Introduction

VICKI LUKER

This book explores the interaction between PNG’s HIV and ‘law and order’ problems. We hope readers will take from it a richer appreciation of the potentially vicious spirals and virtuous circles that this interaction can create. Ultimately, we advance the cause of ‘deep prevention’ for these interlinked challenges, and the concept and goal of ‘civic security’ to embrace them both.

Joan’s story, reprinted here from Papua New Guinea’s largest daily newspaper, begins this collection. She represents one face of PNG’s now endemic HIV that is so often described as undergoing ‘feminisation’. She died with AIDS and she died in violence and abuse. She thus conjoins aspects of HIV and ‘law and order’ that this collection treats together. Joan had been a member of her community, a citizen of PNG and metaphorically a citizen of the world. But, if the term ‘citizenship’ can be used in both its strict and looser senses, Joan’s belonging to these collectivities gave her no security of person. She lacked what we call here civic security. Of course, there are many stories like Joan’s, reported and unreported, that could illustrate these features. But among the people touched by Joan’s story was contributor Lawrence Hammar, who played a part in her ‘rescue’ and subsequent return to her village for burial. He has written about her elsewhere, in details never broadcast by media accounts (Hammar 2008, 71–76). One of the editors was also Lawrence’s houseguest at the time. So it was Joan’s story, more so than any of the others, that happened to be the seed for this book.1

We have tried to make this collection accessible to any curious reader. International discourse on AIDS, despite its conventions, comprises many dialects, and our authors speak from their different areas of expertise—in law, community work, medicine, consultancy, anthropology, development practice, international relations and so on—but we have edited to minimise dialectal differences. We also hope the book can communicate to those unfamiliar with PNG and the Pacific, but note that it was written within the context of Papua New Guinea’s relationship with Australia and speaks to certain parochial

1 Several stories that, like Joan’s, conjoin HIV and civic insecurity are referred to in chapter one and figure in chapters throughout the book, including Luker this volume, conclusion.
concerns. For a long time, PNG’s largest source of aid has been its former colonial administrator, Australia, and PNG’s HIV and ‘law and order’ predicaments have loomed large in Australia’s perceptions of and policies towards PNG. This collection contributes to reflection on these interests.

The literature on conflict, violence, crime and regulation in PNG encompasses ethnographies of traditional rural and to a lesser extent urban societies; historical and legal studies of colonial law; and research undertaken to inform policy for the young nation of PNG in the areas of law and justice, development and economics. As discussed in chapter one, concerns about PNG’s law and order problems date from the years before PNG attained independence in 1975 and have intensified since then. A popular ‘law and order’ discourse is loaded with fears and linked to a large body of academic and policy-related literature.

The popular discourse on HIV is similarly loaded, but the academic and policy-related literature is less developed. A decade ago, despite longstanding interests of anthropologists in marital and sexual practices, the social roles of men and women, indigenous therapeutics and culturally specific theories of disease, relatively little research had addressed sexuality, gender or indigenous perceptions with respect to HIV—though many people had been deeply apprehensive about the possibility of a severe HIV epidemic in PNG even before the nation’s first case of AIDS was notified in 1987. Several authors in this volume contributed significantly to the earliest research and commentary on HIV in PNG, most notably the late Carol Jenkins and (the still kicking) Lawrence Hammar. Over the last decade, although the literature has broadened and deepened, the need for a research base to underpin HIV policy in PNG continues to be acute.

Internationally, the last ten years could also be dubbed the decade of security and the decade of AIDS, since both have been major global preoccupations. Frequently alarms about each have been conflated, and researchers have cast and recast HIV as a security issue (see Luker and Dinnen this volume; O’Keefe this volume). While this collection resonates with these wider concerns, its origins are more specific. In PNG, the discourses on HIV and ‘law and order’ have been highly pronounced yet, though often superficially enmeshed, they remain somehow intellectually separate. In ordeals such as Joan’s, however,

---

2 For useful discussions, see Dinnen 2001, 11–39; Dinnen 2009; Goddard 2009.
realities to which these discourses refer converge, and this convergence seemed to call for some more dedicated attempt to explore the themes of HIV and ‘law and order’ within the same big frame.

Readers should be aware that this book deals with sex and violence. The sexual transmission of HIV, in circumstances frequently involving or shaped by violence, and the violent response that HIV and AIDS can provoke, are central to it. Parts of the book are distressing. Chapters by Carol Jenkins, Joachim Pantumari and Peter Bamne, and Nicole Haley quote extensively from informants whose testimony can be disturbing. Overarching the whole volume are also issues about the risks of depicting sex and violence in a manner that can have the unintended effect of confirming negative stereotypes. Moreover, while it is common to hear workers within the internationally-funded AIDS response lament the reluctance of people in many host societies to talk about sex (and authors and informants within this collection attest to specific difficulties), it is less often admitted that the values, politics and decorum of the international response also make some aspects of sex and sexuality difficult to articulate or acknowledge. Finally, most people everywhere have some sense of what is in the range of social acceptability for talk on certain topics in any given setting. Some of the sexual subject matter here has been translated from a circumscribed context of communication into the public domain of this book, and will jar with the sense of many readers of what is publicly appropriate to say. Similar problems beset the discussion of violence. As Kathy Lepani has suggested, in some contexts, discussing violence is ‘voicing the unspeakable’ (Lepani 2005).

The book ahead falls into six parts that move from scene-setting; to masculinity; to sex work; to specific law and justice institutions; to meditations on governance, rights and security; and end with our conclusion and epilogue.

Part one, chapter one, establishes a context for the volume as a whole. Titled ‘Entwined endemics’ (we often use the term ‘endemic’ in preference to ‘epidemic’, as we explain), it surveys HIV in PNG and the country’s ‘law and order’ problems, broadly discussing the roles of the state, community, and their interface in the governance of security. It then sketches the interaction between HIV and ‘law and order’, and the potential of a public health approach to improve the governance of security while ‘law and order’ measures may help prevent and manage HIV. Although, in theory, the state has a primary responsibility to ensure the security and welfare of its citizens, in PNG this responsibility is perhaps better recast as a question: how can the state best promote or facilitate civic security, especially in circumstances where its power is weak and the state is only one of many actors? We see one possible means in models of community governance, in effect a new civics, which later chapters and the conclusion will further explore.
Part two addresses masculinity. In AIDS research and policy circles, it is axiomatic that ‘gender inequality’ in countries such as PNG drives the predominantly heterosexual transmission of HIV and unevenly distributes the burdens of AIDS. Within these circles, ‘gender inequality’ is also widely understood as both expressed and effected, in large part, by ‘gender violence’, which in turn helps spread the virus. Such statements routinely highlight women and girls as those who suffer disadvantage and harm. Only recently have boys and men received more searching attention. Chapters two and three contribute to this re-visioning of men in the context of PNG’s HIV and ‘law and order’ endemics.

The need to involve men in changing masculine norms is Richard Eves’ central message in chapter two. He traces the links between masculinity, gender-based violence and the spread of HIV and, drawing on international literature and PNG-based studies of gender and violence (including his own body of academic and applied anthropological research), reviews recent efforts to rescript masculinity. In PNG these include initiatives that use Australian rugby-league icons to promote HIV awareness and demote, so to speak, violence against women. Eves advocates better programs for ‘other ways of being men’—programs that enlist boys and men positively as partners in problem-solving. Eves stresses that gender is a key analytic for responding to HIV, but efforts stall if our thinking stops at ‘women’s vulnerability’ or ‘the empowerment of women’, as if men are beyond reach and incapable of participation and change.

The *raskol*, or lawless young man in groups with other *raskols*, is probably the symbol of PNG’s ‘law and order’ problem. *Raskols* also figure, less directly, in anxieties about the transmission of HIV, in part due to their association with pack-rape or *lainap*, in part because they belong to ‘youth’, a target population for HIV prevention. In chapter three, Vicki Luker and Michael Monsell-Davis review social changes relating to young men and tease out the tangle of associations that link *raskols*, crime, violence, youth and HIV. Without denying the importance of responding to *raskolism* and the plight of both male and female youth, they ask whether this tangle of associations can distract attention from other factors that need attention in relation to crime and HIV, including the role of transactional sex (in its broadest sense) and patterns of concurrency; ‘white collar’ crime and corruption; and older men.

Part three’s interlocking themes are the legal status of prostitution in PNG, the policing of sex work, and the character of transactional sex within the diffuse dynamics of sexual networking. Internationally, ‘sex work’ is a fundamental domain of HIV prevention where improvements to policing practices and the legal status of this work may limit the spread of HIV and enhance the welfare of all parties (primarily sex workers, clients and police). Yet such agenda are complicated in PNG.
Lawrence Hammar’s chapter four highlights certain basic complications. One is the dynamism of sexual networking, another is the pervasive and polymorphous transactional character of sexual relations. As editors we note that, in countries such as Thailand and Cambodia where HIV interventions in the sex industry have reported success, sex work is, by way of contrast, differentiated and formalised to a higher degree than in PNG. Hammar favours decriminalising prostitution, but argues against proposals for state regulation on grounds that in PNG capacity is lacking for any such initiatives to deliver public health benefits, while the ‘regulated’ women would only be subjected to further abuse. Data on sexual health and behaviour for this chapter were gathered at Lae, Daru, Port Moresby and the Southern Highlands Province by Hammar and colleagues at the PNG Institute of Medical Research from 2003-2006.

In chapter five, Karen Fletcher and Bomal Gonapa, both lawyers, discuss decriminalising prostitution. As demonstrated in the Three-Mile Guesthouse Raid in Port Moresby in 2004, when police rounded up 40 women and accused them of prostitution and spreading HIV, the persecution and criminalisation of ‘prostitutes’ create conditions that thwart HIV prevention efforts. The PNG National AIDS Council engaged Fletcher and Gonapa to research decriminalisation and here they address the provisions in the Summary Offences Act (1977); the 2002 amendments to the Criminal Code concerning the sexual exploitation of children and prostitution; and possible legal amendments to ensure that condoms are not taken as evidence of prostitution. While Fletcher and Gonapa strongly argue that decriminalisation would make certain preventive measures easier, they also indicate the legal intricacies, wider difficulties and inherent limitations of success. On the question of regulation the authors could come to no agreed position, while proposals to decriminalise prostitution remain contentious in PNG. NAC has announced that draft changes to legislation governing both sex work and homosexuality are ready for discussion in 2010.

The final chapter in this part, by Carol Jenkins, describes the component of PNG’s pioneering Transex Project from 1994 to 1998 that specifically aimed to prevent HIV transmission by changing the way police treat sex workers. This was internationally innovative work, subsequently adopted by UNAIDS for its best practice collection (Jenkins 2000). Police and sections of the private security industry cooperated with the project because AIDS was already understood as an occupational health issue. Jenkins reports some success from interventions, measured in subsequently higher rates of condom usage, lower rates of lainap (pack rape) and some signs that the sex-workers involved were now prepared to take action against police mistreatment. But this chapter must be read alongside others in this collection, including the next chapter which suggests that these reported gains were temporary and, incidentally, that the promotion of ‘safe sex’ may inadvertently condone sexual violence (so long as condoms are used).
Part four looks more closely inside the police force, prisons and army, and considers their capacity to change from within in response to HIV.

Abby Macleod and Martha Macintyre in chapter seven, discuss the potential of the Royal Papua New Guinea Constabulary (RPNGC) to affect the spread and management of HIV both positively and negatively. They use a wider lens than Jenkins, and draw upon their work as RPNGC gender advisors to reflect on broader factors influencing police attitudes and behaviour. These include police working conditions, public expectations, and the values that police share with the general populace. The authors note that on some questions of violence and gender, these values are far from those enshrined in PNG’s constitution or promoted by global rights discourse. While police generally know the laws they are required to enforce, are acquainted with principles of human rights, and have basic understanding of AIDS, translating awareness into change is a challenging and long-term undertaking that must also recognise practicalities and how analytic frames from outside often poorly ‘fit’.

Prisons everywhere can be sites for the effective transmission of disease. In chapter eight, Sinclair Dinnen reviews PNG’s prison system while Greg Law outlines the main modes for potentially spreading HIV within PNG’s prison populations: tattooing, skin cutting (often involving circumcision or other forms of penile modification), and unprotected sexual intercourse. Greg Law speaks from his role as a visiting medical officer to Beon Prison outside Madang and from long health experience in PNG, including work for the National HIV/AIDS Support Program. As editors we note that the challenge of tackling HIV in PNG’s prisons must be seen beside the range of other challenges and the generally dire state of health conditions for prisoners in the sector overall. An ambitious program of prison rebuilding and reform is currently under way. On the bright side, the highly efficient mode of HIV transmission mostly responsible for the spread of HIV among prisoners in many parts of the world—that is, injecting drug use with contaminated equipment—has not so far been a factor in PNG’s prisons or the country at large.

Armies too have received special attention in international literature about AIDS and security. Soldiers can be prone to HIV infection, the circumstances of their work can sometimes favour their role in widely disseminating HIV, and the effects of HIV and AIDS can severely erode defence capacity. The authors of chapter nine, Joachim Pantumari and Peter Bamne, are medical doctors with jointly wide experience in health, military practice, and PNG’s response to HIV. They discuss risk factors for HIV transmission within the PNG Defence Force and how informants perceive them. Working and living conditions for service personnel foster practices and ideals of masculinity that could interact harmfully with HIV, but Pantumari’s and Bamne’s informants, like police in previous chapters, express values widely held in PNG. Nevertheless, the authors
note that some men are clearly ambivalent about certain masculine norms, while the army has in many ways responded admirably to HIV. As editors, we appreciate the testimony in this chapter from army wives, who speak of concerns, responsibilities and difficulties that many women must share.

Should organisations like police, prisons and armies adapt their core business to HIV prevention and mitigation? Can they? Consultant Ian Patrick broaches these questions in chapter ten on mainstreaming. This approach is endorsed by PNG’s National AIDS Council, advanced by AusAID and advocated by UNAIDS. Against best practice principles, Patrick assesses HIV measures taken within two larger AusAID-funded projects with police and prisons. These measures were not designed as mainstreaming projects, yet Patrick demonstrates what, ideally, mainstreaming would involve and also the enduring challenges to this approach. One is the basic capacity of the institution concerned. Another is the competition of multiple needs for prioritisation by management. Moreover, an agency’s leadership must move beyond basic AIDS awareness to an analytical appreciation of the role their agency plays or could play in the larger field of HIV. Patrick notes a tendency for attention to HIV to wax or wane in tandem with donor assistance.

Part five further explores broader themes in governance, rights and security. Nicole Haley’s chapter eleven is set in the Southern Highlands Province around Lake Kopiago, where AIDS is experienced in and through the breakdown of state and community governance. The torture and killing of alleged witches or sorcerers is both a symptom and a factor of this breakdown—and an issue of mounting concern in PNG. In response to an apparent upswing in sorcery accusations, the nation’s sorcery laws are currently under review. As Haley explains, mortality caused by AIDS, because death strikes adults in the prime of life, lends itself to explanations in terms of witchcraft beliefs. Paradoxically, while resource exploitation in the Southern Highlands Province is a major source of national income for PNG, the province itself scores among PNG’s lowest by standard indices of development. This chapter demonstrates the potentially vicious spiral of PNG’s entwined HIV and ‘law and order’ endemics, compounded by maldevelopment and malgovernance.

The next chapter offers a counterpoint to Haley’s: it instances potentially ‘virtuous circles’. John Cartwright, Madeleine Jenneker and Clifford Shearing give more detail on the Zwelethemba model of community governance introduced in chapter one, while Isaac Wai and Paul Maia describe the evolution of a loosely similar project for peace-building and community improvement in the Port Moresby settlement of Saraga. It is one of many examples of local ingenuity and resourcefulness in PNG that receive too little recognition. While both the Zwelethemba and Saraga initiatives primarily respond to community needs for better security and development, the peace dividend in each case
promises health benefits: social environments that reduce the risks of disease, and enhanced capacity to respond to specific health and other needs. Sinclair Dinnen’s opening remarks relate both case-studies to themes in this book and directions in development policy.

Christine Stewart, who drafted PNG’s HIV/AIDS Management and Protection (HAMP) Act, addresses the role of law reform in the response to HIV. Although Fletcher and Gonapa tackled this in relation to PNG’s prostitution laws, Stewart’s terms of reference also include the legal status of homosexuality, abortion, rape of men, marital rape, sexual offences against children, the trafficking of children, and specific provisions of the HAMP Act. Stewart also notes how the ‘enabling’ and ‘rights-based’ approaches that inform the HAMP Act remain incompatible with much popular opinion that still favours repressive measures. Notwithstanding this and other factors that limit the influence of law, Stewart stresses the role it can play in shaping society and social action. Like Fletcher and Gonapa, she endorses the important if constrained contribution that law reform can make to the prevention and management of HIV.

Elizabeth Reid, in chapter fourteen, also argues for an HIV response that fosters human rights. She advocates however, an activism of praise, a focus on community, and an orientation towards the future. This approach contrasts to the more usual, but often counterproductive, global rights activism that tends to be state-focused, retrospective, and legalistic, while employing tactics of shame and condemnation. Through the methodology of community conversations, which she uses in PNG, speakers and listeners come to appreciate the challenges posed by HIV, know their collective resources, and acquire skills for change. Participants also become aware of structural violence: the larger and longer-term dynamics that shape gender relations and behaviour capable of transmitting HIV and worsening the impacts of AIDS. Such knowledge, Reid believes, can release the human capacity for goodness and banish from the minds of some people, especially outsiders, essentially ignorant tendencies to dismiss ‘Others’ as simply ‘violent’.

The final chapter, by Michael O’Keefe, rehearses HIV in PNG through various security scenarios. He demonstrates the difference between traditional concepts of security centred on the state, its military power and its capacity to maintain borders and sovereignty, with more recent definitions that emphasise human security: people’s welfare and survival. O’Keefe shows how, over the last few years, crude international anxieties about the threat of HIV to security in traditional senses of the word have been revised and complicated in the light of unfolding events; and though he warns against tendencies to ‘Africanise’ the Pacific and specifically PNG’s experience with HIV, literature and data concerning the securitisation of AIDS in Africa provides an inevitable context.
O’Keefe argues that HIV in PNG primarily poses a threat to human security. While this does have implications for state governance, the greater potential damage is to the social fabric on which the state rests.

Our conclusion returns to Joan’s story and the concept of civic security. The epilogue, ‘Ela’s question’, illustrates the need, stressed in Reid’s earlier chapter, to appreciate the larger processes and patterns of constraint that shape people’s lives, perceptions of possibility, and choices. It also underscores the need for a ‘whole of governance approach’ to the challenges addressed in this volume.

References


Jenkins, Carol. 2000b. Female Sex Worker HIV Prevention Projects: Lessons Learnt from Papua New Guinea, India and Bangladesh. UNAIDS Best Practice Collection. Geneva UNAIDS.


