BOOK REVIEWS

Pp. viii + 424. $18.95 h.b. $10.95 p.b.

These 28 chapters were papers presented to a symposium of Institute members in 1974 on ‘problems inherent in the situation of Aborigines adapting to Australian-European society’ (p. vii). The main focus was on traditionally-oriented groups — on ‘changing frames of reference’, education, urban situations, law and politics. The symposium had marked a new emphasis by the Institute on the study of social change. Professor Berndt writes that there is to be a ‘new anthropology’, in terms which seem to stake a special claim for the anthropologist to be the broker between the Aboriginal groups and the government. But as the recent history of the Northern Land Council shows, Aborigines are already depending on other kinds of special competence, and they speak for themselves (on issues like Aurukun). As this book shows, law, history, economics, administrative and political studies have important kinds of help to give; all mainly to provide knowledge to Aborigines of what they are up against. I think no Aboriginal anthropologist has yet studied the roots of anti-Aboriginal prejudice, in the public and in the bureaucracy, with which they have to deal. Professor Berndt is right when he argues that bureaucratic promotion of ‘development’ reduces Aboriginal choices — that ‘the bonds of bureaucratization have them virtually helpless’ (p. x). But perhaps some anthropologists, and some public servants working in the field, hold an ideal of ‘partnership’, which proved pointless in the worldwide anticolonial movement, with no more appeal to the colonised than ‘trusteeship’.

Dr C.H. Berndt, in the concluding chapter, sees the permanent location of bureaucrats with Aboriginal groups as leading to ever deeper interference hastening social disintegration. ‘The line between “influencing” and directing’, she writes, ‘is quite thin’ (p. 410). This was a common feature of colonial administration — that the people had no way of distinguishing between a suggestion and a command backed by the whole power of the government. Dr Berndt argues that the very adoption of the new western structures for protection of a separate identity ensure that ‘the content of that identity ... will ... be very different’ (p. 410).

Kenneth Maddock tells of a group which has been making its own adaptations, in marriage custom, economic relationships, and in the adjustment of the ceremonial programme to the requirements of employment. Eric Kolig shows how a growing Aboriginal identity was rooted in common resistance to ‘white’ influences; and that a very non-material emphasis in the old culture has helped its survival (so far) in the face of material disaster. Susan Tod Woenne tells how establishment of the Docker River settlement not only attracted those who belonged to the country, but stimulated ‘gradual extension of social, ritual and territorial networks’ (p. 62). The old men of Jigalong, writes Robert Tonkinson, use the Council as a buffer against government, while they try to deal with alcoholism, breakdown of social controls and conflict with Aboriginal neighbours. Noel Wallace describes the effects of cash, women’s employment and schooling of children on the ritual which is the basis of man’s estate, so that the Pitjantjatjara youth follow those of other areas into the ‘cultural abyss’. The people know well that they need autonomy and their own land. Wallace shows also how moves to decentralisation are leading to the growth of large centres of population at or near especially sacred sites. Lee Sackett describes the devastating impact of the pub at Wiluna on observance of the Law, which is maintained through pressure from Law-abiding visitors. Isobel White explains why the Yalata people prefer freedom of movement to possession of houses. W.J. Gray writes that Aboriginal movement to

* The Review Editor and Editorial Board considered that this volume merited discussion by reviewers who would assess its value to Aboriginal studies, and to the broader field of Australian history. We are grateful to C.D. Rowley and Beverley Kingston for undertaking the task.
the outstations in Arnhem Land frustrated government expectations that the settlements there would develop into towns. J.K. Doolan shows how a safe home base of their own has enabled the Gurindji to decide which of the pastoralists applying for their labour should be assisted — or rejected.

Now in each of these cases there is a degree of autonomous decision-making, and often in opposition to expectations of their advisers. Nicolas Peterson's chapter deals with Aboriginal economic decisions in the Central Reserve. While in the main they are target workers, they do not yet "value material capital more highly than social capital" (p. 145) — a perceptive comment which goes deep. John Taylor describes malnutrition arising from the purchase of western supermarket food in the store. Cash opens up a wide world of never ending desires. The women buy industrial goods at the expense of nutrition, and try to save on the food to pay the rent. Both papers raise a central problem in the impact of cash on traditional subsistence economies. But this is the preliminary 'trade store' boundary of the cash economy. What chance have people in this predicament against international mining companies without effective government protection?

The remaining papers were offered mainly by specialists other than anthropologists. Klaus-Peter Koepping confirms in his study of Cherbourg settlement that not much has changed in the Aboriginal predicament in Queensland, with officialdom so all-powerful that he had to go through the system for information. Keith Cole tells how, after trying for decades to get the mission dwellers in Arnhem Land to give up their systems of belief, the Anglican missions came to concede that such systems may be seen as 'preparatory' to conversion instead of enemy propaganda. C.F. Makin discusses schools and other 'agents of change'. While seeming to know very well that 'development' requires autonomy, he limits his conclusions to the area of education. Robert McKeich, also an educationist, writes of the world of the part-Aboriginal. Only they, he says, can 'tell it as it is'. But since then we have had Kevin Gilbert's Living Black, and the writings of others. The publication of such works of protest form part of a growing world literature, largely in English, and marks the emergence of the entrapped minorities into national and international politics.

In a hard-nosed and pessimistic paper R.G. Hausfeld discusses the relationship of minority culture membership to health. His hypothesis is that groups which cannot organise their lives in accordance with their own values will be marked by high morbidity and by high incidence of emotional disturbance. A. - K. Eckermann found that Aborigines in one Queensland town married and interacted with white working class families. But even in the mixed marriages they retained Aboriginal child raising customs; and they keep their own folk-lore and history. Margaret Valadian and Diane Barwick defend a workshop for Aborigines they organised in 1971, which seems to have been a very sensible one, but was not approved by some professional educators. Fay Gale's paper, based on her research for the Poverty Survey, shows how the values of the extended family are reinforced in Adelaide by economic necessity. The 'family unit' saves money by sharing a house with kindred units. "Is it really legitimate" she asks, "to discuss such kinship ties solely in terms of traditional social values?" (p. 331).

There are two very useful chapters on Aborigines and the western law. Dorothy Parker travelled Perth and rural Western Australia with police officers, and found many ignorant and prone to disregard the law. (How easily they get away with this has been illustrated by the findings of the inquiry into the Skull Creek incident.) As for the crime statistics, they refer mainly to those 'without social or political power, who have been labelled "criminals" by social agents who possess too much power' (p. 350). The late Elizabeth Eggleston advocated an Aboriginal Legal Service with the Aborigines in control. Her paper was revolutionary in its attitude to the pecking order in Australian professional society, as is her 1976 book; but as quietly and logically
argued. Colin Tatz, the only contributor from political science, could still say that all the important decisions were being made by whites: that even in the Institute of Aboriginal Studies it was ‘plain who are the students and who are the studied’. There is some useful comment in this chapter on the politics of the National Aboriginal Consultative Committee; on the Aboriginal moves to have a bargaining rather than an advisory role in the relationship of their national body with government. (This will always be resisted by the bureaucracy with vested interests in Aboriginal Affairs). Tatz warns that the likely alternative to effective institutions to deal with this whole problem will be violence. One of the less informed declarations of a recent Commonwealth Minister was that violence was abhorrent to both traditions — white and black; which illustrated the common tendency to look for solutions without knowing what is the problem.

No publication just like this will be possible again. Too much has happened since the 1974 meeting; and within the little world of the Institute it was happening then. In this volume, valuable as it certainly is, the Aboriginal group or person is the object of study. Now the object has become the participant, at least in politics; and more and more he sees as the problem not his unfortunate fellows, but the whites. Perhaps some day there will be serious studies by Aboriginal anthropologists of white prejudice, as part of the wider question of what makes white people act as they do.

C.D. ROWLEY

Aborigines and change: Australia in the ‘70s is a collection of papers (twenty-eight in all) edited out of a symposium in 1974 of the Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies. They range from some fairly abstruse anthropological studies through some mixed history and educational theory to some very plain accounts of recent investigations into specific problem areas such as the extent of poverty among the urban Aboriginal population and the role of the Aboriginal Legal Aid services. There is no doubt that to the non-expert, but I hope, intelligent, interested, and sympathetic reader whom I am thought possibly to resemble, the plainer papers are more informative and accessible than those with complicated diagrams. But reading through the whole collection — which I expect is a task few non-experts will feel obliged to set themselves — my overall reaction was one of puzzled disquiet.

To begin, although this probably reflects my preoccupations as a teacher of Australian history, it is not easy from reading through these papers to get any clear idea of the nature and extent of change in the Aboriginal community in the 1970s despite the sub-title. One of the reasons for this is clearly that many of the papers were in fact written in or before 1974 and based on research or fieldwork done in the sixties or even earlier. There are frequent allusions to the upheavals in Australian politics in the early seventies and some editorial footnotes drawing attention to developments post-1974, but it was probably too early when the book went to press for much of an assessment to be made of the effects of another round of changes in government policy. Even so, a really usable account of change at policy level and expert guidance for interpreting official policy and administrative changes are wanting.

The collection seems rather piecemeal in other respects as well. Perhaps half the papers are research reports dealing with a particular group or settlement in great detail, and therefore involving only a couple of hundred individuals. (Would that the future historian of European society in Australia had so much detailed observation piling up!) The problem comes with the grandiose frameworks in which such tiny communities are set, or the dubious research propositions their every human activity is seen to substantiate. As a grab-bag of the research preoccupations of the late sixties, this may be as representative a sample as any, but to
BOOK REVIEWS

the outsider it also raises a few doubts about the perspective, purpose, and views of many of the contributors on the significance of their work. And here, the piece by Michael Howard, 'Aboriginal political change in an urban setting: the N.A.C.C. election in Perth' takes the cake. I commend his approach to all political scientists who have ever wished to know 'why the various candidates received as many votes as they did, as well as why they were not able to garner more.' (p. 379). As far as I can tell, however, the same approach applied to a society with which I am fairly familiar produces nonsense.

The Aborigines, to judge from many of the papers collected here, are in danger, not only from white society, but also from those who investigate them. We have long since learned to be cautious about the findings of well-meaning social investigators in the nineteenth century who first raised the cry about poverty and unemployment among the working classes. There may be a powerful debate going on about the proprieties of research which is both intrusive and potentially powerful and influential, but there is not much evidence of it here, except perhaps for a tendency to fierce conclusions which would not be tolerated by a more articulate group of subjects and an assumption of values which would at least be ridiculed. For example, there are some intriguing and valuable accounts of changes in Aboriginal society in Arnhem Land and Central Australia which elsewhere in human society have never been observed and must be inferred from the archaeological remains. But is it necessary to imply that such changes are bad or to suggest ways of countering them? Likewise, after reading descriptions of changes that have taken place in religious ceremonies and observance, for example the use of modern transport to move from site to site and the adaptation of modern materials for ritual purposes, I was reminded of plane-loads of Cardinals converging on Rome twice in two months to sit on plastic chairs and cast their ballots with biros. There are those, of course, who abhor these changes from traditional practice, but the point is surely that change is an indicator of survival.

In her conclusion Catherine Berndt calls on the Aborigines to make more use of research and of the people who do the research. She is right, except that a considerable amount of the research reported here is unusable, either because it is in impenetrable mumbo-jumbo, or else because it addresses itself to the false and fashionable questions of the rarefied journals. It also seems rather patronising and exploitative. I cannot be sure of this, but I do know how it feels to have a male 'expert' explain to me why I am as I am. I also know how it feels to be studied as a rare phenomenon for the sake of someone else's research — no more questionnaires on the role or status of female academics will be answered by me except on payment of an appropriate fee.

I have been unable to draw out of all these papers any clear guidelines as to where the scholarly experts closest to the Aborigines stand on the big questions of coexistence and survival. Nor can I find many clues to assist me in formulating my own personal attitudes as a citizen. Clearly I have been provoked and stirred to think, although I doubt that this collection will be used for that kind of purpose. It is more likely that more experts will dip into it for confirmation or support for yet another paper testing yet another precious theory. The best one can hope is that ultimately it will add to the anger and dismay of the Aboriginal people and that they will be able to reject the nonsense and turn the plain and useful pieces to their own purposes.

Beverley Kingston

University of New South Wales
ABORIGINAL HISTORY 1979 3:2


In his Approaches to archaeology (1977) Peter Fowler defines archaeology as 'the study, or knowledge, of man-made things'; and in Analytical archaeology (1968) David Clarke is 'concerned with the recovery and study of relict artefacts', with all their spatial, temporal and contextual attributes. The raw data of the archaeologist are material objects — but his concern is with the behaviour of human groups or, more narrowly, past human groups. Archaeology has been regarded as the anthropology of extinct peoples, the time aspect of anthropology. But each moment the present becomes the past; and the past flows continually into the present. Is it not, then, equally valid to regard the study of extant peoples as simply a momentary cross-section of a total extinct/extant continuum? Some archaeologists have explicitly advocated a disciplinary concern with the totality of relationships between material culture and the behaviour of human groups, without restriction on time. In 'Melanesian and Australian exchange systems' (Mankind, 11, 1978) William Rathje maintains 'archaeology is the social science that studies the relation between material culture and behaviour in all times and places'; while in a review of Gould's Explorations in ethnoarchaeology (Mankind, 11, 1978) Peter White avers that 'archaeologists should study all relations between artefacts and their natural and cultural milieu, whether this is in the present or the past'.

Isabel McBryde does not concern herself here with the theoretical relationships between archaeology, anthropology and ethnohistory. Nevertheless, this set of essays lies right in the mainstream of concern as defined by Fowler: 'the landscape as an artefact created through time'; 'the use of all available evidence . . . to study the interaction through time of Man and his environment in any given area'. They stem from 'a programme of local ethnohistories as topics for research theses at honours and master's level' carried out by students of prehistoric archaeology in the History Department of the University of New England under Dr McBryde's direction (p. 104).

Some of the fascination of this material lies in its sources. We meet the indefatigable Miss Mary Bundock, writing of the blacks she knew on the Richmond River from 'somewhere early in the fifties' when she and her brother hid in the scrub to watch a file of men, 'all painted and armed for a fight'. Her account is perceptive, but brief. The quality of her observation comes out most clearly not so much in this general set piece, as in the specific descriptions she gives of individual manufactured items, and the materials and techniques of their manufacture. These accompany objects she gave to the Rijksmuseum, in the Netherlands, and to the Australian Museum in the late 1880s and the 1890s. She gives each object its native name and often identifies the raw material botanically; e.g. in the Rijksmuseum are 'Two shields — native name Puchah' of the wood of Meryta sinclairi (p. 145). A wooden bowl called 'Noundule' is made 'by cutting off and hollowing out the knots which grow on certain trees', this one being from the nettle tree (Urtica moroides) (p. 163). On a woven dilly bag donated to the Royal Botanic Gardens, Kew, she has written 'Dilly bag "boombi" Xerotes multiflora R. Br. Wyangarie Casino M.E.B. 24/10/79' and on another 'Buchie ben made from "Buchie" rush cladium glomeratum R. Br. Wyangarie Casino M.E.B. 24/10/79' (p. 167). She describes a paddle-shaped wooden object as a 'short-bladed spear used in hunting (p. 151). And so on, showing always a meticulous and informed concern with botany, linguistics, and technology of manufacture and use, as well as the objects themselves. Miss Bundock was a pioneer of the detailed and total study and recording of 'all relations between artefacts and their natural and cultural milieu'. She represents the persistence into the
nineteenth century of an eighteenth century concern with knowledge in all its aspects, and, above all, the total study of a particular landscape and its people — a tradition exemplified in Britain by William Stukeley, and in Australia by George Fletcher Moore, who recorded Aborigines in its technological, ceremonial, botanical, zoological, and geological) in Western Australia in the 1830s.

It is inevitable that the original observations of the early New England settlers and visitors, such as Mary Bundock, W.J. Fanning, Bishop Turner or Rudolf Poch, should be fragmented as they pass through the analytical sieve of these studies by Dr McBryde and her students. This tendency is counteracted to some extent by arranging several sources together at the end of the volume, printed on a buff paper with sepia photographs. Despite notes on 'The collectors' and 'Documentation by the collectors . . .' in Dr McBryde's paper on museum collections, and brief perceptive notes in her introduction, I found it difficult to form an overall view of the data sources. I would have appreciated, first, a longer introductory history of European exploration and settlement, observers and records. Then, second, perhaps the printed sources. The museum materials surely also belong here as part of the data base. These established, the analyses would logically follow third.

Some of these analysts treat their material through a limited time range; others take a particular region; others a particular topic. I.C. Campbell is concerned with racial contact and conflict on the New England tableland; Brian Harrison restricts his canvas to the Myall Creek massacre, and particularly its aftermath in the closing of white ranks against those who treated black men as men. These papers do not contribute to the overall themes of material culture and Aboriginal ways of life treated in the rest of the volume. W.G. Hoddinott's account of languages and myths in the New England area is an essential complement and prelude to the economic and technological themes which dominate the remainder of the analyses. Localised myths relate to particular landscape features and ceremonial places and their peopling by animals, men, and powerful creatures such as the serpents living in particular waterholes; thus maintaining and reinforcing ties between Aboriginal groups and their terrain. J. Bellshaw's paper on demography, activity patterns and schedules is extremely important. The Northern Tablelands are seen as a 'marchland' of harsh environment, impinged upon largely by groups centred on the slopes to the Darling drainage to the west, and the densely settled rich coastal zone to the east. Very concentrated usage of, for example, fishing grounds at the mouth of the Clarence River, or large yam beds near Lake Richmond, produce an almost sedentary pattern of usage in the immediate coastal area. Aggregate densities of wide areas (the coastal zone, with 20 to 50 people per 100 square miles, the tableland with 5, the slopes with 10 or 15) reflect ratios between different types of terrain — coast, river, rainforest and mountains — rather than the carrying capacity of each.

Valerie Campbell's paper on the Macleay clarifies the resources of this valley (estuarine fish and shellfish; water birds and fish in swamps and streams; yams on river clays; game in forested hills) and the detailed pattern of Aboriginal activity, involving movement, agglomeration near the coast in the summer, scattering into the hills in the winter. The scale of operations involves weirs across streams and tidal fishtraps of stone. Sharon Sullivan turns north to the Richmond and the Tweed to document again an inland winter to coastal spring pattern of group movement; detailing animal and plant resources, and the methods and gear used to obtain and use fish, game, roots, Bunya nuts, etc., and the relationship of these activities to social organisations. Miss Bundock provides both documentary and artefactual evidence of climbing vines and nets both small and huge. Russell Pierce focuses on one small area at the mouth of the Richmond, drawing largely on the 1922 memories of septuagenarian John Ainsworth.
The remaining papers are even more specific, turning from total area accounts to individual structures. The data are drawn from fieldwork — Valerie Campbell recording fishtraps on the northern New South Wales coast, which provided abundant food and made possible semi-permanent settlement; Helen Bray describing stone arrangements in hilly country above the Macleay River; Sabine providing a note on an inconspicuous increase site; and Lane documenting carved trees. In each case, documentary or oral evidence is necessary to understand the field evidence — Mary Bundock once more on fish traps; a local informant around 1900 for stone arrangements; Radcliffe-Brown in the 1920s for increase centres; oral memories (and Etheridge's 1910 account) for carved trees. Field evidence extends the application of verbal, and vice versa, every time.

Among the most valuable features of this book are its illustrations, reproductions of old photographs and drawings. Some are of high quality (e.g. Poch's photographs of Clarence River engravings and of Grafton Aborigines or Mrs Macpherson's drawing of the 'Blacks' Camp' near Bingara). But some are too dark (e.g. Gardner's drawings of equipment) or rendered obscure by over-reduction, for instance, his drawings of Aborigines on pp. 236-237. While for old photographs the original may be at fault, this does not excuse recent field photographs, as in plate 47, nor plate 50, which does not show what it purports to show.

It is a pity the Institute of Aboriginal Studies has allowed technical faults to mar a pioneer attempt to integrate documentary, oral, field and museum data into 'a comprehensive picture of [Aboriginal material culture] as part of a functioning culture in a distinct environment'. This will remain a seminal study long after it has been paid the compliment of many imitations.

SYLVIA J. HALLAM
UNIVERSITY OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA


The voyage to Marege' is a stimulating and significant work. In a refreshing and compelling manner it draws attention to a generally neglected aspect of Australia's past: the visits of the Macassan trepangers to the coast of the Northern Territory known to them as Marege'. From the inception of the trepang industry, some time during the half century after the Dutch conquest of Macassar in 1667/9, to its demise in 1906/7 these fishermen created and maintained regular contacts between northern Australia and their homeport on southern Sulawesi. During its heyday in the 19th century each season saw probably more than a thousand men undertake the voyage. Macknight argues convincingly that the little impact the Macassans made on the course of Australia's economic and social development should not be accepted as the sole determinant of their historical significance. It is true that because of the nature of their business the encounters of the Macassans with the Australian Aborigines tended to be brief, but for several tribes they nevertheless meant a qualitatively unique link of communication with another world that was entirely alien to them. Moreover, in some aspects these contacts did have lasting consequences, such as the adoption of a considerable Macassan vocabulary in several Aboriginal languages, or the introduction of new conceptual and material items into their culture. Similarly, the paltriness of the custom duties contributed by the Macassans to the colonial and state treasury of South Australia is no true indication of the role and value of a fishing industry that white Australians through their own limitations could not maintain. For a proper assessment of the trepang industry, therefore, a wider canvas must be chosen. Macknight correctly sees it as an
BOOK REVIEWS

important facet of the total maritime development of Southeast Asia. Within the
context of the highly sophisticated societies and market economies of that area
— where Marege' trepang was a standard description of the article — it was an
‘unusually clear example of non-European business activity’.

The voyage to Marege' is foremost a business history of the trepang industry.
Its focus remains firmly fixed on the Macassans and their fishery, so that the reader
should not expect an exhaustive account of the impact of the Macassans on Aboriginal
society. Three major themes can be distinguished: the historical development of the
industry; its organisation, technology and seasonal routine; and finally the
relationship between Macassans and Australians.

From the beginning the trepang fishery was a commercial rather than a
subsistence industry. Virtually the only consumption market for the cured sea slug
was China. The estimated Macassan average annual production of 300 tons in the
nineteenth century gave them at least 25 per cent of this market. Whether the
Macassans could influence prices in China, or reversedly, whether and how fluctuations
in China affected prices, incomes, and generally the level of enterprise in Macassar,
is not fully discussed. Nor is the relationship between the trepangers and the
Chinese merchants who provided the communication with the Chinese market
made clear. In view of the paucity of the sources one may not hope for definitive
answers to such questions, but matters such as the marketing of the trepang and
the economic and social standing of the trepangers in Macassar should have been
broached. The discussion, which could justifiably have remained tentative, might also
have included a time dimension.

The latter general point, although decreasingly apposite, may also be made
regarding Macknight’s treatment of the social and economic position of the crew,
the routine of the voyage, and the actual work of catching and curing the trepang.
Yet, here Macknight also shows his great historical craftsmanship and imaginative
qualities in piecing together information from many different types of sources into a
coherent and comprehensive picture. This applies particularly to chapter 5, ‘The
archaeology of the industry’, which provides an excellent insight into the technology
of trepanging, largely based on the results of archaeological field work. Moreover,
Macknight provides illuminating illustrations, and some most useful and excellent
maps and figures. I shall return later to the twin subjects of methodology and
presentation.

Two separate chapters have been devoted to the when, how and why of the
industry’s beginnings and end. As is the case with so many other similar industries it
is impossible to determine an exact date for its inception. Macknight, however, has
succeeded in limiting the most likely range of years to the half century, most
probably even the quarter century, after Macassar was conquered by the Dutch East
India Company (V.O.C.) in the late 1660s. Although little specific literary evidence
is available, an array of circumstances, based foremost on the chronology of the
knowledge and consumption of trepang in China and the re-orientation of Macassan
maritime enterprise necessitated by its subordination to the trading and shipping
policies of the V.O.C., makes this conclusion readily acceptable. In order to do so
fully, however, one must discard radiocarbon datings derived from excavations of three
Macassan campsites in Marege’. Specimens taken from these locations yielded age
indications of about 200, 400 and 800 years which, if accepted at face value, suggest
the fishery must have begun at least 5 centuries earlier. In view of the ‘historical’
evidence Macknight’s opinion that these results are caused by some systematic
failure of the dating method used — which multiplies the calculated age by a factor
of four — must be upheld.
The last chapter, dealing with the demise of Macassan trepanging, shows how the arrival of white administration ultimately destroyed a basically sound, but foreign, industry. It seems to me that Macknight is somewhat too apologetic in assessing the restrictive policies of South Australia, and the men who shaped and executed them. Not only were the customs officials often themselves private entrepreneurs desirous of gaining a share or even a monopoly in the industry, but it is also clear that the Macassans were so easily liable to extortionate dues and later expulsion because they were non-whites.

For the readers of this journal perhaps the most interesting chapter is "The men of Marege'", on the relations between Macassans and Aborigines. Although the emphasis remains on the impact of the Aborigines on the Macassans rather than on the reverse influences, the discussion is valuable for both perspectives. Attention is drawn to the considerable trading that took place in some seasons, and a summary given of the consequences of Macassan contacts on Aboriginal culture. Central to these exchanges were direct personal contacts which (beyond the expectable skirmishes and heterosexual encounters) extended to some Macassans settling in Marege' and some Aborigines finding employment with the trepangers and accompanying them to Macassar. This chapter again shows Macknight's great skill in handling oral and anthropological evidence and integrating it with what usually, but erroneously, is called 'historical' (i.e. written or printed) documentation.

This finally leads me to Macknight's methodology, to which I referred earlier and which deserves special consideration. The voyage to Marege' is based on an array of source material, of which the composition, if not unique, is certainly remarkable for its span, diversity and originality. Besides written and printed documents the sources include information gained through interviews and talks with Macassans and Aborigines, and from archaeological and anthropological fieldwork. No less remarkable is the admirable manner with which Macknight has succeeded in welding his heterogeneous material together and creating out of this blend a coherent business history of Macassan trepanging. That the picture he evokes is not entirely comprehensive does not diminish the achievement and value of the book. Macknight is to be commended for his imaginative approach, judicious analysis, and the great concern he has shown in also presenting his findings lucidly and graphically. One hopes indeed that Macknight's multi-disciplinary, but fundamentally historical, methodology will be a beacon and stimulus for future similar studies.

FRANK BROEZE


There has long been a need for a book accessible to school children which tells the story of Aboriginal resistance to European settlers, creates some Aboriginal heroes and brings to life the ruthlessness with which the British government put down this resistance. Since the publication of Rowley's trilogy in 1970 most books in this area have been by and for the specialists so that little recent work has reached the general public. Only McQueen's Penguin Connexions book Aborigines, race and racism published in 1974 reached a wider audience, but it unintentionally reinforced prevailing images of Aborigines with a series of photographs that made Aborigines look like freaks. Indeed his book demonstrated the difficulty of presenting a different image of Aborigines. There have also been a number of general pseudo-anthropological studies which portray Aborigines as a quaint people associated with snakes, spirits and the desert. A recent film, The last Tasmanian, which was shown on television, acknowledged Aboriginal resistance, but since the director considered
BOOK REVIEWS

that the Tasmanian Aborigines were suffering from 'a slow strangulation of the mind', their resistance was only an aberration, and not a politically conscious act. Indeed there has been a marked reluctance on the part of most white Australian intellectuals to allow Aborigines any political reality in the nineteenth century, which says a great deal about the European mind in Australia.

Black resistance is different. As a book for a wider audience, particularly school children, it convincingly argues that the Aborigines are a political and a historically conscious people who resisted European invasion from the beginning and were often successful in restraining the flow of European settlement, that the British were aware of this resistance and used every means to crush it. The authors make accessible the work of specialist historians, by tracing colony by colony the nature of Aboriginal resistance and create some Aboriginal heroes and heroines in the process. After all the books which have portrayed settlers and colonial office officials agonising about the mass slaughter of the Aborigines, this one is refreshing and challenging. The chapters on Tasmania, Victoria and the Northern Territory are scrappy because they rely on out-of-date secondary sources, but other chapters like those on New South Wales and Queensland are very good indeed, relying heavily on the pioneering work of Raymond Evans. It is unfortunate the authors did not acknowledge their debt to his chapter in Exclusion, exploitation and extermination from which they took at least 29 direct quotes. Like Clive Turnbull's book, Black war, first published thirty years ago, this book is designed to shock white Australians into an awareness of repressive policies towards the Aborigines and to seek change. But Black resistance goes further. By using the ideas of Reynolds and Evans the authors demonstrate the refusal by the settlers and governments to accept Aborigines as a politically conscious people for fear of challenging the morality of their invasion. They also draw upon the theories of guerilla warfare espoused by Che Guevara and the Viet Cong to understand the nature of Aboriginal resistance, possibly the most contentious part of the book, but these analogies work well and have already been used with great effect by other writers.

Some anthropologists have attacked the book for failing to take account of Aboriginal social organisation and for creating European-inspired Aboriginal heroes and heroines. Nor does the book take account of the complexities of European settlement or the absence of unity among the Aboriginal tribes in confronting the Europeans. The nature of Aboriginal resistance is undoubtedly more complex than this book allows, but the substance is not. I hope it is read by an audience wider than school children. It may serve to enable some white people to understand why most Aborigines still bear hatred for whites and why they feel no gratitude for the crumbs of land and money that have been tossed to them. Above all it may enable white people to confront the origins of their attitudes towards black people more honestly.

LYNDALL RYAN

GRIFFITH UNIVERSITY

The two worlds of Jimmie Barker: the life of an Australian Aboriginal 1900-1972, as told to Janet Mathews. Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies, Canberra, 1977. Pp. xiii + 218. $5.00 p.b. only.

Aboriginal history from the late nineteenth century is largely the story of government settlements and church missions where tribal remnants were 'concentrated'. Initially, this process of uprooting and relocation was intended to protect Aborigines from extinction. But the institutionalisation of this system later served the convenient purpose of removing them from public view and public conscience.
The official records of what might be called the institutional era are more substantial than historians and anthropologists previously imagined. Diane Barwick has demonstrated the usefulness of the Victorian Aborigines' Protection Board material, and there is a great deal yet to be gleaned from the files of the Western Australia Department of Native Affairs this century. Of course, the material is often patchy. For example, Janet Mathews' extracts from the New South Wales Aborigines' Protection Board records relating to the Brewarrina station (which she uses as appendices) read like notes from the Inspector of Prisons.

Fortunately the story in this case has been filled out by the reminiscences of the Aboriginal Jimmy Barker, collated and edited by Mathews from tape-recordings which Barker began making on his own initiative. Mrs Mathews (the grand-daughter in law of R.H. Mathews, one of the earliest ethnographers of the Muruwari), was working on the Muruwari language in the late 1960s when she heard about Barker, and this book is the result of their collaboration. While the Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies is to be congratulated for such a well-produced publication, it is a pity that Mathews was not asked to provide notes indicating, among other things, the accuracy of Jimmie Barker's memory. More importantly, there is the vexed question of authorship. It may be that Mathews' editing has been extremely light, but we can never be sure whose words we are reading. As an historian, I would have preferred a less polished and more disjointed product whose authorship was clearly established.

The son of a German station manager called Bocher and a part-Aboriginal woman whose mother was Muruwari, Jimmie lived as a child at Mundiwa (a camping reserve on the Culgoa River) and at nearby Milroy station where his mother worked as a domestic servant. Later they moved to the Brewarrina Aboriginal settlement where he received some rudimentary schooling. From childhood he had shown considerable skill in repairing machinery and building his own little inventions. Consequently he was pleased when the settlement manager told him that he had been apprenticed to an engineer. But it was all a ruse. Instead, the fourteen year old boy found himself indentured to work for four years on a distant farm for the sum of two shillings a week, paid to the Board on his behalf. If he had run away he would not have been allowed back to the Brewarrina settlement to care for his ailing mother. Nor would he have been able to escape the slights and insults handed out to Aborigines who scraped a living on the fringes of western towns. It was easier to maintain his self-respect on the settlement and this helps to explain why such an obviously talented Aboriginal spent his best years as a general handyman.

Jimmie had missed initiation when he was eleven because of his mother's insistence that he was too young (the normal age was about fourteen). And what may have been the last attempt by the Muruwari old men to pass on their secret knowledge failed a few years later in 1913 when six young conscripts managed to free themselves and escape into the bush. His mother's death in 1922 also spelled the end of one of the most tenacious Muruwari customs — the burning of the deceased's possessions (including government-issue blankets, much to the chagrin of managers). Jimmie kept his mother's most treasured belongings and while this created something of a sensation, people began to follow his example. The influenza epidemic of 1919 killed off most of the old people and henceforth there was little concern about 'correct' marriages.

It seems almost incredible now that the Ngemba and Muruwari peoples of western New South Wales should have been inflicted with a series of such lazy, cheating, bullying and alcoholic managers. However, controlling an Aboriginal 'mission' (as Aborigines described government settlements as well as church establishments) was poorly paid and possessed about the same kudos as running a leper camp. Apart from one manager who made some improvements, the best that Jimmie Barker could say about the others was that they 'did not hurt anyone seriously'. Their powers were virtually dictatorial. Any Aboriginal with the
temerity to complain to the Board or to the police about such practices as the misappropriation of welfare payments or over-charging for goods would have his complaint referred back to the manager, who could then expel him as a 'trouble maker'.

Today's Aboriginal activists and their white supporters may wonder why Aborigines did not take the solution into their own hands. They may see Jimmie Barker as an 'uncle Tom' figure who benefited from his mediating role between 'kooreys' and 'gubs'. This is how Jimmie would defend himself:

At times the Aborigines were so resentful that they made plans to retaliate and attack the manager. Each time this occurred I was able to talk them out of it with warnings that we had no say in what was right and nothing was in our favour. Any aggression from us would mean twelve months in gaol; we must endure these unpleasant events. I prevented a rebellion many times, for I knew that the Aborigines would be the sufferers.

In our era of tent embassies and land rights it takes a special effort of the imagination to appreciate the total powerlessness of those people. A good deal had to be borne in order to prevent families from being split up, the ultimate sanction of white authority. This point has been made very effectively by Alessandro Cavadini and Carolyn Strachan in their film about the Palm Island strike of 1957.

Describing the anguish of 'King Clyde' and the other old men who saw their world being swept away, Jimmie Barker recorded his own feelings about his Aboriginal heritage: 'I might have modern views in many ways', he wrote, 'but there is another line of thought which draws me backwards. I feel that I am living between two worlds, and I am not even a full-blood'. Echoing the official orthodoxy of his time, he believed that this painful situation would exist for perhaps another hundred years until all Aborigines were 'fully assimilated into the white community'.

BOB REECE

MURDOCH UNIVERSITY


As a boy I remember hearing my grandfather talk of the 'Breelong Blacks'. He had known some of the Mawbeys in Gilgandra, and he referred to what had happened to their family as though to a well-known tragedy. I doubt if he mentioned the Governors by name, but clearly he considered them Aborigines, and probably he therefore thought himself superior to them. Yet he showed neither hostility towards them nor shame for their condition. He simply told their story as one of many he passed on of the early days, and as far as I could tell it was the only one in which Aborigines or half castes were killers. Obviously he did not think that massacres were a peculiar specialty of Aborigines.

Yet I suspect it is their colour, more than their deeds, which have given the Governors prominence in the 1970s. In fairly rapid succession a novel, a film, and now a biography have appeared, like my grandfather each treating the principals as black, unlike my grandfather each seeing the cause of the tragedy in the void between two cultures. A similar perception in the United States made a folk hero of Geronimo, and possibly such a thing might happen to the Governors here. I don't automatically disagree with history as propaganda, and much of it is that anyway, consciously or unconsciously, but in the Governors' case it does demand an attempt at estimating the impact of their Aboriginal heritage upon them, and this is a thing conspicuously absent from all accounts about them so far.
There is clear evidence that Aboriginal attitudes and values mattered to the Governors. We see this in their readiness to share, their endurance, their bushcraft and their contempt for European ability in the bush, the manner of their separating from the slower fugitives including the Queenslander Underwood, their fatalism, and so on. Might not the Aboriginal background, then, help explain not only, indeed not mainly, why the Mawbeys were killed, and also many of the incredible events in the three months thereafter?

Brian Davies might reply that, even were it possible now to attempt such an assessment, such was not his purpose. He is a journalist, and this is a journalist's book. The research is conscientious but stops once the story line is clear, the narrative has the rough edges of haste but it is clear and it keeps moving. This is a good story, aware of the great injustice with which white has treated black in Australia, but not touching the deeper questions which this treatment provokes.

What were the Governors doing? Between 20 July and 27 October 1900, when Jimmy was captured, they killed nine Europeans, wounded three, and raped one, robbed thirty five huts and homesteads and burnt two more, and committed nine highway robberies and numerous other thefts. They averaged over a crime a day, and they seemed to have wanted to make their pursuers look stupid. This is one of several traits they shared with earlier bushrangers like Ben Hall, yet as Davies points out unlike their predecessors the Governors were always on the run, with almost every man's hand against them. They kept moving at literally a killing pace, averaging perhaps a thousand miles a month, mostly on foot, never pausing, never ceasing their attacks, not once attempting to negotiate with their enemies, until finally their skills and endurance were run to ground by the telegraph, the railway and the rifle. Their campaign smacks of a vendetta mainly, although not only against Europeans, for the Governors vowed revenge on Aboriginal enemies. It also suggests that they knew that in the end there would be nowhere for them to go — were they like Ben Hall in wanting to die game, or was there something in their Aboriginal traditions which prescribed how men without hope should die?

Yet while puzzles remain about the months after that night of carnage at the Mawbey homestead, the present evidence suggests a simpler explanation of the event itself. Jimmy Governor was driven to rage by the slighting of his efforts, by the contempt shown for his race and his manhood. It was not the first time in Australia that injustice has provoked such a response, nor should we assume that it will be the last.

BILL GAMMAGE

UNIVERSITY OF ADELAIDE


This is the sixth special publication of the Australian Society for the Study of Labour History; and as with the others (e.g. Women at work, 1975) it centres on an important theme in Australian history. The book contains fourteen chapters and a lively introduction. Four of the chapters deal with the reasons for working class hostility to Chinese immigrants in the nineteenth century. Several more discuss trade union and socialist attitudes to the White Australia policy after 1901. There are several case studies, including two on the infamous Queensland sugar industry; and Hank Nelson has contributed a sensitive account of race and labour relations in Australian New Guinea, called 'From kanaka to fuzzy wuzzy angel'.

164
BOOK REVIEWS

Given the theme of the book it is disappointing that there is only one chapter on the labour movement and Aborigines. Nevertheless, Andrew Markus' 'Talka longa mouth' is a thorough account of union (especially pastoral union) attitudes to Aboriginal membership from 1890 to 1970. His suggestion that there was less discrimination than has been thought previously invites discussion, as does his assertion that the Communist Party of Australia's Aboriginal programme of 1931 'constituted the most radical demands being made by, or on behalf of, Aborigines till the 1960s'.

A second chapter on Aborigines — by R.G. Castle and J.S. Hagan — deals with structural economic changes and Aboriginal work experiences in the Bega area from the 1920s to the 1970s. The subject warrants a book-length study, but the chapter is unpretentious and stimulating, not least for its use of oral evidence.

Who are our enemies? deserves to find its way on to the reading lists of college and university courses in Australian history.

TOM STANNAGE AUSTRALIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY


This is a short, but extremely useful, listing of bibliographies relating to Aborigines of use to those interested in Aboriginal studies. The entries are clearly presented with informative annotations; an index also assists the user. For historians it might have been helpful to list some of the overseas bibliographies and library catalogues which contain early and often obscure sources. A small inaccuracy on page ii relates to the A.I.A.S. library: no acquisition listing is published in the Institute's Newsletter, only current Aboriginal material is included in the Annual Bibliography. The March issue, however, does contain a listing of theses acquired annually by the Institute.

JAMES URRY AUSTRALIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY

A REPLY TO MERVYN HARTWIG'S REVIEW OF RACE RELATIONS AUSTRALIA AND NEW ZEALAND

Mervyn Hartwig and I obviously view things through different ends of the telescope and there is no harm in that. But any chance of a fruitful debate has been destroyed by his arrogance and scorn.

Hartwig, though, is his own worst enemy. Like many writers committed to a narrow ideological view of the world he has the knack of misquoting, misreading, and generally misrepresenting other people's work that he disagrees with. There is no point going through his comments line by line saying 'I did not write this' or 'this is out of context' and so on. But let two examples suffice to illustrate the range of his intellectual dishonesty.

I wrote (pp. 3-4) 'Aborigines led a parasitical — in a non-pejorative sense — existence. They had no agriculture or domestic animals, but foraged, gathered, hunted and fished . . .' Hartwig's smearing rendition becomes "'parasitical" [sic] hunter-gathering". In a footnote he dismisses my 'non-pejorative' comment and says that what I really meant was that 'Aborigines merely took from nature and in no way improved its productivity' (!)
This ability to ghost write my book so that it becomes something quite different in Hartwig's mind is really taken to extremes in this example: he argues that my conclusions tend to 'blame the victim' and that I say that 'Aborigines have not been the victims of an inherently unjust socio-economic order but of their own lifestyles'.

This is pure fiction. Read, for example, the following statement from p. 9 of my book (and its reiteration throughout):

Further, it must be noted that the present depressed socio-economic state of Aborigines is not directly attributable to the survival of some inherited prehistoric cultural or genetic programming, as is popularly assumed. Certain characteristics of prehistoric Aboriginal culture did determine early reactions to western man, and certainly influenced his attitudes towards and therefore policies for Aborigines... But there comes a time when responses to European colonisation by later generations of Aborigines are increasingly influenced by considerations other than those of their prehistoric culture, notably the way in which they were continually repressed and persecuted by Europeans. Thus present Aboriginal social and behavioural patterns are by no means unique for they have much in common with those of similarly placed ethnic minorities in other countries: it is a question of broad environmental influences — social, economic, political, psychological — and no longer of direct prehistoric cultural determinants.

I could also write at length about Hartwig's display of ignorance when he talks blandly about (and on behalf of!) the New Zealand 'working class' as opposed to the 'ruling class' and so on. But then his stock reply would doubtless be that New Zealanders (unlike Hartwig) don't really understand their situation as it really exists.

I could also challenge his view that my book is an 'insult' to Maoris and show him favourable reviews and comments by Maoris but presumably such people are just brown-skinned honkeys uninformed about the dialectics of neo-Marxism.

I believe that there is a difference between informed criticism and misrepresentation. I also believe that scholarly journals should have nothing to do with the latter.

K.R. HOWE

MASSEY UNIVERSITY

166