of market citizenship . .	96
	Conclusion	102

7.	The State of the Universities	103
	Glenn Withers	
	History	103
	Modern Australian tertiary education	104
	Tertiary education reform in Australia	106
	Policy implementation	107
	The role of universities	109
	Future response by universities	111
	Conclusion	116

Part III: Education for the ‘Real World’

8.	The Modern University and its Transaction with Students	121
	Nigel Palmer	
	The modern university	121
	Markets	122
	Ubiquitous markets	123
	Markets capitalist, free and pure	123
	Quasi-markets	125
	Resisting ‘the market’	126
	The university–student transaction	127
	Adequate information on quality	128
	The content of the university–student transaction	129
	Knowledge	130
	The student experience	131
	Reputation and brand	133
	State and non-state rankings	134
	Resisting marketisation	136
	Managerialism and quality	136
	Conclusion	138
9.	Markets, Discipline, Students: Governing Student Conduct and Performance in the University	141
	Bruce Lindsay	
	Introduction	141
	Market(s), discipline and governance	142
	The student	145

The regulatory system for student discipline and academic exclusion . . .	148
Student discipline and misconduct	150
Academic progress	151
The evolution of purposes for regulatory controls over student conduct and performance	153
Confidence in the supply chain of cognitive capital	153
Response to motivational crisis	154
Managing permanent crisis and selective austerity	155
Conclusions	155
10. 'Selling the dream': Law School Branding and the Illusion of Choice	157
Margaret Thornton and Lucinda Shannon	
Introduction	157
Competition policy	159
The standardising imperative	160
Marketing and the illusion of choice	161
Branding and the aesthetic of work	162
Websites	164
Legal education and the 'golden ticket' to employment	165
The commercial focus	166
Skills, experiential learning and the 'real' world	167
Links with the profession and beyond	169
Internationalising the curriculum, internationalising the appeal	170
Critique	173
Conclusion	175

Part IV: Conditions of Knowledge Production

11. Disciplining Academic Women: Gender Restructuring and the Labour of Research in Entrepreneurial Universities	179
Jill Blackmore	
Research, quality and the global market	182
Gendering academic labour	183
Institutional differentiation and branding	185
Leading research: Normative science and the unbundling of academic labour	185
Implications for women as research leaders	188

Managing research and the gender division of labour	190
Reconfiguration of the academic workforce: Diversification, de-professionalisation and casualisation	191
The next generation?	192
Conclusion	193
12. Functional Dystopia: Diversity, Contestability and New Media in the Academy	195
<i>Jenny Corbett, Andrew MacIntyre and Inger Mewburn</i>	
Introduction	195
The myth of the golden age	197
Funding and freedom	200
Marketisation and technology	205
Conclusions	207

Part V: Telling It How It Is

13. A Design for Learning? A Case Study of the Hidden Costs of Curriculum and Organisational Change	211
<i>Diane Kirkby and Kerreen Reiger</i>	
Universities under fire	212
Making invisible work count: Trust, emotional labour, and leadership.	213
The La Trobe University Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences (FHUSS) Organisational Implementation Strategy (OCIS)	217
Exploring the impact of the OCIS	219
Identifying gender dynamics at work	220
Processes and leadership issues	222
Grief, loss and suppression of dissent	224
Conclusions	226
14. 'Smoking Guns': Reflections on Truth and Politics in the University	229
<i>Judith Bessant</i>	
Introduction	229
Background	230
Events leading to the judgment	231
The judgment	233
Ticking all the boxes (2004–2009)	236
Bad times begin	237

The Hayward memorandum 18 March 2010	241
Seeking assistance from the VC and WorkSafe	243
Secret surveillance and smoking guns	244
Notice of dispute: Issues Resolution Committee and the agreement	246
More secret business: Changing my title, restricting my work and salary relocation	248
Employment terminated: July 2011–April 2012.	249
Redundancy Review Committee (November 2011).	249
The trial begins	252
In lieu of a conclusion	252

Part VI: University Futures?

15. Seeking the Necessary ‘Resources of Hope’ in the Neoliberal University	259
<i>Jane Kenway, Rebecca Boden and Johannah Fahey</i>	
Beyond dirges of despair: A biographical introduction	259
The cold embrace of the neoliberal university	262
Hope and ‘structures of feeling’ in the hope-less university	265
Resources of hope	268
Spaces of hope	269
Intergenerational hope	269
Figures of hope	271
Hope-full student activism	274
Hope as collective action and civic courage	277
Hoping with others	279
Images of hope	280
Concluding thoughts	280
Bibliography	283