

## Book Reviews

*Invisible invaders, smallpox and other diseases in Aboriginal Australia 1780-1880* by Judy Campbell, 266pp, Melbourne University Press, Melbourne 2002, \$49.95

Judy Campbell's *Invisible invaders* is a polished gem of historical research. It is one of those books which are fine to the feel, and its design, from cover to print-size to selection of illustrations, is excellent. The writing style is clear, the evidence well presented, the Glossary useful, and the Notes, Bibliography and Index comprehensive. Any historians or other researchers interested in the history of smallpox and other diseases in Aboriginal Australia will surely use this study as a cornerstone reference from now on.

The subtitle of the book, 'smallpox and other diseases in Aboriginal Australia 1780-1880', clearly indicates the major focus. However, the first two chapters present a very useful commentary on ancient Aboriginal diseases, as well as ancient diseases elsewhere in the world, and the impact of 'virgin soil outbreaks' of smallpox on Native Americans. The fine thread of comparison with the North American records is a useful reminder of the similar nature of the impact of virgin epidemics of smallpox, but the contrast, as the author also points out, provides a cautionary tale about jumping to incorrect conclusions as, in particular, the influential American scholars Butlin and Diamond did.

Judy Campbell presents the Australian evidence in such a way as to nicely acknowledge historical sources and allow other theories to be examined, yet leads readers on lucid paths of greater understandings. Her key examinations, those of the various smallpox epidemics from 1789 to the 1860s, are as comprehensive as the records allow, and compelling in their deductions and summaries.

Although the evidence for presumed accidental introduction of smallpox by Macassans has long been noted, for a considerable time it was lost beneath speculation about British introduction, as either accidental (eg Stirling 1911) or, more sensationally, as a deliberate act of 'original aggression' (eg Butlin 1983). In Chapter Three, 'Myths', the author effectively waddies these ideas on the head, along with speculation that the disease was chicken-pox or a 'native pock'.

Having discounted these myths, the source of smallpox is then comprehensively considered in Chapter Four, 'The Indonesian Archipelago 1780-1880'. In fact, much earlier reports of its presence in Asia are presented before it is proven to be south-east Asia in origin in the crucial period. A wide range of historical sources allows Campbell to indicate, from both circumstantial and reported evidence, that the Macassans from Sulawesi and elsewhere were responsible for introducing this 'most dreadful scourge' to the Aborigines, and a map (p 67) indicates the places of origin and directions of spread to northern Australia. This chapter sets the background for an exhaustive, yet

nonetheless constantly interesting Chapter Five, 'Hidden History'. Here she examines the contrary hypotheses, then indicates how, as had long been hinted at, the 'chains of connection' – the Aboriginal gift exchange, travelling ceremonial and other travelling routes – were the logical routes by which the Macassan-introduced 'virgin soil' smallpox epidemic arrived in Sydney in 1789. (This is briefly, but usefully, expanded upon later where appropriate (pp 166, 182-3)). Once again a useful map is provided, as wherever appropriate throughout the book. The author is scrupulous in indicating when the evidence is either reasonable speculation or direct historical observation.

Her presentation here, and throughout, illustrates the advantage of using a chronological approach, when even scanty records are available, to indicate specific and likely places of origin, directions and speed of the spread of the disease, and the terrible but varying impacts on Aboriginal populations at locality after locality, region after region. And in 'The aftermath' (pp 102-4) she briefly considers the tragic impact of other introduced diseases, notably tuberculosis. A point of considerable interest, mentioned but not developed, is that the imbalance of males to females among the survivors in favour of males, as well as the massive loss of life, 'may have delayed a return to customary life and demographic recovery' (p 98).

Chapter Six, 'The Frontiers of Eastern Australia 1824-1830' is an excellent chapter, using both Aboriginal oral history and the observations of early British and German colonists to indicate how smallpox spread beyond the coasts in eastern Australia. The evidence of a devastation on the Darling and then Murray Rivers and its further spread in coastal South Australia and much further north is unequivocal. (The reviewer, having been shown an Aboriginal skull excavated during laying of a water-pipe by a friend on the eastern shore of Lake Albert on the Lower Murray in the mid-1960s, prevailed on the friend to hand the skull to the then appropriate authorities. This was followed by an examination of the area in which the skull had been found. At this time two distinctive concentrations of partially exposed skeletons, one of twenty-one individuals and the other of eleven individuals, were recorded. Their location was indicated in an old historical reference as being one at which many Aborigines had died as a result of smallpox. No record of the research has ever been published, and the historical reference is not indicated here to protect the grave sites.)

The ensuing chapters Seven to Nine, respectively titled 'The Colony of New South Wales 1828-32', 'Eastern Australia 1860-1867' (including the Northern Territory) and 'Western Australia 1860-1870', are equally erudite. They conclusively prove – despite the understandable limitations of the evidence in most desert areas, and despite some groups surviving unscathed for various reasons (see eg p 150) – that smallpox epidemics had a terrible impact Australia-wide: smallpox caused the deaths of half or more of the groups in the virgin epidemic stages; numbers of Aboriginal survivors in New South Wales and what eventually became Victoria indicated that the populations had 'never recovered' their pre-impact numbers (see eg pp 148, 154). The author also suggests that, as in North America, the losses were so great that at times effective resistance to the invading Europeans was either not directly possible or was often limited because of the depleted numbers due to disease (pp 161, 189, 213).

An important point of the research is that, while the specific place of origin is not known for certain in New South Wales, the author uses the available records to clearly indicate that the spread was from the interior to the coast, rather than the reverse as has

generally been assumed; that it almost certainly spread north to south from well inland of Moreton Bay; and that, even at the time, postulations about the origins included 'in the islands of the Malay Archipelago' (p 148). Furthermore, while the Aboriginal attempts at evasion and treatment are mentioned in earlier chapters, here the references are more frequent, and mythologically derived explanations, as well as perceptions of the malignant power of other Aborigines, are mentioned as Aboriginal explanations for its occurrence.

Although it is not the focus of her study, Campbell also mentions the concerns that colonial officials, and frontier colonists in New South Wales, had for the Aborigines who were suffering from smallpox and other diseases in an 1866 to 1867 outbreak in western South Australia (pp 184-7), and similarly in Western Australia (pp 193, 212). Such concerns, including encouragement of Aborigines to seek vaccination in addition to their own treatments, and to rest appropriately and recover, as well as the nursing care by colonists, could in themselves well provide an interesting article. Certainly there was a degree of self-interest, in that such treatment would also benefit the few unvaccinated colonists, preventing them from catching smallpox from the Aborigines, but the evidence is also clear that among the invading Europeans there were many who had a compassionate humanitarian concern for the well-being of the original inhabitants. She also counters Jared Diamond's assertions of frontier violence in Australia being the main cause of Aboriginal deaths. It is certain that, terrible as every deliberate massacre was, smallpox and tuberculosis (unavoidable in the European population of the era, and accidentally spread to, and then by, Aborigines) caused vastly more deaths than did bullets or poison (pp 161-2).

At this stage I do question one perception by the author, and that is the implication that some groups of Aborigines, particularly those at points along the Murray and the Darling, universally blamed Europeans for the introduction of smallpox, and therefore were belligerent (pp 161-2). Time does not allow development of the alternative or counter evidence, but from my own (unpublished) research I believe that it is clear that distinctive Aboriginal group boundaries, misunderstandings between the explorers' groups and Aborigines (neither knowing the other's language nor other key protocols and practices) and fear of the invading strangers on the Lower Murray – and probably elsewhere along both rivers – created tensions independent of any Aboriginal perceptions about smallpox.

Although it is worthy of a more detailed commentary, Chapter Nine, 'Western Australia 1860-1870', follows the author's previous meticulous considerations of the evidence in examining four different subregions. While measles and tuberculosis are also precisely referred to, it is smallpox which continues as the focus of her attention. After proving that it again can reasonably be attributed to the visits of Macassans, and that some of the spread was from inland rather than the coast, the developing tragedies are followed by reference to the chronology of observations. It is an impressive chapter, in that almost all other major studies have given the greatest, and often sole, attention to eastern Australia.

Before considering the concluding chapter, I mention a few minor errors. On p 21 'European' should read 'Europeans'; on p 105 the date of 1989 in line two should be 1789. In all instances from p 179 onwards, including the Index, 'Tietkins' should be 'Tietkens'; and on p 182 the distance of 'several hundred kilometres in two days' is a misreading of the evidence. However, these are all very minor errors in an illuminating study.

Chapter Ten, 'The Diseases that Killed', is a tour de force summarising chapter. The comparisons and contrasts with North America are incisively commented upon; and if anyone can use a scalpel gently while still respecting their endeavours, then the author has done so on the three main commentators Curr, Butlin and Diamond. In so doing she firmly restates that which she has conclusively proved: that the origins of the smallpox epidemics in the century 1780-1880 lay with the Macassan visitors from Sulawesi. She reiterates that the 'chains of connection' which linked Aborigines continent-wide became 'chains of infection', so that smallpox in particular, but also measles, tuberculosis – the 'worst disease transmitted to Aborigines by Europeans' in the same century (p 228) – and venereal diseases, spread as virgin epidemic catastrophes. Although other points are succinctly made, a final fitting quotation reads: 'Between 1780 and 1870 smallpox itself was the major single cause of Aboriginal deaths. The consequences of Aboriginal smallpox are an integral part of modern Australian history' (p 227).

In conclusion, this is as fine a book of historical research as it has been my sad pleasure to read. Judy Campbell has impressively distilled and summarised the evidence about diseases in Aboriginal Australia to 1880. She deserves whatever history awards exist for excellence.

RG Kimber  
Alice Springs

*Aboriginal suicide is different: a portrait of life and self-destruction* by Colin Tatz, 249pp, Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra 2001, \$33.00

Professor Colin Tatz has published a book that is mainly (but not exclusively) based on his field study in New South Wales, the Australian Capital Territory and New Zealand. The study had been funded over a 3-year period by the Criminology Research Council, with the findings presented in July 1999. In this book, Tatz attempts to provide some explanation of Aboriginal suicide and how it differs from non-Aboriginal suicide. Understandably Tatz 'found no excitement or intellectual exhilaration' in carrying out his field study and reporting the findings; in fact he only experienced 'distress' (p ix). Tatz refers to Maori suicide in New Zealand where he claims that it 'is as much of a problem in New Zealand as is Aboriginal suicide in Australia' (p x). Contrary to Emile Durkheim's theory of anomie Tatz states his belief that alienation can 'be a spur to achievement' (pxi). To bolster this argument Tatz points to the amazing resilience and courage shown by many Aboriginal communities, particularly among Aboriginal women. He also suggests that an Australia-wide study along similar lines to his research is no longer necessary. This is because Ernest Hunter and others also released a report in 1999 on Aboriginal suicide in North Queensland, and any further research along the same lines would not substantially alter the 'broad conclusions reported in these two studies' (p xii).

Tatz begins his discussion on Aboriginal suicide with the social and political contexts of Aboriginal suicide. Aboriginal suicide is different because Aboriginal people mostly live 'non-Aboriginal' lives that cannot be separated from their particular social and personal histories. There can be no disputing the fact that five or more generations

of inter-racial violence has had deep and profound effects on Aboriginal people in Australia. Tatz uses a quote from Emmanuel Marx to help explain the origins of what he calls the 'new violence'. That is, where a person is so totally dependent on 'officials' and therefore unable to 'stage a public appeal', he may be compelled to assault family members and even commit suicide so that he can 'share his burden' or 'regain the support' of his family members (p 23). Tatz explains that suicide as a social phenomenon was rare in the Aboriginal population until the 1980s, the increase in the Aboriginal suicide rate being attributable largely to 'internal breakdown' in Aboriginal communities as a result of governments abolishing the missions and reserves now called communities. Tatz rejects the quantitative 'safety in numbers' approach that many social scientists use when attempting to explain Aboriginal suicide (p 43).

Tatz goes on to suggest that the use of scientific methods to quantify Aboriginal suicide is a futile exercise, given the many causal factors and the vastly different circumstances of Aboriginal people compared to non-Aboriginal people. Tatz suggests that in order to explain and understand Aboriginal suicide one must use a discipline that looks at the wider context of this social phenomenon. Using quantitative methodologies presents all sorts of difficulties in defining Aboriginal suicide. He points to the fact that most Australian States and Territories do not have an Aboriginal identifier, since 'neither police reporting of non-natural causes of death', nor coronial determinations of an individual's death, record whether the deceased is Aboriginal or not (p 63). This tells us that there is still a long way to go before the quantification of Aboriginal suicide can be even remotely measured. Tatz takes a quote from Alvarez (1974) where he suggests that the study of suicide has yielded more and more publications, papers, essays etc. However, 'Suicidology' has not made much of an impact on suicide rates in the western world. Tatz estimates Aboriginal suicide to be at least 'double' maybe even 'quadruple the rate of non-Aboriginal suicide' (p 79). Tatz presents quantitative data from New South Wales, the one State that in recent times has begun to record Aboriginality in death records. He concludes that Aboriginal youth suicide rates in 1997 were over '48 per 100,000' in the state of New South Wales ... double the non-Aboriginal rate of suicide' (p 86).

Tatz also looks at risk factors associated with Aboriginal suicide where consideration is given to ideas presented by Hassan and Baume, who suggest that people who are unmarried, from non-English speaking, ethnic or rural backgrounds, are more at risk of suicide (pp 125-7). Tatz suggests that 'formal marriage', unemployment and low job status are not highly important in Aboriginal societies. They are, according to Tatz, normative aspects of Aboriginal life and therefore they are not 'major stressors' (p 127). Tatz also suggests that the Community Development Employment Program (CDEP) has provided a boost for the morale of Aboriginal people where being a CDEP worker carries with it a 'higher status'. This seems to contradict somewhat his earlier implication that unemployment is not a significant risk factor for Aboriginal suicide (p 131). This is further contradicted when Tatz points to the occurrence of Aboriginal people 'having titles attached to their jobs, receiving pay rather than dole packets', as resulting in something like a 'miracle of morale boosting' for Aboriginal CDEP participants (p 130). He suggests that CDEP should be expanded with no ceiling on the numbers of participants. Therefore, it seems that being actively engaged in some sort of employment, even if it is regarded as menial work, may in fact be a significant factor in preventing Aboriginal suicide.

Tatz draws the reader's attention to comparative studies in the field of suicidology and, while asserting that international comparative research is useful in other contexts, he is less convinced of 'the value of comparison in suicidology' (p 162). Tatz rejects the mental health approach as being too individualistic and points to the 'large body of evidence in the literature' that the explanation of Aboriginal suicide is more likely to be found in 'social and political contexts' (p 162). Throughout his book Tatz is trying to liberate research on Aboriginal suicide from the 'isolation wards of science' or 'conventional suicidology', which he claims is a western diagnostic model based on 'medical/psychological' ideas (pp 41, 181). The bio-medical approach to suicidology, according to Tatz, will not provide much insight into Aboriginal suicide and 'suicidology needs to be liberated from this domination by statistical method' (p 189). One would agree with Tatz's assertion that, in order to understand how Aboriginal suicide has come to be understood through the work of suicidologists, a discussion of the wider academic debate relating to Aboriginal suicide needs to be examined as well. That is, a multi-disciplinary approach must be taken in order to avoid narrow prescriptive approaches such as that of 'biological determinism' (p 191).

Tatz suggests that a separate field of study in Aboriginal suicidology needs to be established and the portrait of Aboriginal youth suicide, along with that of young Maoris and Canadian/American Indians, is not only different 'but is radically different' from non-Aboriginal young people. Given the large scale of this field study and the vast experience that Tatz has in the field of Indigenous studies, this book is essential reading for those who are interested in the field of Aboriginal suicidology.

Nigel Bennett  
Research, AIATSIS, Canberra

## References

- Alvarez, A 1971, *The savage god: a study of suicide*, Penguin Books, London.
- Hunter, Ernest, Joseph Reser, Mercy Baird, Paul Reser 2001 [1999], *An analysis of suicide in indigenous communities of North Queensland: the historical, cultural and symbolic landscape*, revised text, Department of Health and Aged Care, Canberra.
- Tatz, Colin 1999, *Aboriginal suicide is different: Aboriginal youth suicide in New South Wales, the Australian Capital Territory and New Zealand – towards a model of explanation and alleviation*, A report to the Criminology Research Council, Canberra

*Ancestral power: the dreaming, consciousness and Aboriginal Australians* by Lynne Hume, 210pp, Melbourne University Press, Melbourne 2002, \$39.95

A book dealing with the more esoteric, or subjective, side of Aboriginal religious experience is timely and possibly overdue. Elkin's *Aboriginal men of high degree* was first published in 1945. In the foreword to the 1976 edition (reprinted in the 1977 and 1994 editions), Jeremy Beckett comments that, 'despite the expansion of Aboriginal studies, it remains the only substantial work on what might be called the Aboriginal occult'.<sup>1</sup>

And yet another twenty-five years have passed and his comment still holds true. That is why Hume's work is in many ways groundbreaking.

The scope of *Ancestral power* goes beyond that of Elkin. He was interested in the very specific personality of the 'clever men', their making and their powers. Although covering much of the same ground, Hume's work is more ambitious. She wants to analyse the Dreaming and try to understand it through the role it plays in the personal experiences of Aboriginal Australians who, she argues, can interact with it as a living reality during altered states of consciousness (ASC). Hume's approach to ASC is underpinned by the assumption that experience, the content of consciousness, is determined by cultural variables. At the same time she seeks to highlight that ASC have common essential elements across cultures.

There is another noteworthy difference between Hume and Elkin. Elkin worked extensively among Aboriginal people across the continent. Hume, on the other hand, comes to Aboriginal anthropology as an outsider and uses the texts of others as her 'field notes'. The outside perspective can of course be an advantage, and there is no reason why somebody coming from a background of religious studies should not be able to provide valuable insights into Aboriginal religion.

Hume draws on and seeks to relate three bodies of material:

1. extensive and widely ranging material on Aboriginal religious practices and worldviews;
2. information from other religious practices, mainly Hinduism and Buddhism, with which to contrast the Aboriginal material;
3. theories and case studies from the field of consciousness research with which to provide explanatory models for some of the reported experiences.

The Aboriginal material is drawn from across the continent, but particularly detailed examples come from Arnhem Land, the Kimberleys, the Western Desert and the south-east of South Australia. Much of the material Hume uses is from more specialised and possibly obscure publications or even so far unpublished sources. One of the contributions of her book is in bringing such material together and making it available to a wider audience.

Hume suggests that in Aboriginal society, as in other Indigenous societies, all phases of consciousness, such as 'dream', 'trance' or 'waking' experiences, are considered meaningful. Such societies are said to operate on a 'fully *polyphasic* consciousness', and Hume largely accepts this at face value, explaining the advantage of that position:

Western culture in general fails to prepare individuals for an easy, fearless exploration of alternate phases of consciousness ... Most ethnographers, for example, are not equipped with the experiential and conceptual material requisite for sophisticated research into the religious practices of other cultures. The tendency is for researchers in the field to explain another culture's stated experiences of alternate states of consciousness in terms of the Western medical model, which accords with a materialist worldview (p 5).

Hume attempts to understand Indigenous Australian concepts on their own terms by finding parallels in other cultures and, more importantly, by offering models that can

---

1. Elkin 1977, 1994: xvii.

explain the experiences without denying the reality of their essential elements. Providing explanations for some of the more esoteric aspects of Aboriginal (and generally human) experience that are both culturally appropriate yet scientifically palatable is of more than merely philosophical or theoretical value. The issue of people's spiritual attachment to land is of ongoing relevance in native title claims and heritage matters, yet in many regards the anthropological models to explain the 'spiritual' interrelationship of land, humans and other animals are, arguably, deficient, as Tonkinson has noted:

A different kind of tension, but potentially very important in the land claims process is that between Aboriginal conceptions of reality and Western legal precepts. For example Mardu people with whom I have worked in the Western Desert described how, during dreams, they would sometimes travel in dream-spirit form to their homelands. In this way they were able to maintain what they would regard as a physical presence in their country no matter where they were actually living. Significantly, these dream-spirit journeys enabled them to continue their vital role in fulfilling the religious imperative of 'looking after country'. The Mardu would be in no doubt that this cultural element satisfies legal requirements for evidence of 'continued occupation' of traditional territory. However, in a court of law or a Tribunal hearing, operating according to Western legal precepts, such 'presence' would surely be regarded as at best metaphysical, hence of dubious validity in that it cannot be subject to proof or disproof.<sup>2</sup>

Hume spends much of the book concentrating on two areas of experience. The first of these, which I found one of the most important sections of this book, relates to the discussion of 'Power' in chapter 4.

The notion that rituals and music may function as conduits for 'power' both generative and dangerous, from the Ancestral to the human sphere, leads Hume to take a closer look at the concept of 'power'. This starts with a brief historical and philosophical overview of the key concept 'energy' and an introduction of the notion of psychic energy. It is argued that psychic energy, although usually not visible, can be perceived in others and the environment. Hume shows that the notion of such energy is present cross-culturally and across Australia. Her examples are: *chi (qi)* from China; *n/um* of the Kalahari Bushmen; *kundalini* of the Hindu; *dumo* of Tibet; *libido* of psychotherapy; *mana* of Polynesia; *kunta kunta* of Cape York; *marr* of Arnhem Land; *guruwari* of the Walbiri; and later in the chapter, *miwi* from the Ngarrindjeri and *kurunpa* from the Pitjantjatjara.

Hume alludes to a suggestion by Donald Thomson that such energy might underlie all ritual and ceremonial life in Arnhem Land and her own approach seems to support this view more widely. She sets out how people interact with this energy in sacred rituals, for example by pressing their bodies against sacred objects, touching paintings or engaging with particular sites, and emphasises the notion of reciprocity that underlies these interactions. This point can be extremely relevant to some of the current arguments surrounding Aboriginal people's attachment to land.

Hume's second key point regards a category of experiences which occur during sleep and which her examples show to be recognised across Aboriginal Australia. Both men and women, 'clever' or not, are held to be able to fly about in their spirit body, visit distant country, meet deceased relatives or even Dreaming Ancestors and obtain infor-

---

<sup>2</sup> Tonkinson 1997: 7.

mation for songs and ceremonies. Hume touches on this again and again and seeks to substantiate it as a form of interaction with the Dreaming. She shows the pivotal role of the Dreaming in society and points out the many layers of information carried in mythology. Then she looks at the concept linguistically, at its origins from Spencer and Gillen's translation of *altjiranga ngambakala* and the interesting relationship between Indigenous words for the Dreaming and the nocturnal dream. Hume finds that in some languages, as in Arrernte, the words for these two 'events' are indeed related. In other languages there is no such linguistic connection, yet the Dreaming is still related to dreams. Based on Stanner, Hume says:

For [the Murinbata] the Dreaming (*demnginoi*) was, and still is. People of mystical ability who draw special powers from the existent Dreaming, 'do so not by thought (*bemkanin*) which is like a dream in the head, but by dream (*nin*) itself ... It lets them cross all the divisions of time space and category'. This comment demonstrates that although a dream is not the same as the Dreaming, it is nevertheless a way to access Dreaming reality, which is exactly what Stanner speculated (pp 31–2).

This is central to Hume's argument: through altered states of consciousness, of which 'dreaming' is one, people can, quite literally, contact other dimensions, that is the Dreaming. In fact, what people are actually describing, Hume suggests, is not 'dreams' but so called 'out-of-body experiences' or 'astral journeys'. There is a brief reference to a pioneering researcher of this experience, Robert Crookall, and some examples to show that the experience is recognised cross-culturally. This is an important element in Hume's reasoning and she is clearly conscious that this sort of subject matter may receive a hostile reception among fellow academics. Consequently, it is a shame that the argument is somewhat scattered across the book. It could have benefited from being treated more concisely and from a more careful analysis of the experience by drawing on the more recent body of literature regarding it.

Other important topics covered throughout the book are the religious, esoteric and consciousness altering roles of ceremony, music, song and art. Benign and malign magical practices as well as the making and powers of 'clever people' are also covered in some detail.

While the general approach and the variety of sources, including some remarkable and detailed case studies,<sup>3</sup> should make this a very valuable work, it is somewhat undermined by a number of shortcomings. Firstly there are editorial issues. The presentation of the material is at times disjointed; arguments and examples are repeated across different chapters and even within chapters, especially in the latter part of the book. The spelling of Indigenous words is inconsistent and their translations not always convincing. The particular example that struck me is the translation, I assume adopted from Catherine Ellis, of the Pitjantjatjara phrase '*inma pulka inkanyi*' as 'singing in a strongly accented style'. While this might be an ethnomusicologist's interpretation of the song style, the words simply mean 'singing a big {ie important} song'. Secondly, and more substantially, there are a few passages which, to my mind, detract from the important overall points that are being made by fudging some of the complex issues that arise in consciousness research. One example is the following sentence:

<sup>3</sup> For example, the story of Paddy Compass Namadbara (pp 115–19), which was originally recorded by Ian White.

The flow of psychic energy in the body may be interpreted in some cultures as a 'dreambody', soul, subtle body, or energy body, which may have the capacity to metamorphose or vanish at will and travel to other worlds (p 58).

This has really no bearing on the presentation of the Aboriginal material and confuses the very two issues which Hume otherwise treats quite distinctly: the actions of energies (power) felt in the physical body, and those of a 'dreambody' engaging in journeys while the physical body sleeps. Accuracy on these topics is particularly crucial, as many readers will be new to and critical of the sort of concepts espoused.

Towards the end of the book, Hume states:

Certainly, there is still much research to be done in this area, and it is hoped that other researchers may pursue some of the ideas that have been offered, even if only as a result of indignation at what is suggested (p 164).

I am by no means indignant at her suggestions, which are themselves an important contribution to current academic discourse. For that very reason their presentation is at times a little disappointing. In spite of that, *Ancestral power* provides a convenient starting point for others wishing to delve into this fascinating subject matter.

K McCaul, Adelaide

## References

- Elkin, Adolphus Peter 1977, 1994, *Aboriginal men of high degree*, University of Queensland Press, St Lucia.
- Tonkinson, Robert 1997, 'Anthropology and Aboriginal tradition: the Hindmarsh Island Bridge affair and the politics of interpretation', *Oceania* 68(1): 1-26.

*People of the rivermouth: the Joborr texts of Frank Gurrmanamana*, book and CD-ROM by Frank Gurrmanamana, Les Hiatt and Kim McKenzie with Betty Ngurrabangurraba, Betty Meehan and Rhys Jones, 198pp, National Museum of Australia and Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra 2002, \$135.00

This is a remarkable publication about which it is difficult to do justice in a short review. *People of the rivermouth* is an almost encyclopedic work with a single Aboriginal community as its subject. It deals with the Anbarra people of the Blyth River in northern Arnhem Land and results from a long period of collaboration between the Anbarra and leading scholars, most notably the prominent Australian anthropologist Les Hiatt. The book and its accompanying CD-ROM are based on twenty fascinating texts. These were the outcome of communications between Hiatt and Frank Gurrmanamana in 1960 that explained some of the principal features of Anbarra society. The texts are published in Frank's language, Gidjingarli, and English. The CD-ROM provides them in oral form and includes much information about their wider cultural, environmental and historical contexts.

'Here is a land', Kim McKenzie writes in the Introduction, 'with stories that flow back and forth between the present and a past beyond any records, much as its river moves with each tide' (p xii). Each text is a dialogue between imagined people, most of

whom are related to one another. The word these people use for correct behaviour is *Joborr*. The texts, all translated by Hiatt, are divided into sections that describe key events in a life time: growing up, the formalities of marriage, love's variations and vicissitudes, men's business and the formalities of death. Within each set of events, various key issues are described and explained. Each section includes lists of the individuals involved, 'cast' diagrams, synopses and explanatory notes.

To take just one example, part of the section on love deals with sharing a wife. There are five cast members, a man, his wife, his sister, his sister's daughter and his sister's daughter's son. A married woman has a relationship with her husband's grandnephew that has her husband's approval. He returns from a journey and the following conversation occurs.

Ngaya [husband] to Mengga [wife]:  
 Who did you sleep with?  
 Mengga to Ngaya:  
 Just as you told me – only your grand-nephew.  
 Ngaya to Mengga:  
 Fine, all is well (p 91).

The explanatory note observes that the text 'exemplifies the warm and mutually supportive relationship that normally exists between a male and his maternal great-uncle' (p 90). In general, McKenzie comments, the texts are not prescriptive and are concerned with how the narrator 'saw social structures operating in day-to-day Anbarra lives' (p xiii).

*People of the rivermouth* is an outstanding contribution to scholarship. The National Museum of Australia and the Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies must be congratulated on its publication in both book and multimedia format. It provides the most revealing examination of a single Aboriginal community that I have encountered. The texts and CD-ROM took me into a world that is not far from my own in Darwin but in some respects radically different. They provide illumination and understanding. While the focus is on one man and his community, the texts also deal with cultural situations that exist in all human societies. The book is most attractively produced, with a striking cover, sturdy binding and very attractive page designs. The CD-ROM is also well designed and produced. It would be a shame if the high recommended retail price prevents the publication from reaching the wide readership it deserves.

David Carment  
 Northern Territory University  
 Darwin

*Rak Badjalarr: Wangga songs for North Peron Island by Bobby Lane, Belyuen Community, Northwest Australia*, CD (19 tracks), and short book (39 pp) by Allan Marett, Linda Barwick and Lysbeth Ford, Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra 2001

*Wangga* music of the Daly region is distinctive and engaging. The opening phrases with the didjeridu seem to go right into your bones and make you want to jump up and

dance. This collection is extremely listenable, and the accompanying book is an excellent exposition of *wangga*.

The late Bobby Lane (1941–1993) was a great song man. From his home in Belyuen Community on the Cox Peninsula across the harbour from Darwin, he brought into being songs about the Cox homeland and about his ancestral sites on Peron Island to the south near the mouth of the Daly River. Allan Marett and Linda Barwick are ethnomusicologists, and Marett has worked with people at Belyuen for many years. Bobby Lane was one of his teachers, and is remembered at home as one of the great Wadjiginy songmen. Lysbeth Ford is a linguist who has worked extensively with several of the languages spoken within the Belyuen community. These scholars have long collaborated with each other and with Aboriginal people in this north-west region. Their collective work has developed many insights into the relationships between song and spirit, life and death, music, memory and cultural survival.

The process by which songs are brought into being involves dreams and interactions with song-giving spirits. According to the authors, Bobby Lane ‘likened the experience’ of learning songs ‘to watching Frank Sinatra or Bing Crosby sing on film’ (p 4). The songs concern real incidents and real people, and a number of the incidents remembered in the song took place at Belyuen itself (see Marett 2000 for a rich analysis). ‘Rak Badjalarr’ refers to Bobby Lane’s father’s country at North Peron Island, and the song was brought into being with a vision of ‘Audrey Lippo eating oysters near some rocks at Mandorah’ where the wharf now is (p 11).

*Wangga* is dance music. It is not secret, and these days is performed for ‘secular’ events such as school graduations, but the authors note that even in such contexts the ‘songs retain their spiritual power’ (p 2). The power of songs is also sustained through their work in holding and communicating shared memories, shared relationships between past and present, and between people, places, Dreamings, and ancestral power. These are complex issues, related in thoroughly accessible fashion in the book.

A larger portion of the book analyses the actual songs – their rhythmic patterns, the structure of various measured and unmeasured songs, and the interweaving of instruments and song texts. There are transcriptions and translations of all the song texts, and there are several different performances of one song. A few songs recorded in the past are included on the CD, thereby enhancing the historic depth of the musical experience.

One of the most interesting aspects of the textual and musical exposition is that many of the explanations for the songs are in Bobby Lane’s own words. Thus, for example, the fourth track concerns a site that is a deep hole in the ocean bed between South Peron Island and the mouth of the Daly River. Bobby Lane said: ‘*Bandawarra-ngalgin* this means far away, out in the middle of the water, the tide is coming in *kadjemene kabarambarra*; *ngalefiyitj* means you sit there clapping hands; *kakkungbende ngappuring Badjalarr* this means I’m going to a place called Peron Island’. The middle verse or song text is translated: ‘stand up and dance, women, for us both’ (pp 14–15).

*Wangga* is a song tradition that is vibrantly alive and travelling. Songs are traded, learned and sung all through the region from Cox south through the Daly Reserve and on south into the Victoria River valley, as well west into the Kimberley. The tradition is a contemporary form of Indigenous memory, connectivity across ontological domains,

identity, and social commentary. At home in Belyuen, younger people are continuing to perform Bobby Lane's songs, and to add to the repertoire of knowledge and experience. The final track is another version of the title track Rak Badjalarr. It is sung by Colin Warrambu Ferguson accompanied by Nicky Djarug on didjeridu and was recorded by Marett in 1997, four years after Lane's death. The authors report: 'On the occasion of this performance, Bobby Lane's ghost appeared, manifesting itself as blue-green lights and a cool breeze ... The performance concludes with a ritual call ... for the country and for Bobby's spirit' (p 36).

This CD is a tribute to Bobby Lane's life and creativity, bringing us both the history and future of his oeuvre along with his own spectacular performances. It will be valued locally and across the region; at the same time it generously takes this engaging work out into other homes and communities around the world. The songs and texts are reproduced with the permission of the Lane family, and royalties are returned to the family.

Deborah Rose, CRES, ANU

### Reference

Marett, A 2000, 'Ghostly voices: some observations on song-creation, ceremony and being in NW Australia', *Oceania* 71(1): 18-29.

*The town grew up dancing: the life and art of Wenten Rubuntja* by Wenten Rubuntja and Jenny Green with contributions from Tim Rowse, 196pp, Jukurrpa Books, IAD Press, Alice Springs, 2002, hardback \$59.95

Once upon a time history was the stories of great men. During the past two centuries however, western historians moved towards the idea that history is made by people in the plural. An equivalent issue for biography has been where to position the subject. Will it be in the role of an individual acting upon the world? Or of someone less individual, who is acted upon by life and in turn acts from a sense of the potential of their time? There is no doubt about where the hero of this history stands. Wenten Rubuntja (born 1920s) is the diplomatic representative of *his people*. He identifies his people not narrowly but in many contexts. Thus his life story, rather than being merely the adventures of a western-style hero, is a layering of many stories of the people, events and places that have come into and spread out from his life. As the title of the book indicates, it is at one level the biography of Alice Springs (Mparntwe), a town that 'grew up dancing'. At another, it is a story of some decades of policy making on questions of land rights. It is, as well, a history of cultural brokerage. Wenten, his people, the local 'city', and the whitefellas in Canberra are seen to have influenced each other's lives. More than that: the extraordinary success of this biography-cum-autobiography is in showing the processes *within* as well as between people, by which history has been made.

Wenten is an all-rounder who fashions the tools for acting upon life, over the years broaching his circumstances on many fronts. Since his teens he's been an outback man presenting a Hollywood style of dress – he is especially known for his hats. Another guise is the mission Christian. He has been brickmaker, drover, timber-cutter, butcher, cook, administrator, responsible family member, alcoholic – now reformed, man of Abo-

iginal law, committee and board member, artist, storyteller, historian, word-spinner, and that's not all the roles he has played.

Especially interesting is the synthesis he makes of the many parts of his life. Jenny Green and Tim Rowse who thread the life story together have given first place to Wenten's voice. We read him three ways, speaking Arrernte, speaking a mixture of Arrernte and Aboriginal Australian, and using the language of Australia. One form of expression follows the other, making an interleaved text to marry with the intercultural content of the book. It has the effect of bringing the reader into position as one type of listener, then another; of revealing Wenten in action as an interlocutor; and of showing that a topic of conversation may be geared to one language rather than another. That voice, with its rich play of imagery and language, is what makes the book memorable.

Not only is Wenten Rubuntja a man of several languages and many more dialogues, his use of language reveals a mental pattern of connection in which ideas shift between different frameworks of reference. I believe that people of all cultures use metaphors, yet metaphor does not function equally in all societies. Europeans experience this compression more expressly in poetry. For Wenten, it may be the crux of how meaning is established. Here are some examples from the book (quoting the English translation):

- He was working in the kitchen at Amoonguna in the early years of the land rights movement and a verbal image for the sheer hard work that would be entailed arose from that kitchen – land rights was like a lot of people needing to be fed. 'Everybody used to come up and cry, "You got to cook lot of dinner now, boss, you got to cook a lot of dinner now". "Oh, look at the crowd there. Trucks coming in, Land rights now, land rights now."'
- Wenten describes his major effort of recent decades as 'work for country', and explains the significant work of Jesus in the light of a like commitment to two countries – this world and heaven – for which Jesus has dual forms of responsibility according to an Arrernte style of inheritance through mother and father.
- Wenten's is not the only voice that finds correspondences – direct and ironic – between historical characters, symbolic actions and dual belief systems. Ruby, his older sister (now deceased), tells how white people coming to Arrernte country scorned the Aboriginal people's values:

They used to shoot at their stone axes ... They tried to get the early days people into clothes ... showed them how to cook food as well – 'This is how to turn it over in the coals', the whitefellas said ... [As to which European first] came in this direction and opened up the way. We just used to say 'Captain Cook' – I don't know what his name really was.

In these examples, one way of thinking is overlaid on another, when to the speaker both could seem equally appropriate. The reader does not have to go far to find a basis for some of Wenten's connections. One recurrent idea is of people mixing together equally. He approves the notion on principle, as many of us do. But behind Wenten's endorsement is a history of being separated out: not being allowed to go into town after dark because of being Aboriginal; having to move house out of town because of being Aboriginal; not allowed to buy alcohol because of being a ward of the state; disallowed the vote because of ditto. Those institutional stratagems of separation may be in the past, yet habits of separation are still strong in Australia and are manifest in Wenten's speech. One such habit is enshrined in the terms Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal. For

many Australians the division makes no genealogical sense: families that have been here for over a century very likely have an Aboriginal input even if they don't know it and the same is true of many people who are designated Aboriginal. Culturally, it is another matter. The difference is now understood in terms of a richer local culture that is Arrerntne (or other Aboriginal group), and the wider community (including the Arrernte) that is straining towards locality and at the same time is heavily involved in globality. Wenten's several voices have echoes in all of us.

For an art historian perhaps the most intriguing aspect of the book is the positioning of Wenten's paintings. Jenny Green discusses art insightfully under the heading 'Living Under Two Laws', yet in the main the reproductions and their extended captions are detached from the text, present in the same way as Wenten's voice, with the minimum of intervention by the book's other authors. Provided the reader keeps alternative spellings in mind, the index is a useful way of moving between an image and related parts of the text, maps and other images.

Wenten utilises the western style of Albert Namatjira (his father's cousin) and the dot style of Papunya — the history of which goes way back into the region's past. They are modes to which he has a right through family and country; likewise they are forms of communication equivalent to the region's multilingual habit of speech. However, looking at the reproductions before and as I read the book, I thought I had an insight into something Wenten's paintings express that is quite distinct from his verbal expression. Compared with Wenten's practice as a wordsmith, his paintings are more hieratic, the imagery is less inflected with irony, the message is ideal rather than negotiable, and quite often the impact is blazingly clear and beautiful. The form that fixes a subject for Wenten is markedly symmetrical. In acrylic there will typically be a central motif determining the orientation of other motifs arrayed in compass order. Correspondingly, in watercolour there will often be two trees, a pair of hills or steep rocks flanking a centre. The key is mirror repetition; and the visual effect of mirroring is magic realism or hypnotic affirmation. I found the ideal twinship of Wenten's preferred pictorial form reminiscent of the utopian duality that has been his political dream. Jenny Green sees it stemming from 'the kinship system' of 'two intersecting moieties (resulting in four distinct kin categories)'.

The style of magic realism is faintly reminiscent of Ginger Riley (who also acknowledges a debt to Namatjira) and owes something to Walt Disney, especially some images describing a central pool of water and a yellow road snaking to hills on the horizon. A few watercolours using the dot technique could indicate a more deliberate dialogism between Western Desert and western styles. In terms of subjects there appears to be a consistency of sorts in how each style is used. Namatjira's style is employed for scenes that have more or less western, and biographical reference, and is more often than not used for Namatjira's subjects (yet there is not a huge overlap between the artists' subjects). The so-called Papunya style is used when ceremonial significance is uppermost. I note also that the components of paintings — waterhole, hill, rock, waterhole, tracks, cross-cousins, sisters — may be the same regardless of whether the presentation is map-like or perspectival. If some acrylics describe a heraldry of Dreamings, the majority of the watercolours are a pilgrim's progress blocked by boulders, cliff, water, hill, sinuous tree. Whereas Namatjira's typical orientation is horizontal, with the viewer outside and, as it were, to one side, Wenten differs in orient-

ing the viewer inward via a path into the landscape. In those several ways the artist suggestively parallels the mythic forms of his two cultures.

Wenten says 'When I stopped racing I became an artist'. The cowboy and artist may have connected for him because they were jobs that had a high style:

I was a proper cowboy ... My horse had a star-patterned breastplate – just like old Gene Autry's and old Buck Jones's. I was a good jockey [at the Hermannsburg horse races] ... and I used to have a rifle in the front pouch like a cowboy. And boots just like that – with [high heels] and spurs. I made all the women at Hermannsburg fancy me.

Similarly, he came to painting through emulating 'the old man' Albert Namatjira, who was a household name around Australia in the 1940s and 1950s. 'I wanted to learn' so (during one of the periodic lay-off times when stockmen were not needed):

I come back and see the old man doing the job long Todd River, then I been get a painting board, then me been start then. And me been forget about stock work – I been sit down with the painting now, till I get to now. For reconciliation and all the organizations, Land Council, Congress, Legal Aid and all that one.

With emulating Namatjira came the responsibility to be a leader within his family and local community, and an ambassador nationally and internationally.

Wenten's part in the past few decades' story of reversible destiny has been as a negotiator with a delayed (poetic) style of address; who has known how to seize the moment, and to present all parties with a winning position. His people, as he reminds us, include all Australians of recent times, thus at the broadest level his diplomacy reflects the collective wisdom and purposeful direction of thought of Australians at large. As he says, the process has to be correct all the way through, 'You had to get the right country, get the right Dreamtime story – don't get somebody else's. Because you've got *kwertengerle*.' *Kwertengerle* is a serious responsibility for mother's and mother's brother's land and Dreamings, though they are not directly one's own. The same offsider responsibility characterises the role of the Senate in the business of government.

When Parliament reads and they got to take-em to go through the senate. That's all the *kwertengerle* ... Senate mob can't just make their own law before it goes through the *arlperrepwentye* mob, see – then they got to go back again. Whitefella law has always been like that as well. Politician is *arlperrepwentye*; *kwertengerle* is the senate.

The success of the book, amounting to a breakthrough in the art of biography, owes much to the wise and imaginative curatorship of Jenny Green and Tim Rowse. What has been in the past dryly explained by experts as an 'Aboriginal' style of amalgamating disparate beliefs and stories comes alive in Wenten Rubuntja's effective use of metaphor in speech and the utopian idealism of his paintings. As Wenten remarked on reading the text, 'This book is really good – people have got to read it'.

Mary Eagle  
Centre for Cross-Cultural  
Research, ANU

*A cosmos in stone: interpreting religion and society through rock art* by J. David Lewis-Williams, Altamira Press, Rowman and Littlefield, Walnut Creek, California, 2002 \$US29.95

David Lewis-Williams's work on San rock art and ethnography is well known among rock art researchers and is widely recognised as innovative and highly insightful. His extension of a shamanic interpretation to the Palaeolithic cave art of south-western Europe,<sup>1</sup> however, has been less enthusiastically received – indeed it has been the subject of sometimes quite acrimonious criticism. An explicit reply to such critique was published in 2001.<sup>2</sup> In the present volume Lewis-Williams invites the reader to retrace with him the intellectual journey of some thirty years of research, through philosophical developments in anthropology and archaeology, that has led him to the interpretation of concepts encoded in San and Palaeolithic art. The format chosen for this is to reprint a selection of eleven papers, each prefaced with an introduction and rounded off with a 'Retrospect', except for three published within the last decade which, in his own words 'are too recent to warrant retrospection' (p 190).

An introductory chapter presents a historical outline of developments in rock art research that led to the heady days of the 'New Archaeology' (processualism), the structural functionalism of British anthropology and, in France, the structuralism of Levi Strauss – an era of intellectual optimism in the power of the 'scientific manipulation of objective data', and within which the then young Lewis-Williams began his career.

Chapters 2–7 develop his South African research in which initial recording and analysis of the art left him dissatisfied with the statistical distributional approach then advocated. Inspired by the ethos of 'participatory anthropology' as propounded by Malinowski and others, he turned to the 'Bleek' archives of interviews with /Xam informants, the only verbatim records of /Xam myths and practices. Comparing this material with recent anthropological work with other San groups confirmed the broadly homogeneous nature of San cultures, particularly of the centrality of shamanism in articulating San culture. The particular insight that Lewis-Williams brought to bear in his work, however, is his emphasis on the importance of understanding the metaphors of language that are necessarily culturally informed. Reference to research on altered states of consciousness then enabled him to identify the metaphors that evoke visions, sensations and other features experienced in trance in what otherwise seemed incomprehensible statements by Bleek's informants. A return to the art led him to the identification of features that evoke shamanistic experience.

The conclusion to chapter 6 that 'Eventually, we may be able to use these insights to formulate general principles of shamanistic rock art' foreshadows his rationale for expanding this work into other regions, particularly as he affirms the universality of shamanism (defined as institutionalised altered states of consciousness) among all hunter-gatherer societies (pp 175, 197). If this were so, the practice would likely have great antiquity and, in some form, would likely have been practised by the hunter-gatherers of Palaeolithic south-western Europe.

---

1. Clottes and Lewis-Williams 1998.

2. Clottes and Lewis-Williams 2001.

The universality of shamanism among hunter-gatherer societies, however, is not universally accepted! Shamanism has not been unambiguously recorded in Australian Aboriginal culture and is not a feature of Aboriginal religion and ritual. Lewis-Williams's references to Australia are somewhat peripheral, relying on Eliade (1972) for ethnography and an idiosyncratic paper by Sales (1992) on the Burrup 'climbing men' panel for rock art.

In view of the prevalence of shamanism among Arctic hunter-gatherer societies an antecedent in the European Palaeolithic does remain a thesis worthy of consideration. At this period in the late 1980s–1990s the influence of postmodernism in archaeological thinking led to a pessimism about the possibility of ever truly accessing past realities. Lewis-Williams reacted strongly against the negativity and high degree of relativism espoused particularly by writers such as Christopher Tilley or even the limitations of textual approaches to material culture of Ian Hodder and others. He follows Alison Wylie who insisted that the negativity of relativism can be overcome by recourse to the intertwining of distinct and independent sources of evidence.

Thus a crucial theoretical basis for asserting confidence in his San research lies in the convergence of three independent strands of evidence: the art, the ethnography, neurological data on altered states of consciousness. For the Palaeolithic the art is the only strand of evidence available. Ethnography is of course not available, and contrary to Lewis-Williams, one must argue that despite the universality of neurological phenomena, there is no *a priori* reason to presume that Palaeolithic peoples harnessed such experiences into cultural practices. Following his own theoretical precepts, evidence for such practices needs to be demonstrated from within the features of the art, *and* shown to be more probable than alternative explanations for these. Lewis-Williams achieves the first criterion with a close examination of both general and specific features of the art, and presents a compelling argument for the identification of visionary experiences depicted in settings that may both elicit and enhance such experiences. Possible alternative explanations are not entertained – though one must admit a coherent alternative system is not easy to advance.

In the closing chapters Lewis-Williams moves beyond the identification of rock art imagery to search for the specifics of cultural praxis within which the painting and viewing of these images served to mediate or subvert sociality. Many of the concepts developed in this section will be familiar from a quite different cultural context in the anthropology of Aboriginal art.

This book's relevance to an Australian readership lies, apart from its obvious intellectual interest, in its discussion of theory and method. Methodologically his research has led Lewis-Williams to argue strongly for the importance of the particular in rock art, and to emphasise the centrality of agency in cultural praxis – including the making and consumption of rock art – in interpretation of its social role. He admits that patterns obtained from numerical distributional studies have value in defining the broad parameters within which such more focused analysis can be located, but decries what he considers the explanatory futility of limiting research to statements about semiotic systems that mediated group interactions.

He proposed shamanism as a clue to the interpretation of Palaeolithic art. Few in Australia, I believe, would adduce shamanism to explore the meanings of Aboriginal

rock art, and in recent times there has been a healthy reluctance to extend even current beliefs and practices far back in time. For the remote past, we are still left with only one strand of evidence.

Andrée Rosenfeld  
Rathdowney, Queensland

### References

- Clottes, Jean et David Lewis-Williams 1998, *The shamans of prehistory: trance and magic in the painted caves*, translated from the French by Sophie Hawkes, Harry N. Abrams, New York.
- 2001, *Les chamanes de la préhistoire, texte intégral, polémique et réponses*, La Maison des Roches, Paris.
- Eliade, M 1972, *Shamanism: Archaic techniques of ecstasy*, Routledge & Kegan Paul, New York.
- Sales, K 1992, Ascent to the sky: a shamanic initiatory engraving from the Burrup Peninsula, *Archaeology in Oceania*, 27: 22–35.

***Broken Song: TGH Strehlow and Aboriginal possession*** by Barry Hill, 818pp, Random House Australia, 2002, \$59.95 [Vintage paperback \$39.95]

In June 1908, Theodor Georg Heinrich Strehlow was born at Hermannsburg Mission at the interface of three cultures: the German culture of his Lutheran missionary parents Carl and Frieda, the Arrernte culture of the people whom these parents had come to convert, and the British culture of the wider Australian society in which he lived. Throughout his life and career as anthropologist and linguist among the Arrernte, Strehlow's inter-cultural placement was the cornerstone for his accomplishments, but at the same time the troubled interaction of the three cultures would cause him much mental and emotional turmoil.

Hill's narrative begins with the Lutheran Mission at Killalpaninna, where Carl Strehlow was first stationed before moving on to Hermannsburg where Theodor was born, the youngest of six children. His siblings were taken back to Germany for their schooling when he was only three years old and he essentially grew up as an only child. Following Carl's dramatic death, mythically captured in Strehlow's *Journey to Horseshoe Bend*, fourteen-year-old TGH Strehlow was sent to a Lutheran boarding school in Adelaide. As we follow him from school to university, Hill impresses upon us Strehlow's cultural malaise as he is seeking a place in the English society of Adelaide, largely it seems by way of sports and the English girls he met at society balls. Following completion of his degree in English Literature and Linguistics, Strehlow secured a grant to return to Central Australia for the study of Arrernte oral literature. His life's work is set in motion, as are the principal themes that, at times with a certain monotony, accompany the reader throughout Hill's book. On the one hand there is Strehlow's sense of not fitting in, of being a 'stranger in the land that bore me' as he put it on his 1933 return to the Centre, a feeling that appears to be the flipside of his tangible superiority com-

plex. On the other hand there is Hill, ever critical of every word Strehlow wrote in diaries or elsewhere, and unforgiving in his analysis of the man himself.

Part III of the book, 'Patrolling', is structured around Strehlow's experience as Patrol Officer in Central Australia in the late 1930s. It casts a wide net introducing many of the principal players in Aboriginal affairs, and portraying attitudes, political pressures and living conditions for both black and white in the Centre during that period. In the midst of all this was Strehlow, stationed at Jay Creek with his young wife Bertha. He was charged with keeping an eye on 4 600 Aboriginal people, the majority of whom were classified as 'nomads', in an area the size of England. He would appear to have acquitted himself well, even in the unforgiving task of overseeing the quality of the relationships between white station managers and their Aboriginal employees. He was especially unpopular among the pastoral establishment for policing the interactions of white workers and Aboriginal women. In 1940 he found himself accused in parliament of being a Nazi, a fifth columnist preparing the Centre's 'blackfellows' to rally to Hitler's aid. This was too ludicrous an accusation to cause his dismissal, but it raised tensions, tensions that were not helped by Strehlow's own style, which persistently challenged the insidious grain of racism in Northern Territory Aboriginal affairs and within his own department. The ongoing friction with his superiors finally erupted and he was forced to quit his job and join the army. Officially it was to be only a temporary absence from his post, but at the end of the war he returned to Adelaide University, this time as a member of staff. In that position he continued his research among the Arrernte and neighbouring people for the rest of his life.

The book's focus then turns to 'translation' and in particular Strehlow's ability to translate Arrernte to English. Following a more general chapter on translation, Hill looks at Strehlow's official work for *Songs of Central Australia* (Arrernte to English), his nocturnal work on refining his father's Bible translation (English to Arrernte), and finally his well documented role as translator in the Stuart case. He tries to split Strehlow, and to some extent the world around him, into two personas. Caliban, drawn from Shakespeare's *Tempest*, is the persona of the primal, magico-religious domain of the indigene. This is Strehlow the *ingkata*, totemite and keeper of secrets. The other is Luther, based on the historical founder of Strehlow's inherited faith. This is the serious Germanic Strehlow who spends his nights on bible translation and judges both Arandic culture and that of the Anglophone Australians from the German-Christian vantage point.

The accuracy of this metaphorical divide is questionable, and it seems to lead to a certain pigeonholing of perhaps more complex issues. More importantly though, the value of this section is compromised by the fact that Hill does not speak Arrernte. That is not to say, as Strehlow may have done, that Hill should be fluent in Arrernte to comment on the worth of his work, but in light of some of the analysis undertaken it is frustrating that the author made no attempt to compensate for a lack of language by consulting people who do speak it, or drawing on an Arrernte-English dictionary such as that of John Henderson and Veronica Dobson. Hill forcefully makes the point that Strehlow was no poet, or at best only a second rate poet. He seems to be suggesting that Strehlow would have done better not to impose his own poetic shortcomings onto the Arrernte verses he was trying to place into the pantheon of world poetry. But in the end this remains Hill's own considered opinion about what he labels Strehlow's genetically-German English. Perhaps Hill is right, but for all the reader knows, Arrernte speakers

may think Strehlow's translations are 'spot on', in which case Hill's theoretical arguments on the art of translation would become inconsequential.

The remainder of the book documents Strehlow's increasing entanglement with the objects of his collection (*tjurunga*) and the subject of his studies (the Arrernte people and their language). For much of his life Strehlow seemed to view himself as the only white person who could properly understand Arrernte society and value their sacred objects, ceremonies and songs, knowledge of which he acquired throughout his life. In his final years, Strehlow became possessed by his possessions, thinking of himself as 'the last Aranda man' misplaced in a world where white power brokers and Europeanised Arrernte have all ceased to value the sacred traditions which only he still knew.

From Strehlow's perspective, the only other person who understood is his second wife, for whom he unceremoniously left Bertha and their three children, all of whom he subsequently ignored. With the exception of this new 'love', his life seems to have become a stream of dysfunctional relationships: he engaged in continuous pitched battles with the newly established Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies, maintained a lifelong grudge against those academics in England who did not recognise his genius, complained generally and quite unreasonably about lack of funding and recognition from the world around, and even fell out with a number of Lutheran colleagues and friends, although it is among his faith that he finds recognition and support until the end. The anthropologist Ronald Berndt figures as a loyal friend until the 'atom bomb' (Strehlow's words) of the so-called *Stern* case, where images secret and sacred to the Arrernte were sold by Strehlow and published in popular magazines first in Germany and subsequently, against Strehlow's explicit instructions, in Australia. Then even Berndt took a step back.

This is a very critical portrait of Strehlow, and although his ethnographic and linguistic contributions are occasionally given their due, Hill's primary focus seems to be on Strehlow's failures in life. We read how he failed as husband and father, as writer, as translator, as 'friend of the Arrernte', and so on until his very life itself becomes the *Broken Song* of Hill's title. Even before Strehlow's dramatic death, one feels confronted with a man whose life has gone terribly amiss and who, perhaps as a result, has spent his last few years in what looks like a mental and emotional hell.

This is not a light story. Hill's delivery is fairly heavy and editorial oversights of grammar, typography and dates (including Strehlow's birthday) may trip the reader up. The real burden overshadowing the book of course lies in Strehlow's increasingly troubled mind. It is from that mind as revealed in Strehlow's extensive diaries that this book largely derives. Hill enjoyed 'exclusive access' to these diaries and perhaps that is the reason why he does not draw more on anecdotal information from colleagues, family and friends. That may have been a way to lighten the picture and also to complete it, by widening the lens and capturing aspects of Strehlow perhaps not revealed in his own self-images.

That is not to say that Hill's approach is narrow. In fact he tackles his subject from many angles and there are times when Strehlow can disappear from view entirely as Hill takes the reader through extensive background discussions. An historical perspective runs through the book, looking at Strehlow's place in the wider realm of Australian Aboriginal affairs and, according to the primary influences at various stages of

Strehlow's life, examining the roles played by missions, patrol officers, government departments, academic researchers and so on. There is the literary perspective which questions the merit of Strehlow's poetry and prose and the linguistic perspective which queries the strength of his translations. The psychological perspective, mostly Freudian but never fully developed, analyses the workings of Strehlow's mind, his self-obsession, immaturities, self-pity, fear and loathing. The anthropological perspective seeks to show how Strehlow's puritan descriptions of Arrernte society fail to take account of its evolutionary capacity and its ability to sustain itself in spite of dramatic changes to the 'pristine' social structures which he documented. In view of such a multiplicity of arguments, lines of inquiry and literary genres, it is perhaps not surprising that not all the avenues followed are equally compelling, nor equally suited for every reader.

Yet, in spite of the apparent breadth, the image of Strehlow can be depressingly two-dimensional. It is here that the views of others may have helped. What, for example, do Arrernte people think? The book makes many judgements, about the ways in which Strehlow has failed the Arrernte, to whom, as far as he was concerned, he had dedicated his life. But what actually are the Arandic discourses, past and present, about their self-declared *ingkata*? One comes away feeling that somehow Strehlow's claim, that he was chosen as the one to be given information and objects, was of his own creation, a vital component of his personal mythology, and that the actual intent of his informants was different. We learn that at the height of the controversy that overshadowed the end of Strehlow's life, some Arrernte men accused him of theft and cultural appropriation. But what about those old men who impressed upon him the idea that they were not teaching their young men their secrets any more? Maybe these were political statements, not to be taken as literally as Strehlow seems to have done, but surely they were not just feeding his egotistic fantasies. What about those Arrernte people who now look gratefully upon Strehlow's collection as a cultural treasure trove that might have been lost without his obsession? Such multiple discourses, inherent in the world of Aboriginal affairs, may have had some role in Strehlow's psychological undoing, but that dimension is not really explored here. Nor are more mundane topics such as Strehlow's thirty odd years at Adelaide University (which remain fairly nebulous in the book), or his personal relationships as friend or colleague.

*Broken song* was launched at the 2002 Strehlow Conference in Alice Springs. The conference highlighted the complexities of TGH Strehlow and his chosen field. Hill's principal focus is Strehlow's production of *Songs of Central Australia*. There will be others more qualified to assess his critique of that particular issue, but generally it seems to me that there is still ample scope for further commentaries on the complex life and workings of TGH Strehlow.

K McCaul, Adelaide

## Reference

Henderson, John and Veronica Dobson 1994, *Eastern and Central Arrernte to English Dictionary*, Institute for Aboriginal Development Press, Alice Springs.

*Nhanda villages of the Victoria District, Western Australia* by Rupert Gerritsen, 31pp, Intellectual Property Publications, Canberra, [GPO Box A145, Canberra, ACT 2602], 2002

This short booklet is the latest by Rupert Gerritsen in a series of publications examining historical Aboriginal culture in the coastal region north and south of Geraldton, WA, an area once known as the Victoria District. 'Nhanda' refers to both the Aboriginal people along the coastline and their language.<sup>1</sup> The analysis and discussion of collections of huts in the region is based primarily on the 1839 accounts of George Grey, and constructed around his application of the term 'village' to describe one of the region's large multi-hut sites.<sup>2</sup> Gerritsen's analysis of the texts leads to the development of a settlement typology as support for his central argument: that Aboriginal groups were practicing agriculture and living sedentary lives on a multi-season basis.

The 'Background' section of the booklet introduces the region and its history, and briefly summarises the historical events that led to Grey's encounter with the 'villages'. Why the author chose to focus on the 'village' instead of including 'town' is not clear, as both terms appear in one of Grey's texts. Gerritsen reviews a number of later historical observations of single- and multi-hut sites. Several of the latter could be interpreted as 'villages' although they were not described by that term historically.

Gerritsen reviews evidence of extensive yam grounds, paths and wells in the proximity of the hut sites and generally throughout the region. In this booklet, which draws upon his previous publications, he makes a case for agricultural practice among Victoria District Aboriginal groups: '... the paths, the wells, the huts and the villages – all bespeak an agricultural society exhibiting a high degree of sedentism' (p4) and in conclusion states that 'the *Nhanda* people of the Victoria District were engaged in agriculture' (p 21). Such a controversial interpretation is in need of significantly more analysis and modelling than is presented. Gerritsen does not adequately review the contribution of pioneering research by Hallam<sup>3</sup> that first considered the association between yams, alluvial sites and 'villages', and proposed that south-west Aboriginal groups were living semi-sedentary lives in pre-European times. While Hallam considered these to be indigenous developments, Gerritsen suggested that they were the result of a yam introduced by Dutch sailors in 1629.

The booklet's 'Site identification' section relates the author's field investigations that aimed to identify 'village' and village-like sites recorded by Grey. The colour photographs of places visited are very useful for readers not familiar with the area. The reasons that these sites might match Grey's accounts are discussed. The first is on the narrow floodplain of the lower Hutt River, a site that Gerritsen subsequently registered with the Department of Indigenous Affairs in Perth. He noted from an inspection of surface features that the site is on 'a flat elevated terrace that does not appear to be a natural formation, being raised from 2-3m above the river's flood level' (p 6). Gerritsen's justification for the assertion of non-naturalness is not stated, but it seems more

---

1. Blevins 2001.

2. Clifton 1852 also used the term when he briefly noted a 'village of plastered huts' at a site on top of a hill on the Bowes River.

3. See Hallam 1986, 1989.

probable that this structure is an old alluvial terrace.<sup>4</sup> There follow several calculations that attempt to quantify aspects of settlement at this site. This includes measuring the dimensions of this terrace (p 7) and calculating the rate of cultural deposition, based on the assumption that it resulted from land use change stimulated by Dutch sailors post-1629 (p 18). These quantifications, and their comparison to results from archaeological sites in the Middle-East and meso-America, should be set aside pending sub-surface investigation.

Gerritsen's description of his field searches for Grey's village-like sites on the lower Hutt, Bowes and Greenough rivers<sup>5</sup> illustrates some of the difficulties and opportunities that arise from ground-truthing historical accounts. Gerritsen 'tentatively' concludes that the Victoria District huts, together with accounts of paths and wells, are indicative of multi-season sedentism (p 18). The emphasis on multi-seasonality is presented as an element of his Aboriginal agriculture hypothesis. While clay-covered huts and wells may represent intensive labour investment for immediate and long-term use, it is possible that yam grounds and well-trodden paths represent less intensive effort over longer periods. The analysis is conducted within a framework of European seasons, whereas evidence from the south-west suggests that six seasons were more typical in the lives of Aboriginal people.<sup>6</sup>

A second element of the hypothesis involves a spatially-configured schema for settlement patterns. Such a schema is not supported by the level of available detail about the locations of many hut sites, and the concentration of known sites in the near-coastal areas of regions belonging to local Aboriginal groups. In the schema, for example, both 'homesteads' and 'lodges' are defined as being 'at least 1km from any other structure' (p 20). The limited landscape view-shed of Grey and other European travellers along their routes makes it uncertain whether they could *see* more than 1km in all directions at hut sites. Having limited the analysis throughout to the accounts of Grey and one or two others, Gerritsen subsequently reveals other relevant historical evidence (p 20-21). This material could usefully have been included much earlier.

On a positive note, Gerritsen has made a significant discovery in finding a second account of Grey's walk from the Murchison River to Perth in 1839. This text is extremely valuable, as it states itself to be a verbatim account from Grey's now lost daily field notes. Analysis of the differences between this account<sup>7</sup> and the published version<sup>8</sup> would have been valuable as a foundation for this current research. In particular, why did Grey not mention the Hutt River 'village' sites in both accounts? Similarly, Gerritsen identifies an omission of hut observations from one version of Stokes' 1841 travels near Geraldton (p 23) without exploring its significance. The booklet would have benefited from a table of all historical quotations referenced, and a

---

4. 'Terraces form as a result of slow downward movement of the river bed ... leaving old flood-plains stranded above typical flood plains' Pen 1999: 75.

5. For the Greenough river [called the Irwin by Grey], Gerritsen's interpretation of Grey's route is at odds with prior studies that locate the route entirely on the Back Flats.

6. See Gentilli 1995; Meagher 1974.

7. Grey 1841a.

8. Grey 1841b.

topographic map showing the specific and approximate locations of the described sites and events.

Analyses of the mid-west coastal region's historical materials have a vital role to play at smaller and larger scales in understanding important questions posed by traditional owners, archaeologists, anthropologists, palaeoecologists and environmental historians. While at times this booklet presents cautious analysis of the historical record, the conclusions drawn are frequently beyond the limitations of the available data and at odds with what is understood about Aboriginal resource use in pre-European times. Nonetheless it will serve to stimulate interest in the history of the region and its Aboriginal people.

Michael O'Connor,  
Perth

### References

- Blevins, J 2001, *Nhanda: an Aboriginal language of Western Australia*, University of Hawai'i Press, Honolulu.
- Clifton, MW 1852, 'Mr Clifton's journal', *Perth Gazette*, 27 February 1852: 5.
- Gentili, J 1995, 'Notes on the climate of Perth, Western Australia', *The Western Australian Naturalist* 20(2): 65-91.
- Grey, George 1841a, 'Notes upon that portion of Western Australia which lies between Gantheaume Bay and the Arrowsmith River', in H S Chapman *The new settlement of Australind*, Harvey and Dutton, London: 41-54. *The New settlement of Australind in Western Australia* London : Printed by A. Spottiswoode, New-Street-Square, [c1842]
- 1841b, *Journals of two expeditions of discovery in North-west and Western Australia, during the years 1837, 38, and 39*, 2 vol, T & W Boone, London.
- Hallam, SJ 1986, 'Yams, alluvium and "villages" on the west coastal plain', *Archaeology at ANZAAS, Canberra*: 116-132.
- 1989, 'Plant usage and management in Southwest Australian Aboriginal societies' In DR Harris and GC Hillman (eds), *Foraging and farming: the evolution of plant exploitation*, Unwin Hyman, London: 136-151.
- Meagher, S 1974, 'The food resources of the Aborigines of the south-west of Western Australia', *Records of the Western Australian Museum* 3(1): 14-65.
- Pen, LJ 1999, *Managing our rivers: a guide to the nature and management of the streams of south-west Western Australia*, Water & Rivers Commission, East Perth.

*Aboriginal Sydney: a guide to important places of the past and present* by Melinda Hinkson, with photography by Alana Harris, 174pp, Aboriginal Studies Press for the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies, Canberra 2001, \$33.00

The Sydney region has a rich Aboriginal history and fortunately many places survive where this heritage can be seen. This guide book is a must for any visitor to or resident of Sydney who wishes to visit places that provide information about the life and culture of Aboriginal inhabitants of the Sydney region from the pre-colonial past to the present.

The book is well structured so that the fifty places to visit are grouped into several areas: The Central Business district; Around the harbour (Balls Head and Berry Island reserves and Sydney Harbour National Park); North of Sydney (Ku-ring-gai Chase and Garigal National Parks); Inner South (Redfern, Camperdown Cemetery, Bondi Golf Course); South of Sydney (Botany Bay National Park and La Perouse); West of Sydney (Parramatta, Blacktown and Cranebrook), and South-west of Sydney (Liverpool area and Bents Basin State Recreation Area). These sections are preceded by a short introduction 'Seeing the past in the present' which provides a brief historical overview and cultural context to the sites. The final section of the book provides a list of useful organisations from which additional information can be obtained, as well as references to the sources used in the book and further reading.

The places to visit include pre-colonial archaeological sites such as rock engravings at West Head, Grotto Point and Bondi, and shell middens at Balmoral Beach and Kurnell; early colonial sites such as the Blacktown Native Institution site; museums and art galleries with exhibitions about Aboriginal life and culture, eg the Australian Museum and Museum of Sydney in the CBD, and Muru Mittigar Culture Centre at Cranebrook; the *Cadi Jam Ora First Encounters* garden at the Royal Botanic Gardens where plants of the Sydney region which provided food and useful products are growing; as well as contemporary institutions such as NAISDA Dance College and Bangarra Dance Theatre, and buildings such as Yarra Bay, La Perouse, and The Empress Hotel, Redfern. As such it presents places which were of importance to Aboriginal people in the distant past and are important to them today.

Presentation is excellent with easy to read text and plentiful colour photographs. For each of the places to visit there is initially a brief description of what is present, the location according to UBD and Gregory's map books, how to get there, the facilities available and what time is needed for the visit. Thereafter follows a longer description giving the history and importance of the site and what is to be seen. Integrated with descriptions of the sites is information about key events and people connected with them.

There are, however, a couple of places where I query descriptions. At Grotto Point (p 46) the engraved figures are said to have been 'regrooved' to improve their visibility. Use of the term 're-grooved', for the process that was undertaken, is misleading as it implies that the grooves forming the outline of the figures have been deepened by *cutting* into the sandstone. What happened is that the sandstone surface within the grooves was cleaned of lichen and dirt by a technique that uses water and low or non-abrasive nylon brushes. This process lightens and thus highlights the grooves against the surrounding darker sandstone surface. At Captain Cook's Landing Place, Kurnell (p 101), the radiocarbon dated midden is behind the beach between The Watering Place

and The Landing Place (Megaw 1969: Plate 4), rather than beneath Alpha Farm House. The oldest radiocarbon date, 1330±100 (ANU-721), and a stratigraphically higher date of 360±110 (ANU-722), in conjunction with historical observations show the area was used as a campsite over the past 1300 years (Megaw 1974 p 36). At Parramatta Park (p 137), it is unlikely that middens of freshwater mussel shells occur in this area although several stone artefact scatters have been found in proximity to Parramatta River and Domain Creek.

These particular questions, however, do not detract from the overall worth of the book and I reiterate that it is a recommended purchase for visitors to and residents of Sydney.

Val Attenbrow  
Australian Museum, Sydney

### References

- Megaw, JVS 1969, Captain Cook and the Australian Aborigine, *Australian Natural History*, 16(8): 255–60.
- 1974, 'The recent archaeology of the south Sydney district: a summary' in *The recent archaeology of the Sydney District: excavations 1964–1967*, JVS Megaw (ed), AIAS, Canberra: 35–8.

*George Barrington's voyage to Botany Bay: retelling a convict's travel narrative of the 1790s* edited by Suzanne Rickard, 181pp, Leicester University Press, Leicester and New York, 2002, paperback £18.99

This is a curious publication. Beginning with a fine introduction by Suzanne Rickard and ending with many pages of detailed annotation, it offers in between the text of a book first published in 1793–1794. The original work pretended to be an autobiographical account of the experiences of the famous London pickpocket George Barrington, who was transported by the Second Fleet. The original text was partly fiction and partly a mishmash of passages taken from other works. None of it, in fact, was written by Barrington.

The purpose of the original fraud was to cash in on Barrington's celebrity and the current demand for books about the Antipodes. This new publication is equally misleading, at least in its title. It is not 'George Barrington's voyage'. It is not 'a convict's travel narrative'. It is the work of a literary hack who may never have left London. Rickard's introduction makes this clear enough, and yet buyers of the book might well complain of something like false advertising. A back-cover remark on 'the dubious publishing ethics' of the 1790s is delicious in the circumstances.

This little piece of modern fast practice tends to confuse the scholarship of Rickard's introduction. Barrington was a very interesting man, who played many parts in life and was ascribed many more. He was a wonderful symptom of the late eighteenth-century fascination with personal identity and the remaking of self. But in real life he had nothing to do with the text which Rickard is here introducing. The man and the text are linked

only by the motivation of the creators of the original book, so that really this motivation – the marketing of Barrington’s name – ought to be the main point of inquiry.

The introduction might have better used to deflect the lie on the front cover. Instead Rickard confuses the issue a little by various references to ‘Barrington’s publishers’, ‘Barrington’s account’ and so on. One section is headed ‘The convict’s eye’. On the other hand she includes a vivid story of Barrington’s criminal career and of the vicissitudes of his public image as well as an exhaustive account of the books about New South Wales to which his name was added (listed in the bibliography).

Especially interesting is her suggestion that because of Barrington’s celebrity these books were for many years fundamental to the popular image of Australia in Europe. This seems, in fact, to be the main significance of the present text. There is still work to be done, then, in relating this text to early nineteenth-century perceptions, and especially its references to Indigenous people. In describing Aboriginal customs and depicting Aboriginal personality it conveyed to a popular readership the Enlightenment attitudes of Arthur Phillip, Watkin Tench and others. At the same time there are plenty of anecdotes of the savage and exotic. The balance may be awkward, but if this text above all others shaped early English ideas about race in Australia it is certainly worth coming to grips with.

Alan Atkinson  
University of New England  
Armidale

*Forty years on: Ken Hale and Australian languages* edited by Jane Simpson, David Nash, Mary Laughren, Peter Austin and Barry Alpher, 528pp, Pacific Linguistics, Canberra, 2001, \$55.00

Ken Hale is undoubtedly one of the major figures in Australian linguistics. He first arrived from the US in 1959 and carried out major studies of the Arrernte and Warlpiri languages of Central Australia and Lardil from the Gulf of Carpentaria. His involvement in Australian linguistics has continued unabated with a series of published works on a variety of languages and issues right until the present.

In the late 1950s, Australian linguistics was still a long way from coming of age. Capell’s 1956 *A new approach to Australian linguistics* – now long superseded – was the only substantial reference source that was available, and the first university department of linguistics was not to be established until the mid-1960s. However, Ken Hale’s period of involvement has seen Australian linguistics develop a strong tradition of descriptive, theoretical and historical rigour. Ken Hale was also influential in seeing linguistics made relevant to the changing needs of speakers of Australian languages themselves, especially with his involvement in the establishment of the School of Australian Linguistics (pp 161–78).

Ken Hale’s extremely successful academic career is well covered in the excellent bibliographical summary of his contributions in this volume (pp 1–18); the entertaining and informative biographical information provided (pp xii–xiv and 19–43); and a variety of reminiscences (pp 113–22, 231–8 and 427–30).

What is particularly significant about Ken Hale's activities in Australian linguistics is not only their depth but also their breadth. In addition to making some very significant contributions to the literature of general linguistic theory, Ken Hale's publications cover a wide range of areas relating to Australian languages. He has published extensively on Australian phonology, morphology, syntax, semantics, lexicon, historical linguistics and sociolinguistics (including the very serious question of language endangerment, which particularly affects all Australian languages). It would be entirely fair to say that no other scholar has offered such a broad range of publications on Australian languages since Ken Hale's arrival on the Australian scene more than forty years ago. For an example of a truly modern Australianist linguist, one could not do better than point to Ken Hale.

Ken Hale probably doesn't remember this himself, but at a linguistics conference in 1974, the first I attended, a number of us junior scholars were struck by some seemingly simplistic generalisations that were offered at one stage by one presenter. I leaned over and commented quietly about this to Ken Hale, who offered words of academic encouragement. Those of us who considered ourselves at the time to be academic nobodies took strength from this and resolved to express ideas which we would probably not otherwise have felt sufficiently bold to put in print. In addition to being something of an academic giant himself, Ken Hale had an admirable ability to foster growth in those who consider themselves to be academically less experienced. Academic stature and personal humility seldom come together so easily within a single individual, and Australian linguistics is so much the richer for Ken Hale's contributions.

Obviously, however, it is not primarily my responsibility as a reviewer to offer words of praise for Ken Hale, as this is a task which the editors and contributors in this *Festschrift* have already admirably achieved with their volume. The range of authors and topics represented in this *Festschrift* is testament to the huge influence that Ken Hale has had on Australian linguistics over the years, through his academic stature and his personal encouragement. It is to the editors' credit that almost every established figure in the field of Australian Aboriginal linguistics is represented, as well as a number of more recent arrivals on the scene.

The editors and contributors of the *Festschrift* have clearly set out to reflect the broad range of interests of Ken Hale. Of course, this makes it difficult to review. Singling out any author for particular praise would be unfair given the very high level of contributions in this volume overall. The volume contains discussions relating to Arrernte, Warlpiri and Lardil, as we might expect, written by those who followed in Ken Hale's footsteps, such as Gavan Breen (pp 45-70), Harold Koch (pp 71-88), Mary Laughren (pp 151-60, 199-226) and Tim Shopen (pp 187-98). There are also contributions relating to other languages that Ken Hale worked on less intensively, and some relating to languages that he had not worked on, but where the work was inspired by his earlier contributions. Significantly, the editors have included a contribution by Ephraim Bani (pp 477-80), who is one of the earliest speakers of an Indigenous Australian language to be trained at the School of Australian Linguistics.

On the technical side, this is an attractive volume, peppered with fascinating photographs from the early years of Ken Hale's work in Australia. It is clearly and consistently laid out. The editors faced a huge task in putting together a collection of

three dozen separate contributions into a single volume. Perhaps inevitably, there are some problems, and the volume comes supplied with a modest collection of addenda and errata. However, few (if any) of these would have been likely to cause serious problems had they not been pointed out.

The editors of this volume can be proud of having produced a volume that is more than just an acknowledgment of the debt that they – and all of us – owe to Ken Hale. The contributions relate to all of the areas in which Ken Hale himself has published over the years, while at the same time providing us with some fascinating social history relating to the development of Australian linguistics over the last forty years.

Terry Crowley  
University of Waikato  
Hamilton, New Zealand

*The Black Lords of summer* by Ashley Mallett, 221pp, University of Queensland Press, 2002, \$30.00

At the outset the idea of Ashley Mallett as a past Australian Test cricketer writing on the 1868 Aboriginal Cricket tour of England holds obvious appeal. There is the potential for a fresh voice and one certainly steeped in the world of cricket. Much has already been written on the tour though and Mallett acknowledges particularly John Mulvaney and Rex Harcourt's efforts in this regard. While fitting, this tribute raises the question of what Mallett hopes to achieve by writing on an event so well covered in the past. He states himself that he 'fell into' writing the book through his contemporary involvements with Indigenous cricketers and that it seeks to give greater depth to the culture clash between the 1868 tourists and their manager Charles Lawrence. He also aims to detail where they came from and the injustices they had suffered. It must be said that he has been only partly successful.

Mallett is strongest when writing on the actual cricket played, both on the tour and in Australia, though the account of all forty-seven tour matches does begin to pall. He raises some important points at times in this regard, noting that Lawrence sought to improve the skills of the Aboriginal players but also to make money out of them. His presentation of an English cricket culture where gambling was rife and influenced the development of the game is both insightful and refreshing. Often though such themes are raised and not fully developed, as in the case where Mallett contrasts the interest in the Aboriginal players in England with the way they were treated at home, but does not go on to explore this contrast. In order to do this successfully, despite his stated intentions, he would have had to develop a greater knowledge than he displays in his work of how life was for these cricketers at home. His reference to Johnny Mullagh saying he would never marry a black woman, and a white one would not have him, provides an avenue for exploring culture clashes in the tourists lives. As Mullagh's father King Watertight indicated – when asked if he had killed any 'whitefellas', replying he had only killed three 'poor buggers' but 'no gentlemen' – appreciation of social distinction was clearly developed in the family before their introduction to cricket. A lack of in-

depth research and a dependence on secondary sources limits the approach here and more generally throughout the book.

Confusion is displayed in relation to language and tribal groups. Madi Madi and Wutjupaluk are presented as tribes in the region of origin for the cricketers, erroneously in the first case and contestably in the second, while Djabwurrung and Jardwajali are listed accurately as languages. The relevance of Djabwurrung is limited though: while most of the tourists were clearly Jardwajali speakers and others possibly Wergaia or Buandik speakers, no link exists between any of them and Djabwurrung country. There is also an insertion of a conversation William Stanner had with an Aboriginal man from 'the western districts' about his Dreaming Place. This 'quote' from Stanner comes via two other sources and did not originally refer to the area at all. A recycled reference to Johnny Redcap's 'wife' Caroline (really his sister) compounds the mistakes of others. New South Wales origins for two of the cricketers, Charlie Dumas and Twopenny, are more definitely presented by Mallett than in earlier works but again without supporting evidence.

Given Mallett's lack of background in Aboriginal studies and reliance on secondary sources and thus dependence on the work of others, a case could still be made for the work as an important means of bringing specialist research to a wider audience. Even at this level, the work is marred by what seems to me to be an awkward prose style, inserting ethnographic and other contextual material into the narrative of the tour apparently in a random manner. The final chapters, dealing with post-tour Aboriginal cricket, by contrast, are free flowing and vigorous in style, perhaps indicating the potential that lay with the project. Certainly a greater editorial input from University of Queensland Press may have enabled more of that potential to be realised.

Edward Ryan  
History, La Trobe University  
Melbourne

*Goodbye Bussamarai: the Mandandanji Land War, Southern Queensland 1842-1852* by Patrick Collins, 305pp, University of Queensland Press, 2002, \$34.00

Travelling west from Dalby to Charleville along the Warrego Highway, it is tempting to conclude that not much happens in this part of Australia. There are a few towns on the route, an occasional farmhouse or homestead, and cattle or sheep grazing in paddocks. For the most part, the history of this landscape has been one of little change and tranquillity. But the present tranquillity disguises a brutal and bloody past.

This is the land of the Mandandanji, and Patrick Collins provides a detailed account of the first decade of interaction and conflict between the Mandandanji and European explorers and pastoralists. In the tradition of Roger Millis's *Waterloo Creek*, Collins draws extensively on a range of primary and secondary sources to chart the complex relations on the frontier.

The first decade on the Maranoa was a war but, like all wars, the script was not simple. It was characterised by complexity, confusion and contradictions. Collins's account reveals that the Mandandanji waged a concerted resistance to the invasion by

European pastoralists. Collins argues that this resistance was led substantially by Bussamarai, who stands in the tradition of other resistance leaders such as Pemulwuy. Collins reveals that Bussamarai's relations with the invaders were complex. He was not always organising attacks on cattle and sheep but at times engaged with Europeans and attempted a form of rapprochement. The most remarkable example of this was a large-scale corroboree (described by Gideon Lang as an 'opera') organised by Bussamarai and performed in front of Maranoa settlers at Surat. The 'opera' involved scenes of conflict between Indigenous peoples and squatters, ending in the squatters being driven away. The intent was to demonstrate that the Mandandanji and neighbouring groups had the capacity to defeat the trespassers on their land.

But ultimately they did not. Despite some early successes in driving pastoralists away, the Mandandanji and other groups on the Maranoa were unable to contend with the superior firepower and mobility of the Native Police and pastoralists. The rifle and horse were a formidable combination. As elsewhere on the frontier, the Native Police played a significant role in intimidating and subduing Indigenous groups.

*Goodbye Bussamarai* raises again the question of the extent of violence on the frontier. These debates tend to focus on how many killings occurred. Collins indicates that the number of Europeans killed on the Maranoa can be accurately assessed, but it is much more difficult to assess the losses of the Mandandanji. Collins suggests at least 150 and 'double that number is not fanciful' as against nine Europeans. Even by the most conservative estimates, the Mandandanji suffered fearful losses.

Despite emphasising the ongoing violence on the frontier, Collins also highlights that not all relationships were characterised by hostility. Some pastoralists attempted to befriend and establish relationships with local groups. Perhaps the most interesting personality was Paddy McEnroe who worked as a stockman on Mount Abundance. When the station was abandoned in 1849 following the deaths of several stockmen and loss of stock, Paddy McEnroe however did not feel threatened. He had obviously established harmonious relationships with the Mandandanji and continued to live in the area for a number of years.

*Goodbye Bussamarai* is an important contribution to the growing corpus of regional studies on frontier relations. It does not attempt to compare events on the Maranoa with other regions, but *Goodbye Bussamarai* does raise numerous questions about frontier relations. These questions include:

- environmental conditions – to what extent did environmental conditions play a part in frontier conflicts – was resistance more effective in areas of dense forests and scrubs compared with open woodlands and grasslands? The Mandandanji, it appears, had few areas where they could genuinely escape except for some brigalow scrubs (p 59).
- disease – to what extent did introduced diseases contribute to Indigenous mortality? Collins refers on several occasions to illness among the Native Police (p 165). Could it not be assumed that 'fever and ague' also affected the Indigenous population as well as other diseases?
- rapprochement – Paddy McEnroe was unusual but by no means an exception on the frontier. How was it that some individuals were able to establish and maintain good relations with Indigenous groups?

*Goodbye Bussmarai* is not flawless. It is not without the occasional error and misinterpretation. Some conclusions are debatable. For example, the link between Paddy McEnroe of Mount Abundance and a Paddy McEnroe who was one of the 1798 Irish rebels transported between 1800 and 1802 is tenuous.

While one may quibble with some of the details and conclusions Collins reaches, what is indisputable is that the pastoral invasion of the Maranoa devastated but did not destroy the Mandandanji.

Tom Blake  
Ashgrove, Queensland

*'Under a bilari tree I born': the story of Alica Bilari Smith* by Alice Bilari Smith, with Anna Vitenbergs and Loreen Brehaut, 233pp, Fremantle Arts Centre Press, Fremantle 2002, \$24.95

This is a pleasantly readable story of the life of an Aboriginal woman born on a Pilbara station and growing up through a time of great change. The main charm of this story is that it is told in Alice's own words. Anyone familiar with Aboriginal English, and especially that used by older Aboriginal people in Western Australia, will find Alice's voice very familiar; in fact, I could often 'hear' her voice in my head. Clearly the story is based on tape-recordings of Alice telling her story which was then written down pretty much verbatim by the co-authors, resulting in it being couched almost entirely in Aboriginal English, the first such work I have seen. The only exception to this use of Aboriginal English (apart from plates of certificates and the correspondence from Alice's Native Welfare Department files) is the eight sidebars which provide further information about people and places mentioned in the text.

Of course, this introduces a problem: carefully transcribed speech introduces many ambiguities due to the lack of features such as stress, pause and intonation. While there are traditions for writing the various standard Englishes that reduce this problem (but which do not entirely eliminate it) they would require modification of Alice's words. The co-authors have, I think, chosen correctly in not making these changes and instead sticking with Alice's own words, although this leads to some passages requiring re-reading to be understood.

The book follows Alice's life, from growing up on Rocklea Station to retirement in Roebourne, where she lives now. In its 233 pages it skips rapidly across years of her life, focusing on those anecdotes that Alice remembers most vividly. The book contains a number of black and white photos of Alice, members of her family and other relatives, and also of places on some of the many stations in the Pilbara on which she worked. It finishes with 13 pages of excerpts from Alice's Native Welfare Department files which illustrate official attitudes of the time towards 'half-caste' children and, in particular, the lack of hope they show for the future of a young girl who marries 'in the tribal way'. It reinforces how wrong they were in this view of Alice's likely future; she was to be a great mother not only to her own children but to many others, as well as a true pillar of strength for her people.

One criticism I have is that words from the various Aboriginal languages of the region are given in a variety of orthographies, sometimes the standard orthography for the language in question, sometimes in what appears to be an ad hoc spelling. The authors should at least have discussed the issue of orthography in the preface. There are several other errors relating to the spelling of language names. The map on pages 12–13 shows ‘Thaianyji’ for the language near Onslow; this should be ‘Thalanyji’ (this error is repeated on p 144). As well, the map shows a language to the north of Port Hedland with the name ‘ngaria’; this should be spelled ‘Ngarla’, however it should probably not be shown on the map. The reason for this is that although there is mention in the book of a ‘tribe’ called ‘ngaria’ (p 24), this refers to another language in Western Australia which is also known to its speakers as Ngarla, and which is spoken to the south-east of Paraburdoo (near the Collier Range National Park). This language, which is also known as Ngarlawangka (a name some of the speakers settled on to avoid confusion with the other Ngarla in the north) is unfortunately not shown on the map.

To sum up, while not telling a story of earth-shattering importance this book gives us a view into the life of Alice Bilari Smith and the events and people that have mattered to her, and it does this in an evocative and powerfully Aboriginal voice.

Doug Marmion  
Department of Linguistics,  
RSPAS, ANU, Canberra

*Indigenous cultures in an interconnected world*, Claire Smith & Graeme K Ward (eds), 230pp, Allen and Unwin, Sydney, 2000, \$35.00.

This book presents a selection of nine papers first given at the ‘Indigenous cultures in an interconnected world’ symposium held in Darwin, July 1997. The book captures some of the spirit of the meeting with its photographs of the participants: Indigenous and non-Indigenous artists, craftspeople, media, performers, anthropologists, historians, archaeologists from around the world. The book is only one of the ways in which the symposium has been made available to a wider audience. It was also broadcast live on radio, was the subject of a documentary film and a CD is to be produced.

The collection of papers provides a student text for comparisons between social anthropology, ethno-archaeology and history on the subject of imperialism and Indigenous peoples.

The book takes as its subject of discussion the way in which globalisation affects Indigenous peoples in mostly neo-liberal states. It looks at, on the one hand, the effects of power relations on Indigenous peoples by neo-liberal states and, on the other hand, strategies adopted by Indigenous peoples to retain their cultures, profit from them and find ways of effectively controlling the future encroachment of other dominant states. The tension between connectedness across difference and how to keep local identities distinctive in a globalised system which is inherently place-less runs throughout the book.

In Chapter 1, Smith, Burke and Ward set out how and why the work was produced. Their purpose is clear in introducing the subject of threats to the autonomy, control over land and knowledge of small populations by larger more dominant ones.

Next in the process of the chaos of imperialism they want to portray a sense of hope where the dominant cultures learn from colonised ones. 'Globalisation constitutes an unprecedented threat to the autonomy of Indigenous cultures as well as an unprecedented opportunity for Indigenous empowerment' (p 21). The title of the book indicates the stress by the authors on the ways in which the aspects of a globalised world economy – particularly increased communication and access to markets – that make it 'interconnected' may be of benefit to Indigenous peoples.

In this review I discuss briefly the origins of globalisation and, setting this book's propositions regarding globalisation in context, criticise the themes of the book and its ways of approaching Indigenous peoples and globalisation.

Globalisation is a sanitised name given to world domination by large capitalist monopolies with national and international connections (branches and corporate arrangements) related to world capitalist expansion and military and cultural dominance.<sup>1</sup> Although this book deals with global processes and imperialism, how the authors understand these terms is not clearly defined.

Roman, Italian, Ottoman, Portuguese, Spanish and British Empires enacted colonial programs by acquiring other lands, other peoples across the globe. Colonialism, up to the fifteenth century, was powered by insatiable wants for exotic goods such as food, spices, furniture, fabrics and jewellery, but ended in pillage of lands, labour and rape of cultures and peoples. This process continued by both destroying Indigenous societies and reshaping mercantilism into segmented imperialism that emerged into what we now know as globalisation. Globalisation, therefore, is a form of imperialism where war, conquest and capital combine to produce an hierarchy of dominant states who monopolise industries and resources, the most desirable areas of the world and, finally, create an educated population through dominance of strategic ideologies, to manage both fixed and mobile capital.<sup>2</sup>

Robert Layton, a British anthropologist, attempts to show in his chapter 'From clan symbol to ethnic emblem: Indigenous creativity' that small groups essentially have self-determining mechanisms to which clans (or ethnic groupings) can resort creatively as protection against imperialism. I would consider that Layton's proposition is rather dubious in the light of historical experience. His use of comparative chimpanzee and hunter-gatherer data introduces an inappropriate metaphor and a misleadingly simplified approach to self-determination of the sort which has a long history for subjugated peoples.

American anthropologists Larry and Karen Zimmerman and Leonard Bruguier in their paper 'Cyber smoke signals: new technologies and Native American ethnicity', show how technological determinism can metaphorically be turned on its head to act in favour of 'Native American ethnicity'. I find this proposition is as doubtful as Layton's claims. Both these contributors are in danger of suggesting that Indigenous peoples are equally as blameworthy as the invaders for their own pauperisation and dispossession.

Julie Gough, a Tasmanian Indigenous artist, discusses how 'history, representation, globalisation and Indigenous culture' have been depicted through musicological

---

<sup>1</sup> See Marx 1982: 286–287; Lenin 1976: 634–731 and Blainey 2000: 34–44 for examples.

<sup>2</sup> Etherington 1984: 176–262.

and other representations. Gough argues for an alternative way of representing Tasmanians to that of the neo-liberal state's dominance, by 'representing historical stories and cultural meanings of objects'. Gough claims to do so by retelling documented events from an alternative perspective. While this is a laudable notion, it could be argued that her work is more of a reactive criticism of non-Indigenous Australian artists which draws on similar patterns of abstraction as the non-Indigenous histories of which she is rightly critical.

The Olympic games are the starting point for Meekinson's critique of the neo-liberal state and Indigenous politics in 'Indigenous presence at the Olympic games'. Meekinson suggests that over the last century Aboriginal imagery has been appropriated consistently as a 'marker of Australian identity' yet Aboriginal people 'remain shadowy figures in the national consciousness'. Like Layton, Meekinson concludes that despite the appropriation of Indigenous culture by the Republican and Olympic movements there remained an underlying strength whereby 'Indigenous voices were able to come to the fore'. Meekinson maintains that the several media do 'educate, inform, express diversity, provide role models, employs and displays a physical presence [of] a right to being somewhere'. But meagre Indigenous voices are bought into Meekinson's case, for example Rhoda Roberts and Cathy Freeman, who are media personalities with well-known, possibly stereotyped, bureaucratic voices.

Morphy uses a phenomenological perspective on art as well as a sociological one. One of the aims of a phenomenological approach is to provide descriptions of the world as it is experienced. Misused, it could be seen to present anthropology and anthropologists with the prospect of getting inside the skins of Indigenous peoples, 'being Aborigines', and also, from the centre of empire, speaking for and owning Indigenous peoples. This, I consider, is at the base of Howard Morphy's chapter on 'Elite arts for cultural elites: adding value to Indigenous arts'. Morphy continues the book's theme of challenges to perceptions of oppression by the neo-liberal state, and presents a model whereby agents of art and cultural preservation can be protectors of Indigenous people's consciousness against exploiters. This is an old model grounded in 19th and 20th century British and Australian anthropology and protectionist policies.

In this chapter Morphy rightly critiques students of Indigenous art for not developing an understanding that Aborigines are involved in the global art market where their work is 'a value creating process' that 'involves both the creation of new kinds of values in objects and the increase of their value in terms of exchange' (p129). While 'the process of value transformation is often summarised as moving from ethnographic object to art object ... and in terms of certain radical critiques is seen to result in the alienation of art' from the artists and their society, Morphy disagrees (p129). He says this view is an oversimplification of the processes involved which denies agency to the Aboriginal people and fails to take account of areas of compatibility between art in Aboriginal society and art in western society (p 130). By this argument, looking at the experience of producing market commodities, or, what makes the artist work and continue to do so for the market, is the best way of understanding the legitimacy of the commodity and the producer, and the agency of Indigenous environments. Morphy is, I think, timid about announcing to the reader that anthropologists are unwillingly drawn into both the local and international markets either as part of an intelligentsia, promoter of the process or as honest broker.

The most shocking thing about the kind of approach that Morphy is advocating is that anthropologists are claiming for themselves the kind of disciplinary process so vehemently attacked by Edward Said in his *Orientalist* critique.<sup>3</sup> Said shows how British and other European scholars turned themselves into 'Egyptian Arabs' as a means of finding out how they carried on their lives, that is, how they produced an Egyptian and Muslim consciousness. Colonialism produced these kinds of actions at the intersection of the Orient and the Occident. Here in Australia, and I suspect in other countries, anthropologists can be seen to be profiteering from the knowledge gained. This process results in anthropologists who set themselves up as knowing more about Aborigines than Aborigines know about themselves. Anthropologists act as agents without visible costs to themselves. Their rewards come from representing what they call Aboriginal Australia.

Morphy, as a defender of Indigenous art, claims that phenomenology enables him to make statements about Australian Indigenous peoples. He says, '[c]entral to the functioning of Aboriginal art are two factors: 1 art is an important component of a system of restricted religious knowledge; 2 art is integral to the political life of Aboriginal societies, and is typically the property of corporate clan groups' (p 132). These two claims, based on his writings and those of Ian Keen, are 'Clayton's claims', that is, they are claims you make when you have no claim to make. First, these claims do not apply to more than 1% of the country. Second, Aboriginal politics, whether in bush camps in urban society where the majority of Aborigines live, has nothing to do with 'art', painted, spoken or performed. Third, art in the 21st century is related to material or economic life controlled by markets, exchanged for money to buy goods and services, be they works performed for traditional ceremonies, CDEP government programs and ATSIC elections. Fourth, many of the artists do their work not for collectives, family or otherwise, but for personal gain, and this is a general case across Australia.

According to Morphy's interpretation of the effects of imperialism on Aborigines, 'Art is not an arena into which Aboriginal people have been unwillingly dragged; rather [and this is where Morphy speaks on behalf of all Aborigines] it is an arena that Aboriginal people who have been unwillingly colonised have turned to as a means of asserting their rights and autonomy in the transformed postcolonial context' (p142). To me, this is a weak and inaccurate assessment of the longer political struggle and could be seen as special pleading to make his own position more plausible.

Consider the history of artefact collection: antiquarians were involved in collecting and pillaging Indigenous material culture from first contact. Baldwin Spencer and Paddy Cahill of Oenpelli were the first white men to engage in the collection of 'bark paintings' in the Northern Territory. At the time, these products were something only Aborigines used and then left to decay. Their transformation to art was part of a process of incorporation into European interests and ideology. These works were bought for cash from Aborigines and sent south in numbers.<sup>4</sup> From as early as about 1911, Cahill collaborated with Spencer. The Aborigines who sold their works discussed them with nobody except perhaps Cahill, who had little knowledge about the goods he collected

---

<sup>3</sup> Said 1978.

<sup>4</sup> Griffiths 1996.

from ceremonial sites. Moreover, Cahill could not have had discussions with anyone other than Spencer. It was certainly the case in Darwin, as the white population in that town loathed Aborigines and all they stood for.<sup>5</sup>

Another way of understanding the processes of colonial incorporation is to see it as Aborigines in effect being dragged into painting in the early part of the 20th century, later continued by government policies designed and implemented by anthropologists, missionaries and protectors. After 1967, Nugget Coombs, William Stanner and Barrie Dexter (who created the Council for Aboriginal Affairs 1968–1972) created a bureaucracy to sell whatever Aborigines could produce, saving white society from paying for Aboriginal reparation and their welfare.<sup>6</sup>

Meanwhile Christian missionaries promoted the sale of artefacts in a number of different ways and places. First, trade in Aboriginal artefacts, tree carvings and weapons in southern and western areas of New South Wales was encouraged as an industry for purchase by European pastoralists and travellers in the 1830s–1840s. Thereafter this activity continued on reserves. Second, Lutheran Missionaries promoted Dieri craft as works of art for profit in South Australia. Third, the Queensland government as early as the 1920s brought tourists by the boatload to Palm Island to buy or collect Aboriginal artefacts by the tonne. Fourth, the New South Wales governments from 1907 encouraged the sale of artefacts, a practice continued today at the La Perouse Aboriginal settlement on Botany Bay.<sup>7</sup> Fifth, the 1880s saw artefacts from the Riverina and South Coast Aborigines engaged in prolific trade in weapons, for trade and material gain.

Morphy does not draw on this broader, more complex history. Like Layton, he makes assumptions about Indigenous cultural strength as an imperialist façade to protect the interests of anthropologists while the discipline continues its plunder of Indigenous peoples' intellectual property. I am arguing that Morphy's interpretations of the relation of Indigenous people to the art market is too partial, ignoring its underlying relationship to the expansion of European ideology, with anthropologists acting as key agents of imperialism, and remaining so.<sup>8</sup> Nor are we given any idea about the contradictions of wealth and poverty within communities where popular painters originate, nor how and where the profits from these production activities end up.

Outside Australia, Penny Dransart, in her chapter 'Cultural tourism in an interconnected world: tensions and aspirations in Latin America', takes the tensions in Latin America as her example of Indigenous people coping with globalisation. There are tensions in the market place, where buyers come face to face with sellers. In her example Dransart shows how Andean women produce non-traditional textiles for a global market with traditional techniques. Like other writers in this book, Dransart uses examples of craft production to provide evidence for a form of liberation from capitalist alienation. Exploitation, not being immediately evident, is assumed not to operate.

<sup>5</sup> See letter by Cahill in Mulvaney's 'Paddy Cahill of Oenpelli', in Press, 2002: 28.

<sup>6</sup> The first government body to promote art interests was the Aboriginal Arts Board that came directly from the Council for the Arts, a body created by HC Coombs for the Federal Government.

<sup>7</sup> Hinkson and Harris 2001: 106–123.

<sup>8</sup> See eg Caulfield 1972: 182–212.

The final paper, by Loring and Ashanti, 'Past and future pathways: Innu cultural heritage in the twentieth century' provides a valuable comparative study with circumstances in Indigenous Australia. The Innu confront multinational mining developments, hydro-electric schemes and military threats to their land, plus governmental policy interventions which contributed to social disruption and despair. The paper documents the use of national publicity to increase awareness of these impacts, and focuses on the strengthening of identity which may grow from a community archaeology exploration of 'trails' – presumably ways of walking from one area of living to another – that 'lead back to the past and are anchored in the present' (p 168). They compare differing perspectives on the past that obtain in the region (northeastern-most Canada) derived from the different sources of ethnohistory, archaeology and Indigenous stories and philosophy.

However, the idea that by gaining some kind of ethical agreement from archaeologists or from art dealers for working with Indigenous people is the same as somehow empowering them is, I argue, a theoretical illusion, and a weak solution. Far more powerful authorities in mining, government and military often lack ethical and operating criteria understandable by those whose territories they invade. Australian experience shows that those who make war and peace, control economic activities, collect Aboriginal intellectual property and act as agents of Aborigines, have never really worked in the true interests of Aborigines. For this reason, return of lands, provision of economies, return of material plunder and negation of Aboriginal viewpoints have worked against and not for Indigenous peoples. Land rights and native title legislation serve as the classic anthropological 'Catch 22' whereby their ideologies serve as 'Indigenous straw persons', and it is they who have defined who is an Indigenous person and it is given to social scientists, government, lawyers and the courts to decide what Indigenous people's entitlements ought to be.

Smith and Ward chose a very difficult topic on which to base a discussion of world developments and Indigenous peoples. The text works well in its own terms, but I consider that there is a lack of consideration of the historiography of imperialism and its modern form of global forces impacting on Indigenous peoples. Tricky new assumptions, mostly put forward by anthropologists and ethno-archaeologists, have failed to come to grips with imperialism.

In stressing 'interconnectedness' over dislocation – one of the main features of globalisation – the book's arguments develop a rhetoric of empowerment within the structure of globalisation. This glosses over the realities of continuing poverty, conflict and inequity for Indigenous people, especially in the fields of human rights, jobs not welfare, education and health. These are the areas which need to be kept in focus as the areas in which empowerment is real, not an illusory mystification.

Gordon Briscoe,  
Centre for Indigenous History,  
RSSS, ANU

## References

Blainey, G 2000, 'Globalisation: unpacking the suitcase', in *The best Australian essays: 2000*.

- Caulfield, Mina Davis 1972, *Culture and imperialism: proposing a new dialectic*, in Dell Hymes (ed), *Reinventing anthropology*, Vintage, New York.
- Etherington, N 1984, *Theories of imperialism: war, conquest and capital*, Croome Helm, London.
- Griffiths, T 1996, *Hunters and collectors, the antiquarian imagination in Australia*, Cambridge University Press, Melbourne, 1996.
- Hinkson, Melinda and Alana Harris 2001, *Aboriginal Sydney: a guide to important places of the past and present*, Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra.
- Lenin, V 1976, 'Imperialism: the highest stage of capitalism', in Lenin, *Selected works*, Vol I, Progress Publication, Moscow.
- Marx, K 1882, 'The Civil War in France', in Marx and Engels, *Selected works*, Progress Publishers, Russia
- Said, Edward 1978, *Orientalism: western conceptions of the Orient*, Penguin Books, London.