Appendix C

Echoes of Possibility: Did George Bouchier Worgan Purchase a Square Piano by John Broadwood in 1783?

Broadwood company records show that on Thursday, 10 April 1783, a ‘Mr Worgan’ purchased one of their square pianos.¹ John Broadwood’s workbook for the period 1771–85 (held in the Bodleian Library, Oxford)² contains the following straightforward statement: ‘Mr Worgan bought a piano’³ (because Broadwood began making grand pianos in 1784, the instrument purchased in 1783 was a square piano). Was this ‘Mr Worgan’ Dr John Worgan or George Bouchier Worgan?

‘Mr Worgan’ is Dr John Worgan

George Bouchier’s illustrious father, John Worgan,⁴ gained his doctorate in music from Cambridge University in 1775—that is, eight years before the unidentified Mr Worgan acquired his square piano from John Broadwood’s workshop. Following the conferring of his doctoral degree, John Worgan consistently used the prefix ‘Dr’.⁵ Dr Worgan’s reputation as a virtuoso organist and harpsichordist was such that any person whose vocation involved commercial dealings with London-based professional musicians—a trader such as John Broadwood—would have been aware of his status. (In 1793, John Wilkes included Dr Worgan’s household as one of London’s ‘families of distinction’.)⁶ For John Broadwood to not refer to John Worgan as ‘Doctor’ would not only have seriously breeched

---

¹ See Clarke, ‘Australian Colonial Dance’. See also Goold, Mr. Langshaw’s Square Piano, p. 190. In the Broadwood archive, the piano sold to ‘Mr Worgan’ is not allocated a serial number. ‘Pianos made before 1784, though dated on the [nameboard] … were not usually marked with a serial number inside.’ Cole, Broadwood Square Pianos, p. 179. ‘The earliest serial number ever recorded in the Broadwood archive is No. 206, sold to Mrs. Northey in April 1784 … No serial number below 200 has ever been reported on a surviving example, so maybe when beginning a serial system Broadwood opted to commence at 200, knowing that there had been many more than a hundred dispatched already.’ Ibid., p. 61.


⁴ See ‘George Worgan’s Father, Dr John Worgan’, in Chapter 3, Volume 1 of this publication.

⁵ See, for example, the title page from Dr John Worgan’s Pieces for the Harpsichord. See Plate 55. See also Boyle, The Fashionable Court Guide, p. 164: ‘Worgan, Dr. 65, lower gower-street.’ See also the title page of Worgan, Pieces for the Harp … by Dr. Worgan.

⁶ Wilkes, Directory to the Nobility, Gentry, and Families of Distinction, p. 50.
the bounds of commonly upheld propriety, it would also have thwarted a habit arising from the normal dictates of protocol. It seems unlikely that the Mr Worgan listed in the Broadwood archives is George Bouchier's father, Dr John Worgan.

‘Mr Worgan’ is One of Dr John Worgan’s Professional Musician Sons

Of Dr John Worgan’s five surviving sons, three became professional musicians: Richard (1759–1812), James (1762–1801) and Thomas Danvers (1773–1832). In 1783, only two of these brothers would have been old enough, and perhaps financially secure enough (very little is known about their lives), to independently purchase a Broadwood square piano: Richard was 24 and James, 21. Perhaps one of these two musicians was the unidentified Mr Worgan listed in Broadwood’s journal; or perhaps he was the then 26-year-old George Bouchier. It is reasonable to propose that Dr John Worgan gave financial assistance to whichever of his sons purchased the piano; then again, it is just as reasonable to conjecture that one of Dr Worgan’s sons purchased the instrument either for, or on behalf of, their father. There are simply too many unanswerable questions for a definitive understanding to be reached.

‘Mr Worgan’ is George Bouchier

George Bouchier Worgan confessed that although he had always been drawn towards agriculture, his father decided that he should have a career in medicine: ‘My very earliest inclinations and propensities led me to the study and pursuit of agriculture … but I had a dear and honoured Father, whose wish was to bring me up to the defective Art of Physic, his Will, was mine!’

During George Bouchier’s formative years, the activities of the Worgan household would have been geared primarily to music. The sounds of music making, arising from practising, teaching and composing, would have filled the home. Within such a context, and from their earliest days, Dr Worgan’s children would have been surrounded by music. Doubtless, George Bouchier ‘was taught music, played music, and probably wrote music as soon as he was able’.

7 The use of the prefix ‘Dr’ by contemporaneous writers in relation to John Worgan can, for example, be found in the writings of Richard Mackenzie Bacon, Patrick Boyle, Dr Charles Burney, Thomas Busby, Reverend Richard Cecil, Alexandre Choron, John Langshaw, John S. Sainsbury, Arthur Bowes Smyth, Richard John Samuel Stevens and Sylvanus Urban.
8 Arthur Young Papers, British Library. I am indebted to Robert Clarke for this information, which comes from his preparatory research for Working the Forge.
9 Kenyon, ‘Bach for All’.
Although there are no extant critiques of George Worgan’s pianistic abilities, it is not surprising that, having been raised in a musically stimulating environment and being (as a navy surgeon) financially self-sufficient, he purchased a piano and brought it with him on his voyage to Botany Bay.

If the Mr Worgan listed in Broadwood’s journal is George Bouchier then George’s early naval career path has ramifications in relation to his ability to afford to buy a Broadwood square piano in 1783:

- 1775: George Bouchier joins the British Navy and serves as a Surgeon’s Mate on the hospital ship Tiger
- 1778–79: George Bouchier serves as a Surgeon’s Second Mate
- 1779: George Bouchier is certified as a Surgeon Fifth Rate
- 1780–82: George Bouchier serves on board the hospital ship Pilote
- 1783–85: George Bouchier is unaccounted for; perhaps he worked as a naval surgeon (on the Portsmouth guardship Ganges) or was on some sort of detached list (naval surgeons did not enjoy retirement on half-pay at the time, so if George was not working, his income would have been severely restricted).

Whilst serving on board the hospital ship Pilote, George Bouchier may have put aside part of his income in order to save for the purchase of a piano. (The fact that George Bouchier was capable of financial prudence is suggested by his apparently having saved enough money to pay for the construction of Wadeland House in 1836.) In order to buy a square piano from John Broadwood in 1783, Worgan would have had to part with a possible one-third to one-fifth of his 1780–82 annual income—a not inconsiderable proportion of his earnings.

In 1783, Broadwood square pianos were not particularly cheap compared with the prices of those of some other makers. During the mid-1780s, the usual cost of a square piano made in London ranged between 15 and 20 guineas (£15–21)—approximately one-fifteenth of an annual middle-class income. The standard price for a Broadwood square piano, £21, lay at the top of this range.
It is reasonable to assume therefore that price was not the prime factor that influenced ‘Mr Worgan’ to buy an instrument from John Broadwood in early April 1783.

Working on board the moored *Pilote* between 1780 and 1782 (or the *Ganges* in 1783) provided a context within which George Bouchier may have, with relative ease, arranged to travel to London in order to view instruments; he may even have engaged a proxy to act on his behalf in order to commission or purchase a piano, which was not uncommon in such circumstances.19 If George Bouchier undertook such a journey to London, he may upon arrival have stayed at his father’s house at 7 Millman Street.20 Assuming that he intended to purchase an instrument from John Broadwood, this address, somewhat inconveniently, was located more than 40 blocks from Broadwood’s workshop at 33 Great Pulteney Street, Golden Square.21

It is reasonable to assume that prior to his departure for Sydney Cove on Sunday, 13 May 1787, George Bouchier lived for a while at Portsmouth22 (‘in 1786 he had been serving … on the Portsmouth guardship *Ganges* and was discharged to *Sirius* on [Wednesday,] 1 November’23 1786). A journey to London from Portsmouth in order to commission or purchase a piano would not have been too difficult an endeavour to arrange—although, because of the importance of, and the logistical complexities arising from, his work prior to the First Fleet’s departure, it is unlikely that he would have been granted leave from the *Sirius*.

If George Bouchier made a visit to London from Portsmouth with the intention of purchasing a piano, he may, upon arrival, have stayed at his father’s house, then at 40 Rathbone Place24 (Dr Worgan moved from 7 Millman Street to Rathbone Place after 1780, probably about 1784–85).25 Assuming George Bouchier was interested in buying a piano from John Broadwood, Broadwood’s workshop was situated only seven blocks or so to the south of Rathbone Place.

Although George Bouchier is unaccounted for between 1783 and 1785,26 it is reasonable to conjecture that during this period he worked as a naval surgeon

---

19 See ibid., p. 54.
21 See ‘Pultney Str’, in ibid., Map Reference 27.
22 I am indebted to Robert Clarke for this information, which comes from his preparatory research for Working the Forge. See also ‘Significant Events in George Bouchier Worgan’s Life: Summary’ in Chapter 12, Volume 1 of this publication.
25 See ‘Sources of Information’, in Appendix B, this volume.
26 He may have been on some sort of detached list. I am indebted to Robert Clarke for this information, which comes from his preparatory research for Working the Forge.
'on the Portsmouth guardship Ganges'. Within this context, George Bouchier may have journeyed from Portsmouth to London to purchase a piano from John Broadwood—after all, Broadwood's unidentified Mr Worgan acquired a square piano in 1783.

The Surname ‘Worgan’ in Eighteenth-Century London

In eighteenth and early nineteenth-century London, the surname Worgan, although not commonly encountered, was not unheard of. The name crops up in many places—for example: in 1702, ‘John Worgan Citizen and Pewterer of London’, in 1721, ‘John Worgan’ (possibly the son of the aforementioned John Worgan); in 1721, ‘William Worgan … charged by William Worgan his father on oath for being idle and disorderly by taking ill courses and running away from his master’, in 1742, ‘John Worgan … Clothworker Saint Dunstan’s in the East, City of London’, in 1743, ‘John Worgan … Grocer … London’; in 1757, ‘Mr. Thomas Worgan, Linen-draper in the Borough of Southwark’; in 1764, ‘John Worgan … Coffeeman … of Cooper’s Court Cornhill, London’; in 1768, ‘Worgan John … Cook … near the Bank’ (the same person as ‘Mr. Worgan, at the White Horse, Threadneedle-Street’ in 1776); in 1777, ‘Mr. Worgan, Carpenter’; in 1778, ‘Mr. Worgan … butcher, No. 95, Cannon-street, near Walbrook’ (the same person as ‘William Worgan … Butcher … City of London’ in 1797); and in 1809, ‘John Worgan, Planter, London’. It is reasonable to assume that for some of these people or their children,

34 The London Gazette, 3 July 1764, p. 3.
36 See ‘Lost Last Tuesday Morning’, advertisement in The Daily Advertiser, 10 May 1776, No. 14163.
37 See ‘To Be Sold by Auction by Mr. Skinner’, advertisement in The Daily Advertiser, 14 November 1777, No. 14637.
38 See ‘Wants a Place, a Widow, of a Middle Age’, advertisement in The Gazetteer and New Daily Advertiser, 23 January 1778, No. 15271.
professional-class—that is, middle-class—aspirations, along with an annual income to match, resulted in them purchasing one of the visible symbols of respectability: a square piano. (Domestic music making—‘a little dance music after dinner’, an accompanied sonata ‘or a song or two in the family circle—was considered unexceptional and many wealthy tradespeople’ bought pianos and looked for tuition.) In the absence of evidence to the contrary, it is possible that the Mr Worgan listed in John Broadwood’s journal was not in any way connected with Dr John Worgan’s family.

Why Did ‘Mr Worgan’ Buy a Broadwood Square Piano?

‘Mr Worgan’ elected to purchase a Broadwood piano, rather than an instrument produced by one of the 31 other piano makers trading in London at the time. What might have been some of the factors that influenced Mr Worgan’s decision?

1. Mutations

Perhaps Mr Worgan was not a fan of mutated sound and/or its associations with France. During the late eighteenth century, the French style of piano playing exploited changes in timbre achieved using pedal-operated mutations. With this performance predilection in mind, several London piano makers equipped their instruments (for customers in Paris) with at least three, if not four, pedals. (This type of piano is well represented, for example, by the surviving instruments of Schoene.) In all likelihood, Broadwood’s unidentified Mr Worgan was English. Perhaps Mr Worgan’s nationalistic sensibilities were offended by any piano that allowed for the expression of a French sonic aesthetic; after all, ‘before they learn there is a God’, said a contemporaneous German describing the Georgian English, ‘they learn there are Frenchmen to be detested’.

‘When an 18th century [English] square piano is seen to have a pedal, it is most likely to be for [a nag’s head] swell.’ In some instances, a pedal may operate the raising of dampers; the earliest known example of a pedal-operated damper-
Appendix C

raising mechanism on a square piano is an instrument dated 1775, by Adam Beyer. On late eighteenth-century English square pianos, the pedal for the nag’s head swell is most commonly located towards the right-hand side.

The nag’s head swell was not the only mutation exploited by late eighteenth-century English square piano makers. The harp (buff) stop was ‘especially prevalent in English square pianos between 1770–1790’.49 Extant square pianos incorporating a harp stop operated by a pedal rather than by a hand-lever—for example, instruments by Christopher Ganer—suggest that the harp stop may have been operated by a pedal under the left foot. Commonly, the harp stop pedal was positioned to the left-hand side of the instrument and hinged to a stretcher near the floor between the piano’s left-hand legs. Whatever particular mechanism the pedal operated, the mechanism was usually attached to the pedal via a cord. For late eighteenth-century English square pianos, the presence of pedal-operated sound-modifying mechanisms ‘either through a Nag’s Head Swell or a Harp (Buff) Stop reflects’ one of the music-aesthetic fashions prevalent ‘until at least 1810’.50

In comparison, the sonic palette of John Broadwood’s square pianos was less overtly colourful. Broadwood never followed the French sound-modifying fashion,51 instead making a type of piano that the public came ‘to recognize as distinctively Broadwood’s’.52

2. Broadwood’s Emerging Reputation for Fine Craftsmanship

Apart from a possible aversion to mutated sounds (and/or their French associations), ‘Mr Worgan’ may have decided to acquire a Broadwood square piano because he was aware of Broadwood’s growing reputation for consistently high-quality workmanship. A review of Broadwood’s square piano output prior to 1783 reveals his increasing credibility as a fine maker: in 1780 (when Broadwood began ‘his change to piano production’),53 ‘he sold only six pianos; in 1781 ten’; in 1782 ‘about twenty (assuming continuous output, this represents an average of one instrument completed ca every 18 days); in 1783 forty five’ (on average, one square piano made every eight days).54 The expansion of Broadwood’s output continued apace: records in the Broadwood archive show that in 1784, he sold 100 square pianos (an average of one square piano completed every three days), the revenue from which was equal to that

---

49 Cole, *The Pianoforte in the Classical Era*, p. 378. See also ‘Harp Stop (Buff Stop)’, in Appendix Q, this volume.
52 Ibid., p. 58.
53 ‘So, the Big Question, When Did Broadwood Begin Making Pianos?’ in M. Cole, ‘John Broadwood’, in *Square Pianos* [n.d.].
from harpsichords.55 ‘At least five’ Broadwood square ‘pianos from 1784 are known’—serial numbers 200 (Colt Collection), 204 and 206 (Michael Cole), 219 (A. Beurmann), 283—‘and at least two (204 and 206) completely restored by Michael Cole’.56

John Broadwood’s journal for 1771–85 shows that people of consequence who purchased pianos from him included: Lord Thomas Bruce, Seventh Earl of Elgin (1766–1841);57 John Montagu, Fourth Earl of Sandwich (1718–92);58 Charles, Duke of Queensborough;59 the Duchess of Bedford;60 Mary Howard, Duchess of Norfolk (ca 1712–73); Baron Augher;61 Robert Clive, First Baron Clive; John Spencer, First Earl Spencer (1734–83); Lady Edgecumbe;62 Lady Howe;63 Lady Chatrian Manning;64 Lady Frances Mayne;65 Lady Pembroke;66 Lady Tufton;67 Admiral Hugh Piggot (1722–92); David Garrick (1717–79); Dr Samuel Johnson (1709–84); Thomas Gainsborough (1727–88); Josiah Wedgwood; and Mrs Horton (Queen Charlotte’s cake baker).68

During the 1790s, the sheer scale of Broadwood’s square piano output is astonishing: in 1794, he sold 169 square pianos (an average of one instrument completed every 2.2 days), and in 1795, more than 200 (on average, one square piano made every 1.8 days).69

Broadwood was a canny Scotsman. A shrewd business strategy aided in the spread of his reputation. Of the 45 square pianos Broadwood sold in 1783,

twenty-two of them went to trade customers at a thumping twenty-five percent discount … Broadwood transformed his trading position by selling [part of his] … output at discount prices to others, who would be selling them on to the public, or else to music professionals—clients who could be expected to provide Broadwood with further orders.70

55 See ibid., p. 53.
58 See ibid., p. 6.
59 See Burnett, Company of Pianos, p. 47.
61 See ibid., p. 6.
62 See ibid., p. 6.
63 Entry dated Tuesday, 18 March 1777. See ibid., pp. 4–5.
65 See ibid., p. 6.
66 Entry dated Friday, 13 October 1780. See ibid., p. 4.
68 See Goold, Mr. Langshaw’s Square Piano, p. 116.
69 See Cole, Broadwood Square Pianos, p. 61.
70 Ibid., p. 56.
It is reasonable to assume that ‘Mr Worgan’, as a result of Broadwood’s astute business strategy and emerging reputation for quality workmanship, was at least, if not acutely, aware of the Broadwood name.

3. Broadwood’s 1783 Patent

Was Mr Worgan’s decision to buy a Broadwood square piano influenced by innovative design features? In 1783, Broadwood submitted a patent application in which he described several supposedly new square piano design features. These design features included the relocation (reversal) of 

wrestpins and hitchpins (which ... had been previously utilized by Charles Trute) ... brass under-dampers (previously used by George Froeschle): and curiously, the installation of a second soundboard, beneath the ordinary one and connected to it by a spruce stick ... This feature he ... claimed as the chief among his ‘improvements’ to the pianoforte, but he did not persist with this beyond a year and a half. Also shown in the patent is a pedal for disengaging his brass dampers, and another for providing a harp stop. Neither was in itself a novelty, and neither was frequently incorporated in his subsequent production.71

The rights to Broadwood’s patent were granted in November 1783. It appears that before 1783, Broadwood had made instruments that incorporated some of the design features described in his 1783 patent. A square piano by Broadwood dated 1780, housed in the Royal Ontario Museum, Toronto, has an action that is ‘exactly the same as that patented by John Broadwood in 1783, having straight brass under dampers, hammers with guide pins, and all wrestpins placed at the rear’.72 Given that Broadwood sold a square piano to Mr Worgan on 10 April 1783, one assumes that Broadwood’s pre-existing ‘new’ patented design features may have played a role in enticing Mr Worgan to buy an instrument from Broadwood.

Extant 1783 Broadwood Square Pianos

Michael Cole, the eminent expert on Broadwood square pianos, is aware of only two extant Broadwood square pianos made in 1783. One is currently owned by a Dr Turner in England73 (Plates 400, 400a, 400b), whilst the other is housed in the Stewart Symonds Collection, in Ermington, Sydney.

---

71 Ibid., p. 58.
72 Ibid., p. 117.
73 I am indebted to Lucy Coad, eminent square piano restorer, for this information.
Dr Turner’s 1783 Broadwood Square Piano

Dr Turner’s instrument was purchased about 20 years ago by the distinguished fortepiano dealer and aficionado Andrew Lancaster,

from a house clearance person who was going to use it for the timber. It was most unusual in that the hitch pins were pinned directly into the soundboard rather than into a raised hitch pin rail … [The nameboard inscription date had] been erased … This was done in order to be able to sell the piano as being newer than it was … But the date was inside the piano too.⁷⁴

Subsequently, approximately 15 years ago, the instrument was sold at auction, its provenance unknown.⁷⁵

Plate 400 Square piano by John Broadwood (1732–1812) (London, 1783).

Source: Reproduced with permission of Andrew Lancaster. Photo by Andrew Lancaster.

---

⁷⁴ Email from Andrew Lancaster to the author, 12 December 2012.
⁷⁵ I am indebted to Lucy Coad for this information.
Plate 400a Square piano by John Broadwood (1732–1812) (London, 1783).

Source: Reproduced with permission of Lucy Coad. Photo by Lucy Coad.

Plate 400b Square piano by John Broadwood (1732–1812) (London, 1783): nameboard inscription.

Source: Reproduced with permission of Lucy Coad. Photo by Lucy Coad.
Stewart Symonds’ 1783 Broadwood Square Piano

According to information contained in Stewart Symonds’ handwritten catalogue of his keyboard instrument collection, his 1783 Broadwood square piano was once owned by a ‘private family outside Glasgow’ (Plates 400c and 400d). This represents the extent of provenance information known by Symonds relating to this particular instrument, and is derived from comments made to Symonds by the eminent antiques dealer, keyboard instrument enthusiast and gentleman of Sydney William Bradshaw, who sold the piano to Symonds. The mention of Glasgow should come as no surprise, because the Scotsman ‘John Broadwood supplied music shops everywhere, but most plentifully in Scotland’. Symonds hypothesises that Bradshaw acquired the piano in England from the historical musical instruments dealer Tony Bingham. Paul Kenny, the eminent antiques importer and Bradshaw’s close friend and colleague, recalls that he shipped the instrument from England to Australia for Bradshaw.

Conclusion

It is currently impossible to identify with any certainty the ‘Mr Worgan’ who purchased a square piano from John Broadwood on Thursday, 10 April 1783. The application of ‘Ockham’s razor’ to the problem may, however, be appropriate.

If George Bouchier was the unidentified Mr Worgan, was the Broadwood square piano the instrument that he took with him on board the Sirius, bound for Botany Bay? Attractive as an affirmative answer to this question may be, no evidence exists that proves this to be the case.

Although Broadwood’s journal for 1771–85 contains the ‘names [of] numerous buyers of [square] pianos in 1783’, unfortunately, ‘there is no continuing provenance for these instruments’. The pianos ‘are not numbered, and the passage from … buyer to the subsequent owners is impossible to guess’. As a consequence, it cannot be conclusively ascertained if one of the two extant 1783 Broadwood square pianos is the First Fleet piano.

---

76 See ‘Discovery’, in Introduction, Volume 1 of this publication.
78 Email from Paul Kenny to the author, 3 December 2013.
79 Email from Michael Cole to the author, 22 November 2012.
Plate 400c ‘Catalogue of the Stewart Symonds Keyboard Instrument Collection’: entry for a square piano by John Broadwood (fl. 1775–94) (London, 1783)—page one of two.

Source: Stewart Symonds Collection, Sydney. Reproduced with permission of Stewart Symonds. Photo by the author.

Source: Stewart Symonds Collection, Sydney. Reproduced with permission of Stewart Symonds. Photo by the author.